

HERITAGE ADVISORY COMMITTEE
MINUTES

February 27, 2013

PRESENT: Mr. Stephen Terauds, Chair
Ms. Deborah Larter
Mr. David Houlihan
Ms. Monica MacDonald
Ms. Emma Sampson
Mr. Richard White
Councillor David Hendsbee
Councillor Waye Mason

REGRETS: Ms. Sarah Levy
Mr. Nelson Brison
Ms. Elizabeth Fox
Ms. Susan Carroll (absent)

STAFF: Mr. Seamus McGreal, Heritage Planner
Ms. Maggie Holm, Heritage Planner
Ms. Sheilagh Edmonds, Legislative Assistant

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1.	CALL TO ORDER.....	3
2.	APPROVAL OF MINUTES	3
3.	APPROVAL OF THE ORDER OF BUSINESS AND APPROVAL OF ADDITIONS AND DELETIONS.....	3
4.	BUSINESS ARISING OUT OF THE MINUTES/STATUS SHEET: None	3
5.	DEFERRED ITEMS.....	3
5.1	Discussion on Creating a Subcommittee to Review Grading Criteria for Prospective Registered Heritage Properties (Emma Sampson) – <i>Deferred from January 30, 2013</i>	3
6.	CORRESPONDENCE, PETITIONS & DELEGATIONS	3
6.1	Correspondence	3
6.2	Petitions.....	3
6.3	Presentations.....	3
6.4	Updates from HAC Members – HRM Committees/HAC Sub-committees .	3
7.	REPORTS:	3
7.1	Staff	4
7.1.1	Case H00374: Substantial Alteration to 5270 Morris Street, Halifax – Story-Wilson House, a Registered Municipal Heritage Property ..	4
7.1.2	Case H00375: Substantial Alteration to 6454 Coburg Road, Halifax, a Provincially and Municipally Registered Heritage Property	5
7.1.3	Case H00369: Substantial Alteration to 1230-1234 Barrington Street, Halifax – Gerrard Lodge, a Registered Municipal Heritage property.....	7
7.2	Committee Members.....	8
8.	ADDED ITEMS	8
9.	NEXT MEETING DATE	8
10.	ADJOURNMENT	8

1. CALL TO ORDER

The Chair called the meeting to order at 3:05 p.m. in Halifax Hall, City Hall.

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – None

3. APPROVAL OF THE ORDER OF BUSINESS AND APPROVAL OF ADDITIONS AND DELETIONS

The Chair advised that new members were recently appointed to the Committee and he suggested that round-table introductions be made and, following this, Ms. Holm would provide a brief update on the Committee's mandate for the information of the new members.

Noting that there were three staff reports on the agenda, the Chair suggested, **and the Committee agreed** that the staff reports would be dealt with first and then the Committee would deal with the deferred item if time permitted and, if not, the item would be moved to the next agenda.

Round table introductions were made and Ms. Holm provided a brief presentation on the Heritage Property Program and the Committee's Terms of Reference.

4. BUSINESS ARISING OUT OF THE MINUTES/STATUS SHEET: None

5. DEFERRED ITEMS

5.1 Discussion on Creating a Subcommittee to Review Grading Criteria for Prospective Registered Heritage Properties (Emma Sampson) – *Deferred from January 30, 2013*

During the approval of the Order of Business, this item was deferred to the end of the agenda. Subsequently, due to time constraints, the item was not dealt with and was forwarded to the Committee's next agenda.

6. CORRESPONDENCE, PETITIONS & DELEGATIONS

6.1 Correspondence: None

6.2 Petitions: None

6.3 Presentations: None

6.4 Updates from HAC Members – HRM Committees/HAC Sub-committees

7. REPORTS:

7.1 Staff

7.1.1 Case H00374: Substantial Alteration to 5270 Morris Street, Halifax – Story-Wilson House, a Registered Municipal Heritage Property

A staff report dated January 31, 2013 was submitted.

Mr. McGreal provided the staff presentation on the application by Jonathan Legate for a substantial alteration to 5270 Morris Street, Halifax, a municipal registered heritage property. The purpose of the application is to allow a proposed addition to the rear of the existing main building. He noted that the addition will be 327 square feet and will be used as a sunroom, family room and mud room entry; and being at the rear of the building it will not be visible from the street.

Mr. McGreal provided historical background detail and reviewed the character-defining elements of the house, noting that it was built around 1834 by land owner Samuel Story in the 'Halifax House' style which is a derivative of the Georgian style. The house is known as the Story-Wilson House.

In concluding his remarks, Mr. McGreal advised that, upon review of the application and evaluating it against the Heritage Building Conservation Standards, staff was recommending approval of the addition based on the following points:

- It is modest in scale and not visible from any public street
- It is a modern structure that incorporates traditional features from the time that the heritage building was constructed.
- The proposed changes to two wood-framed windows at the rear of the building will be minor and will be preserved and may be reinstalled in their original location in the future.

The Chair noted that the property owners were in attendance and would provide any clarification that staff wasn't able to answer.

Mr. McGreal and the property owners responded to questions. The following points were clarified:

- The cladding on the addition will be similar to the existing building, with the roof line and modern structure of the new addition being the distinguishing feature between it and the existing house.
- The addition is being constructed so that it could be removed in future, should someone want to return it to its original state.
- The property owners want to keep the home as a single family house, and they feel the proposed addition will make it more desirable to keep it as a single family home, to anyone else in the future.

MOVED by Councillor Mason, seconded by Ms. Sampson that the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend that Halifax Regional Council approve the proposed substantial alteration to the Story-Wilson House as outlined in Attachment A of the January 31, 2013 staff report. MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

7.2 Case H00375: Substantial Alteration to 6454 Coburg Road, Halifax, a Provincially and Municipally Registered Heritage Property

A staff report dated January 31, 2013 was submitted.

Ms. Holm provided the staff presentation on the application by Todd and Magdalena Barnard for a substantial alteration to 6454 Coburg Road, Halifax, to remove and reconstruct the existing carport and sunroom, as well as create a small second storey addition above the sunroom as outlined in Attachments A to D in the February 18, 2013 staff report.

In her presentation Ms. Holm advised that this property was one of the oldest in the heritage registry and that it is also a provincially registered heritage property. She noted that it is known as 'Coburg Cottage' and was built in 1816 by William Pryor, a successful merchant in the East Indies trade and banking. The style of house is described as being New England colonial with numerous influences from the Classical Revival, Italianate, and Gothic Revival styles.

With regard to the proposed changes, Ms. Holm highlighted the following points:

- the carport will match the width of the house and accommodate two vehicles, and the car entrances will be relocated to the front, however, the effect of the grade changes will obscure this from the street
- the new addition will be clad in wood clapboard
- windows will be a 2-over-1 style
- flat roofs of the carport and sunroom have been designed to be used as patios and have been designed with traditional railings matching the design of the house.
- The sunroom will extend further from the main house to the west, and will have vertically proportioned ganged windows that are simpler in design than those of the main house, but sympathetic in design. A central set of ganged windows has been replaced with a set of three patio doors allowing access to the flat roof of the carport creating a patio.
- On the second storey addition an existing window will become a door opening—the window will be lowered but not widened to allow for the door.

Ms. Holm advised that after reviewing the application against the Building Conservation Standards for Heritage Properties, staff feel the proposed alterations generally meet the conservation standards and are recommending approval.

Ms. Holm noted that the homeowner was in attendance and would respond to any questions that she could not answer.

MOVED by Councillor Mason, seconded by Councillor Hendsbee that the Heritage Advisory Committee recommends that Halifax Regional Council approve the substantial alteration to 6454 Coburg Road, Halifax, a municipally registered heritage property, as outlined in the February 18, 2013 staff report.

A discussion ensued with Ms. Holm and the property owner responding to questions.

Mr. White referred to the sketch of the garage and pointed out that the window beside the garage door should be narrowed so it would be in proportion to the rest of the windows.

It was noted that on one of the drawings the interior seems show that one of the floors is dropped. Ms. Holm advised, and the homeowner concurred, that the floor plates are matched, and that any visual difference on the drawing was an error.

The Committee entered a discussion.

The Chair suggested that the Committee may want to include in its recommendation comment on the window proportion of the window by the garage door. In addition, following discussion with staff and the homeowner clarifying questions with regard to errors on the footprint and elevation drawings, the Committee agreed that the recommendation should make the approval of the application conditional on having those drawing errors corrected before any building permits are issued. The Chair summarized the aspects on the drawings requiring correction as follows:

- One of the chimneys appears to be absent
- Windows above the sunroom appear to be changed
- The decorative railing on drawing 5 appears inconsistent in height to that shown on drawing 4.

The revised motion now reads:

MOVED by Councillor Mason, seconded by Councillor Hendsbee that the Heritage Advisory Committee recommends that Halifax Regional Council approve the substantial alteration to 6454 Coburg Road, Halifax, a municipally registered heritage property, as outlined in the February 18, 2013 staff report with the following conditions:

- **Attachment C: North Elevation, also provided in supplementary materials at the HAC meeting as Drawing 4, titled “Old and New Front Elevation,” dated May 2011, revision 2: Design Changes, 2012.01.10:**
 - **The new window on the lowest level, adjacent the garage doors be revised to provide a more vertical proportion in keeping with the proportion of the windows on the existing house.**
 - **Clarify the apparent absence of one chimney prior to the granting of any permits. The chimney is visible in Attachment**

F: Historic Illustration. The chimney, and what appear to be egress stairs, were also visible on photographs included by Staff in the presentation provided to the HAC.

- **Attachment D: West Elevation, also provided in supplementary materials at the HAC meeting as Drawing 5, titled “Old and New Right Elevation,” dated May 2011, revision 2: Design Changes, 2012.01.10:**
 - **Correct the representation of the windows immediately above the sunroom (understood to be master bedroom windows) prior to the granting of any permits – they appear to be changed, but we understand from Owner feedback that they are intended to remain original.**
 - **Correct the representation of the “new decorative railing” indicated at Second Floor, to show height consistent with that shown on Drawing 4 and as required by applicable codes prior to the granting of any permits.**

MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

7.1.3 Case H00369: Substantial Alteration to 1230-1234 Barrington Street, Halifax – Gerrard Lodge, a Registered Municipal Heritage property.

A staff report dated January 31, 2013.

Mr. McGreal, Heritage Planner, provided the staff presentation on the application by Geoff Keddy Architects and Associates Ltd. for a substantial alteration to 1230-1234 Barrington Street, Gerrard Lodge, a registered municipal heritage property. Prior to providing details on the proposal, Mr. McGreal advised that this proposal will be considered within the context of the Heritage Building Conservation Standards and, as well, it is subject to the Site Plan Approval process of the Downtown Halifax Land Use Bylaw and the Design Review Committee will make a decision on the Site Plan application. Mr. McGreal noted that the Land Use Bylaw requires that the Design Review Committee be informed of the Heritage Advisory Committee’s recommendation on substantial alterations to Regional Council prior to the Design Review Committee making a decision on the site plan application. This information would be given to the Design Review Committee prior to the Heritage Advisory Committee submitting its recommendation to Regional Council.

Mr. McGreal explained that the applicant is proposing to construct a four-storey townhouse addition containing three units which will be connected via a stairwell to the existing heritage building, and this involves changes to the rear of the Gerrard Lodge. The townhouse will face Harvey Street and will also be visible from Barrington Street.

Mr. McGreal responded to questions.

Discussion ensued regarding the cornice line with committee members expressing the view that the cornice line between the new and existing buildings was not consistent.

Concern was also expressed that there was a proposed rooftop garden on the existing heritage property, and it was suggested that it would be more appropriate to put it on the new building.

Due to the late hour the Chair noted that the Committee was about to lose quorum, and advised that the Committee's discussion and decision would be carried over to the next meeting.

7.2 Committee Members: None

8. ADDED ITEMS: None

9. NEXT MEETING DATE – March 27, 2013

10. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 5:03 p.m.

Sheilagh Edmonds
Legislative Assistant