

HERITAGE ADVISORY COMMITTEE  
MINUTES

August 31, 2011

PRESENT: Mr. Mark Archibald, Vice Chair  
Ms. Andrea Fox  
Ms. Carly Sorenson  
Ms. Emma Sampson  
Ms. Susan Carroll  
Ms. Monica MacDonald  
Councillor Sue Uteck

REGRETS: Mr. Stephen Terauds, Chair  
Mr. David Houlihan  
Councillor Robert Harvey  
Mr. Anthony Hanniford (absent)

STAFF: Mr. Bill Plaskett, Heritage Planner  
Ms. Sheilagh Edmonds, Legislative Assistant

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1.	CALL TO ORDER.....	3
2.	APPROVAL OF MINUTES.....	3
3.	APPROVAL OF THE ORDER OF BUSINESS AND APPROVAL OF ADDITIONS AND DELETIONS .....	3
4.	BUSINESS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES / STATUS SHEET	
	4.1 Business Arising.....	3
	4.2 Status Sheet.....	3
5.	DEFERRED ITEMS.....	3
6.	CORRESPONDENCE, PETITIONS & DELEGATIONS	
	6.1 Correspondence	
	6.1.1 Letter dated August 23, 2011 from Heritage Trust Re: Case H00356.....	4
	6.2 Petitions.....	4
	6.3 Presentations.....	4
	6.4 Updates from HAC Members - HRM Committees and HAC Sub-committees.....	4
7.	REPORTS	
	7.1 Staff	
	7.1.1 Case H00356: Substantial Alteration of the Macara-Barnstead Building Located at 1798-1800 Granville Street, Halifax, a Registered Heritage Property.....	4
	7.1.2 Heritage Incentives: Barrington Street Heritage Conservation District 2011-12.....	6
8.	ADDED ITEMS.....	7
9.	DATE OF NEXT MEETING.....	7
10.	ADJOURNMENT.....	7

**1. CALL TO ORDER**

Mr. Mark Archibald, Vice Chair called the meeting to order at 3:15 p.m. in Halifax Hall, and requested the observers in attendance to introduce themselves to the Committee.

Observers in attendance: Mr. Andy Lynch, Lydon Lynch Architects; Mr. Peter Delefes and Ms. Bev Miller, Heritage Trust of Nova Scotia; Ms. Kelly Denty and Mr. Kurt Pyle, HRM Community Planning; and Ms. Amy Pugsley Fraser, *All NovaScotia.com*

**2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

**MOVED by Councillor Uteck, seconded by Ms. Sorenson that the minutes of June 22, 2011 be approved. MOTION PUT AND PASSED.**

**3. APPROVAL OF THE ORDER OF BUSINESS AND APPROVAL OF ADDITIONS AND DELETIONS**

The Chair advised that Mr. Phil Pacey had submitted a request to provide a presentation to the Committee on behalf of Heritage Trust, regarding item 7.1.1 Case H00356: Substantial Alteration of the Macara-Barnstead Building Located at 1798-1800 Granville Street, Halifax, a Registered Heritage Property. The Chair questioned the Committee on how they wished to proceed, and **it was agreed** that Heritage Trust would be provided an opportunity to address the Committee.

The Chair also noted that the following two pieces of correspondence regarding item 7.1.1 had been submitted at this meeting:

- A letter dated August 30, 2011 from David C. Wallbridge, Pink Larkin Lawyers
- A letter dated August 31, 2011 from Andrew B. Lynch, Lydon Lynch Architects

**MOVED by Councillor Uteck, seconded by Ms. Sorenson that the agenda, as amended, be approved.**

**4. BUSINESS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES / STATUS SHEET:**

**4.1 Business Arising:** None

**4.2 Status Sheet:** None

**5. DEFERRED ITEMS:** None

**6. CORRESPONDENCE, PETITIONS & DELEGATIONS:**

**6.1 Correspondence:**

**6.1.1 Letter dated August 23, 2011 from Heritage Trust Re: Case H00356**

A letter dated August 24, 2011 was submitted from Mr. Phil Pacey, Heritage Trust of Nova Scotia.

**6.2 Petitions- None**

**6.3 Presentations: None**

**6.4 Updates from HAC Members - HRM Committees and HAC  
Sub-committees: None**

**7. REPORTS:**

**7.1 Staff:**

**7.1.1 Case H00356: Substantial Alteration of the Macara-Barnstead Building  
Located at 1798-1800 Granville Street, Halifax, a Registered Heritage  
Property**

A staff report dated August 16, 2011 was submitted.

Mr. Bill Plaskett, Heritage Planner, provided the staff presentation on the application by Lydon Lynch Architects, on behalf of TDB Halifax Holdings Ltd. for substantial alteration of the Macara-Barnstead building at 1798-1800 Granville Street, Halifax, a Registered Municipal Heritage Property. Mr. Plaskett advised that the proposal was for an addition to the existing tower and this will require the removal of the bulk of the Macara-Barnstead building but its façade will be retained, restored, and incorporated into a new streetwall along Granville Street. He added that the streetwall will be designed to complement and reinforce the character-defining features of the Macara-Barnstead façade, with similar cornice and roof lines, storefront configurations, and cladding materials; the tower addition would be stepped back three metres from the streetwall and the restored historic façade would remain visually prominent in the overall composition.

Mr. Plaskett advised that the Committee is being asked to consider the heritage value and character defining elements of the existing building and the degree to which it is being altered. With respect to the application process, he explained that the Committee has the choice of agreeing with the staff recommendation or modifying it, and, and from there, it will then go to Regional Council. He added that the larger development will go to the Design Review Committee for decision. Mr. Plaskett noted that should the Design Review Committee approve the development, and if that decision is appealed, Regional Council would hear the appeal.

Mr. Plaskett responded to questions.

At this time, the Chair invited Mr. Delefes to address the Committee.

Mr. Peter Delefes, President of Heritage Trust of Nova Scotia addressed the Committee and introduced Ms. Bev Miller, also a member of Heritage Trust. Mr. Delefes and Ms. Miller provided a presentation outlining the reasons why Heritage Trust believed the proposal for substantial alteration did not meet the Conservations Standards and should be rejected, as contained in the correspondence submitted from Mr. Pacey (reference item 6.1.1).

Mr. Plaskett responded to further questions from the Committee.

**MOVED by Councillor Uteck, seconded by Ms. Sorensen that the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend Regional Council approve the substantial alteration of the Macara-Barnstead Building, a registered heritage property, located at 1798-1800 Granville Street, as outlined in the August 16, 2011 staff report**

Councillor Uteck indicated that she was supportive of this application as it conforms to the Downtown Plan and meets all the requirements in regard to the Land Use Bylaw and Design Guidelines.

The Committee entered a discussion, and Mr. Andy Lynch, Lydon Lynch Architects, the architect for the project responded to clarification questions.

The Chair pointed out that since it was only the front ten feet of the building being consider for conservation, he felt that the elements of the building in need of repair should be replaced 'in kind'. He suggested the Committee put forward a recommendation in this regard, if other members deemed it as important.

In response, Mr. Lynch advised that his intent was not to replicate but to replace elements intact, and that he views the Chair's suggestion as a positive suggestion.

A brief discussion ensued with regard to Municipality's ability to enforce that the elements are replaced in kind, and Mr. Plaskett advised that Development Agreements provide protection in this regard, however, in this instance there is no development agreement. He suggested that the Committee may want to consider including a recommendation to Council.

**MOVED by Ms. Sorensen, seconded by Ms. Sampson that the motion be amended to include the following: the restoration of the remaining façade extend to all elements including mansard roof, storefront and windows, with every reasonable effort for repair over replacement; and that Regional Council request the record documentation of existing building upon issuance of the development permit.  
MOTION PUT AND PASSED.**

The amended motion now reads as follows:

**MOVED by Councillor Uteck, seconded by Ms. Sorensen that Regional Council:**

- 1. Approve the substantial alteration of the Macara-Barnstead Building, a registered heritage property, located at 1798-1800 Granville Street, as outlined in the August 16, 2011 staff report;**
- 2. Approve that the restoration of the remaining façade extend to all elements including mansard roof, storefront and windows, with every reasonable effort for repair over replacement;**
- 3. Request the record documentation of the existing building upon issuance of the development permit.**

**MOTION PUT AND PASSED.**

**7.1.2 Heritage Incentives: Barrington Street Heritage Conservation District  
2011-12**

A staff report dated July 14, 2011 was submitted.

Mr. Plaskett provided an overview of the report and responded to questions.

**MOVED by Ms. Carroll, seconded by Ms. Fox that the Heritage Advisory Committee recommends Regional Council:**

- 1. Approve a grant of no more than \$64,766 and a tax credit of no more than \$102,110 for façade restoration, roof replacement, and interior common space improvements on the former Carsand Mosher building located at 1559 Barrington Street as described in this report and subject to recommendation 4;**
- 2. Approve a grant of no more than \$36,105 for façade restoration on the former Brander-Morris building located at 1566 Barrington Street as described in this report and subject to recommendation 4;**
- 3. Approve a grant of no more than \$18,879 for penthouse masonry repair and façade restoration on the former G. M. Smith building located at 1717 Barrington Street as described in this report and subject to recommendation 4;**
- 4. Approve the grants and tax credit referenced in this report (recommendations 1-3 above) conditional upon, and payment to the respective applicants shall not be made until, the respective application has:**

- a) completed the work set out in the respective applications to the satisfaction of the municipality;
  - b) provided receipts and paid invoices to support the total amount approved, and
  - c) executed and registered at the Registry of Deeds/Land Registration Office an agreement that they will not apply to demolish, nor will they demolish, the respective property for 20 years from the date of the agreement.
5. Approve the transfer of any unused grant funds (at fiscal year-end) from the 2011-12 Barrington Street Heritage Conservation District Incentives Program budget of \$200,000 (account C310-8004 Planning & Application-Grants) to the Cultural Development Reserve (account Q312) for expenditure in fiscal 2012-13, once the approved projects are completed.

**MOTION PUT AND PASSED.**

8. **ADDED ITEMS:** None
9. **DATE OF NEXT MEETING:** September 28, 2011

Ms. Fox provided regrets for the next meeting.

**10. ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting adjourned at 5:05 p.m.

Sheilagh Edmonds  
Legislative Assistant