

HALIFAX REGIONAL MUNICIPALITY

HERITAGE ADVISORY COMMITTEE

January 25, 2006

MINUTES

PRESENT:

Mr. Tom Creighton, Chair
Ms. Andrea Arbic, Vice Chair
Councillor Dawn Sloane
Mr. Clarence Butler
Mr. Paul MacKinnon
Mr. Mark Pothier
Councillor Bob Harvey
Ms. Dianne Marshall
Mr. Paul Shakotko
Mr. Elias Metlej
Ms. Katherine Ashley

REGRETS:

Mr. Bill Mont

STAFF:

Ms. Maggie Holm, Heritage Planner
Mr. Bill Plaskett, Heritage Conservation Planner
Ms. Stephanie Parsons, Legislative Assistant

Table of Contents

1.	CALL TO ORDER	3
2.	APPROVAL OF MINUTES - December 7, 2005	3
3.	APPROVAL OF THE ORDER OF BUSINESS, ADDITIONS AND DELETIONS	3
4.	BUSINESS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES	3
4.1	Status Sheet Items	3
4.1.1	Application for the De-Registration of 78 Shore Road	3
4.1.2	Alterations to HRM's Heritage Incentive Program	4
4.1.3	Fielding Building - Bloomfield	5
5.	DEFERRED BUSINESS	5
6.	CORRESPONDENCE, PETITIONS & DELEGATIONS - None	5
7.	REPORTS	5
7.1	H00174 - Application for Registration of 29 First Avenue, Bedford.	5
7.2	H00175 - Application for Registration of 2138 Brunswick Street, Halifax	7
7.3	H00176 - Application for Demolition of the garage at St. Mary's Basilica Glebe House, Halifax	7
7.4	Heritage Days	9
7.5	Heritage Advisory Subcommittee	9
8.	ELECTION OF CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR	9
9.	DATE OF NEXT MEETING	10
10.	ADJOURNMENT	10

1. CALL TO ORDER

The Chair called the meeting to order at 3:04.

The Chair introduced Mr. Paul Shakotko, a new member on the Committee. Mr. Shakotko introduced himself to the Committee and provided a brief background.

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES - December 7, 2005

MOVED by Councillor Sloane, seconded by Mr. Mark Pothier, that the minutes of December 7, 2005, be approved, as circulated. MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

3. APPROVAL OF THE ORDER OF BUSINESS, ADDITIONS AND DELETIONS

Additions:

- 7.4 Heritage Days
- 7.5 Heritage Advisory Subcommittee

The agenda was accepted as amended.

4. BUSINESS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES

4.1 Status Sheet Items

4.1.1 Application for the De-Registration of 78 Shore Road

- C A supplementary staff report dated January 25, 2006, was before the Committee for its consideration.

Ms. Holm provided a brief overview of the past discussions regarding the application. In response to Mr. MacKinnon, she advised that she did not know what the zoning was and that she would get back to him with a response.

Mr. Elias Metlej entered the meeting at 3:17 p.m.

MOVED BY Mr. MacKinnon, seconded by Councillor Sloane that the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend that Regional Council:

- 1. Set a public hearing to consideration the de-registration of 78 Shore Road Dartmouth.**

- 2. Approve the de-registration of 78 Shore Road, Dartmouth as shown on Map 1 of the supplementary staff report dated December 22, 2005. MOTION PUT AND PASSED.**

4.1.2 Alterations to HRM's Heritage Incentive Program

- C** A memorandum regarding the Heritage Incentives Program Eligibility Clauses dated January 20, 2006 was before the Committee for information.

Mr. Bill Plaskett advised that the report is not ready because it requires approval by the Finance Department. There was concern regarding the amount of funds that have been committed against what was approved in the budget, therefore, the grant applications have not been brought forward for approval at this time. Staff will prepare the reports with recommendation for new program eligibility criteria, new conditions of approval and new accounting procedures to ensure that program spending remains within budget.

Mr. Mark Pothier left the meeting at 3:25 p.m.

Councillor Sloane suggested the following:

- C** That staff review the possibility of issuing the grants by installments.
C That if the buildings are deemed to be HRM Buildings they do not necessarily have to go through the eligibility criteria again.
C That staff provide consideration for a multi-year funding strategy. A multi-year strategy is often used by applicants to obtain leverage from other organizations.
C That staff speak to the Grants Coordinator for suggestions and ideas.

Ms. Holm advised that staff is considering one application per year. In response to Mr. Metlej, Ms. Holm advised that allowing one application a year allows more people to apply. Staff will need to review who is submitting applications and how many, as well as who is not making an application. Mr. Metlej commented that if the incentive is not significant enough, people will apply to deregister. The idea of one application seems reasonable and will increase administrative efficiency.

Mr. Plaskett suggested that applicants provide a conservation plan and embed that in the application criteria before any work is completed.

Mr. Plaskett advised that although the 3rd quarter grant applications have been withheld pending program review, there are projects which have been completed for which receipts have been submitted, therefore staff is recommending approval of those projects for a total cost of \$8,937.00.

MOVED BY Mr. Metlej, seconded by Mr. Butler that the following applications be approved:

1. **Application #145 a matching grant of \$5,000**
2. **Application #153 a matching grant of \$1,815**
3. **Application #148 matching grant of \$2,122**

MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

4.1.3 Fielding Building - Bloomfield

- C A document entitled Bloomfield School dated January 25, 2006 was circulated to the Committee for information.

Mr. Plaskett provided a brief overview of the history of the building. He advised that Real Property and Asset Management is in the process of deciding what to do with the property. Currently none of the buildings are registered as Heritage Properties. Heritage staff is conducting research and consulting some members of the local community. The intent is to articulate the value of the site to the community.

5. DEFERRED BUSINESS

6. CORRESPONDENCE, PETITIONS & DELEGATIONS - None

7. REPORTS

7.1 H00174 - Application for Registration of 29 First Avenue, Bedford

- C A staff report dated December 20, 2005, was before the Committee for its consideration.

Ms. Maggie Holm advised the new members of the process for scoring Heritage Applications.

Ms. Alfreda Withrow, Research Consultant, presented the report to the Committee and the following was noted:

- C The original address is listed as First Street.
- C The house is of a vernacular style.
- C There are two stained glass rectangular windows.
- C From the back window you can see where the Sackville River runs into the Bedford Basin.
- C The detached garage has a gabled roof.

The Committee scored the property as follows:

Scoring Summary

Criterion	Highest Possible Score	Score Awarded
1. Age	25	9 (1901 or 1902)
2. A) Relationship to Important Occasions, Institutions, Personages or Groups OR 2. B) Important/Unique Architectural Style or Highly Representative of an Era	20	17 Option B Highly important/unique representative of an era
3. Significance of Architect/Builder	10	0 Not significant, no information available on the builder
4. A) Architectural Merit: Construction type/building technology	10	5 Moderately rare/early example
4. B) Architectural Merit: Style	10	7 Very rare/early example
5. Architectural Integrity	15	10 Modest Changes
6. Relationship to Surrounding Area	10	7 The building is an important architectural asset contributing to the heritage character of the surrounding area.
Total	100	55

MOVED by Councillor Harvey, seconded by Councillor Sloane, that the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend that Halifax Regional Council

- 1. Set a public hearing date to consider the registration of 29 First Avenue, Bedford.**

2. **Approve the registration of 29 First Avenue, Bedford, under the HRM Heritage Property Program, as proposed in the staff report dated December 20, 2005.**

MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

Ms. Katherine Ashley entered the meeting at 4:00.

The Chair requested that the Committee deal with item 7.3 as the applicants are present, the Committee agreed.

7.3 H00176 - Application for Demolition of the garage at St. Mary's Basilica Glebe House, Halifax

C A staff report dated January 12, 2006, was before the Committee for consideration.

Mr. Plaskett advised that the applicants have invested five million dollars into the property over the past few years. The insurance company advised the applicant to tear down the garage because it was structurally unsound. They hired a demolition company to do the work. The contractor began demolishing the building without applying for a permit. A member of the public alerted staff and a stop work order was issued. Staff has determined that it is a-level two alteration because the debris needs to be cleaned up and it returns the building to its original form.

In response to questions from the Committee the applicant advised that there are no plans for the building, the area where the garage is will be used for parking. The applicant further advised that the insurance company was going to cancel their insurance and that they acted on the advice of the insurance company and the structural engineering firm.

MOVED by Ms. Arabic, seconded by Mr. Metlej, that the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend approval of application H00176, as proposed in the staff report dated January 12, 2006, for the demolition of the garage at the St. Mary's Glebe House, 1508 Barrington Street Halifax. MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

7.2 H00175 - Application for Registration of 2138 Brunswick Street, Halifax

C A staff report dated December 20, 2005 was before the Committee for its consideration.

Ms. Karri Loadman, presented the report to the Committee and the following was noted:

- C The building is a Gothic Revival style structure.
- C It is valued for its historical association with the Church of the Redeemer.
- C The West family had the strongest influence in the founding of the Church of the Redeemer and contributed \$100,000 to the construction of the buildings.

Scoring Summary

Criterion	Highest Possible Score	Score Awarded
1. Age	1.25	13 (1874-1875)
2. A) Relationship to Important Occasions, Institutions, Personages or Groups OR 2. B) Important/Unique Architectural Style or Highly Representative of an Era	20	18 Option B Highly important/unique representative of an era
3. Significance of Architect/Builder	10	6 Provincially significant
4. A) Architectural Merit: Construction type/building technology	10	6 Moderately rare/early example
4. B) Architectural Merit: Style	10	7 Very rare/early example
5. Architectural Integrity	15	12 Largely Unchanged
6. Relationship to Surrounding Area	10	10 The building is an important architectural asset contributing to the heritage character of the surrounding area.
Total	100	72

MOVED by Councillor Sloane, seconded by Mr. Shakotko that the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend that Halifax Regional Council

- 1. Set a public hearing date to consider the registration of 2138 Brunswick Street, Halifax.**

2. **Approve the registration of 2138 Brunswick Street, Halifax, under the HRM Heritage Property Program as proposed in the staff report dated December 20, 2005.**

MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

7.4 Heritage Days

Ms. Maggie Holm advised the Committee that as part of Heritage Days, a Heritage Plaque Dedication of the Musquodoboit Railway Museum will be taking place on February 20, 2006 at 10:30. The Committee was invited to attend.

7.5 Heritage Advisory Subcommittee

Mr. MacKinnon asked if the Committee thought it would be beneficial to form a subcommittee to look at definitions of the words adjacent, vicinity and significance to provide guidance to staff and Council.

Ms. Ashley, Ms. Arbic, Mr. MacKinnon, Mr. Creighton and Ms. Marshall volunteered to serve on the subcommittee.

Mr. Plaskett suggested that the Committee review the Barrington Street Guidelines.

MOVED BY Councillor Sloane, seconded by Ms. Arabic that the Heritage Advisory Committee form a Heritage Advisory Subcommittee to define the words adjacent, vicinity and significance to provide guidance to staff and Regional Council. MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

Mr. Metlej commented that it would be beneficial to prescribe what the terms are, because the terms can be included in the agreement. Providing definitions leaves little room for them to be challenged. He further suggested that Committee look at the view planes from Citadel Hill. It was also suggested that the Committee hold the next meeting at Citadel Hill.

8. ELECTION OF CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR

The Legislative Assistant called for nominations for the position of Chair for 2006-2007. Mr. Tom Creighton was nominated for the position of Chair. With no further nominations the following motion was placed.

MOVED BY Councillor Harvey, seconded by Ms. Arabic, that Mr. Creighton be

elected Chair of the Heritage Advisory Committee. MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

The Chair called for the nominations of Vice Chair. Ms. Arabic was nominated for the position of Vice Chair. With no further nominations the following motion was placed:

MOVED BY Councillor Sloane, seconded by Mr. Metlej, that Ms. Arabic be elected Vice Chair of the Heritage Advisory Committee. MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

9. DATE OF NEXT MEETING - February 22, 2006

10. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 5:00 pm.

Stephanie Parsons
Legislative Assistant