

HERITAGE ADVISORY COMMITTEE
MINUTES

April 12, 2013

PRESENT: Mr. Stephen Terauds, Chair
Mr. Richard White
Mr. Nelson Brison
Ms. Emma Sampson
Mr. David Houlihan
Mr. Marcel Parsons
Councillor David Hendsbee
Councillor Waye Mason

REGRETS: Ms. Sarah Levy
Ms. Monica MacDonald
Ms. Deborah Larter
Ms. Susan Carroll (absent)

STAFF: Mr. Seamus McGreal, Heritage Planner
Ms. Maggie Holm, Heritage Planner
Ms. Sheilagh Edmonds, Legislative Assistant

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1.	CALL TO ORDER.....	3
2.	APPROVAL OF MINUTES	3
3.	APPROVAL OF THE ORDER OF BUSINESS AND APPROVAL OF ADDITIONS AND DELETIONS.....	3
4.	BUSINESS ARISING OUT OF THE MINUTES	3
4.1	Case H00369: Substantial Alteration to 1230-1234 Barrington Street, Halifax –Gerrard Lodge, a Registered Municipal Heritage Property	3
5.	DEFERRED ITEMS:.....	5
5.1	Discussion on Creating a Subcommittee to Review Grading Criteria for Prospective Registered Heritage Properties	5
6.	CORRESPONDENCE, PETITIONS & DELEGATIONS	6
6.1	Correspondence	6
6.1.1	Letter dated March 26, 2013 from Phil Pacey, Heritage Trust	6
6.2	Petitions	6
6.3	Presentations.....	6
6.4	Updates from HAC Members – HRM Committees/HAC Sub-committees .	6
7.	REPORTS	6
7.1	Review of Draft Regional Plan, Chapter 7, Culture & Heritage	6
7.2	Case H00378: Substantial Alteration to 5131 Morris Street, Halifax, a Registered Municipal Heritage Property	6
7.3	Case H00371: Substantial Alteration 1259 Barrington Street (William Esson House), Halifax	7
8.	ADDED ITEMS	7
9.	NEXT MEETING DATE	7
10.	ADJOURNMENT	7

1. CALL TO ORDER

The Chair called the meeting to order at 3:03 p.m. in Halifax Hall, City Hall.

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

MOVED by Councillor Mason, seconded by Ms. Sampson that the minutes of January 30, 2013 and February 27, 2013 be approved. MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

3. APPROVAL OF THE ORDER OF BUSINESS AND APPROVAL OF ADDITIONS AND DELETIONS

There were no additions or deletions to the agenda.

A brief discussion ensued and it was agreed that the agenda would be amended so that item 7.1 would be dealt with at the end of the meeting, if time permitted.

MOVED by Councillor Hendsbee, seconded by Ms. Sampson that the agenda as amended be approved. MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

4. BUSINESS ARISING OUT OF THE MINUTES

4.1 Case H00369: Substantial Alteration to 1230-1234 Barrington Street, Halifax –Gerrard Lodge, a Registered Municipal Heritage Property

This matter had been discussed at the Committee's February 27, 2013 meeting when, due to time constraints, it was agreed to finish the discussion at this meeting.

Staff circulated four building elevation drawings entitled, Options 1 – Option 4.

The Chair advised that following the February 27, 2013 meeting, the architect for the Applicant revised the building design in response to concerns the Committee expressed. He noted that staff has circulated four different building elevation drawings, Options 1 through Option 4 for consideration.

Mr. McGreal provided an overview of the application and noted that at the last meeting the Committee had some concern with the interpretation of the Heritage Design Guidelines, contained within the Downtown Halifax Land Use Bylaw Design Manual, with this application. Mr. McGreal advised that he would focus today's discussion on those concerns and how they relate to the Heritage Design Guidelines.

The Committee entered a discussion on the following concerns which were noted at the last meeting with regard to the application, with staff and the architect for the application responding to questions:

- the location, size and character of the rooftop deck
- the cornice line of the proposed addition
- the setback of the proposed addition,
- the design of the Morris St. façade of the proposed addition and its relationship with the more restrained Morris St. façade of Gerrard Lodge (whose primary, and more elaborate, façade is on Barrington St.).

During the discussion, the following points were noted:

- The applicant would have preferred to have the addition as a separate building but this is not permitted under the Land Use Bylaw.
- The proposed setback has been designed to respect the existing heritage, and to differentiate the new building as separate and give visual prominence to the existing heritage property. No heritage aspects are being destroyed.
- The Rooftop garden has been reduced in size (from the February meeting)
- The architect indicated moving the rooftop garden to the new building was a possibility.
- Option 1 is a preferred Option in regard to concerns expressed about the cornice line.
- The architect was supportive of the Committee's suggestion that the new building be clad with the same shingles as on the upper level instead of cultured stone. Staff pointed out that there may be a requirement in the Downtown Plan to have diversity in the type of materials, and suggested that if the Committee wanted to recommend this, it do so on the condition that different materials are not a requirement in the downtown plan.

MOVED by Councillor Hendsbee, seconded by Mr. White that the Heritage Advisory Committee recommends the application be amended to have the base of the proposed townhouse addition clad with the same shingles as on the upper level, instead of cultured stone, provided that it meets land use bylaw requirements. MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

- It was suggested that the proposed colour of the townhouse should be neutrals and earth tones.
- The rooftop garden is in the proposal to fulfill a condition to meet the open space requirements.

MOVED by Mr. White, seconded by Mr. Parsons that the rooftop deck which is proposed in order to meet open space requirements, be dealt with by the proposed townhouse addition rather than the existing heritage property.

- The Committee's concern with regard to cornice height has been addressed with either Option 1 or Option 2 of the submitted elevation drawings

MOVED by Councillor Hendsbee, seconded by Councillor Mason that the Heritage Advisory Committee recommends the applicant proceed with Option 1 of the revised submitted plans. MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

MOVED by Councillor Hendsbee, seconded by Councillor Mason that Heritage Advisory Committee recommends Halifax Regional Council approve the proposed substantial alteration to the Gerrard Lodge as outlined in Attachments A through C of the January 31, 2013, with the following amendments:

- **The base of the proposed townhouse addition be clad with the same shingles as on the upper level, instead of cultured stone, provided that it meets land use bylaw requirements;**
- **The deck, which is proposed in order to meet open space requirements, be dealt with by the proposed townhouse addition (which is the portion of the property that generates those open space requirements) rather than the existing heritage property;**
- **Approve Option 1 of revised elevation options**

MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

5. DEFERRED ITEMS:

5.1 Discussion on Creating a Subcommittee to Review Grading Criteria for Prospective Registered Heritage Properties

The Chair advised that over the past couple of years, Committee members have raised the issue that the Grading Criteria for Prospective Registered Heritage Properties should be reviewed, and it has been suggested that a subcommittee be formed to look into this matter and report back to the Heritage Advisory Committee.

A brief discussion ensued, with the Chair advising that the subcommittee would look at what the standards are elsewhere and refining the process. The Chair advised that if the Committee felt it was worthwhile to pursue this matter, that a motion be put forward in this regard.

MOVED by Ms. Sampson, seconded by Councillor Mason that the Heritage Advisory Committee establish a sub-committee to review the Committee's grading criteria for prospective registered heritage properties. MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

The following Committee members were nominated to sit on the sub-committee:

Ms. Emma Sampson – accepted the nomination

Mr. Richard White – accepted the nomination

The Chair advised that Ms. MacDonald had previously indicated that she was interested in serving on the sub-committee and suggested that she be nominated, but her appointment to the sub-committee to be confirmed, based on her acceptance.

Councillor Mason questioned if Heritage staff were able to support the sub-committee, without Regional Council approval, explaining that senior staff have been advising that, as a way to ensure staff were focused on Regional Council's priorities, Regional Council is the only body that can provide direction to staff.

The Chair asked the Legislative Assistant to look into this matter.

6. CORRESPONDENCE, PETITIONS & DELEGATIONS

6.1 Correspondence

6.1.1 Letter dated March 26, 2013 from Phil Pacey, Heritage Trust

A letter dated March 26, 2012 was submitted from Mr. Phil Pacey, Heritage Trust of Nova Scotia.

6.2 Petitions: None

6.3 Presentations: None

6.4 Updates from HAC Members – HRM Committees/HAC Sub-committees: None

7. REPORTS

7.1 Review of Draft Regional Plan, Chapter 7, Culture & Heritage

During the approval of the Order of Business, it was agreed that this item would be moved to the end of the agenda, and dealt with if time permitted; and deferred to the next meeting if the Committee was unable to deal with it at this meeting.

7.2 Case H00378: Substantial Alteration to 5131 Morris Street, Halifax, a Registered Municipal Heritage Property

A staff report dated March 4, 2013 was submitted.

Prior to her presentation, Ms. Holm noted that this property had been on the Regional Council agenda a few months ago with regard to an encroachment agreement, which was necessary in order to complete the substantial alteration to the property.

Ms. Holm outlined the application to construct a basement stairwell, refuse storage area, and associated retaining wall at the front of 5131 Morris Street, a registered heritage property, to allow a second access to a basement apartment. Ms. Holm advised that staff were recommending approval of this substantial alteration based on fact that the proposed work will be clearly distinguished as new work and the existing historical character will be unaffected. In addition, staff feel the new basement stairwell will be balanced with the adjoining property.

Ms. Holm responded to questions.

MOVED by Councillor Hendsbee, seconded by Mr. Parsons that the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend that Halifax Regional Council approve the proposed substantial alteration to 5131 Morris Street as outlined in Attachments A through C of the March 4, 2013 staff report. MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

7.3 Case H00371: Substantial Alteration 1259 Barrington Street (William Esson House), Halifax

A staff report dated March 8, 2013 was submitted.

Ms. Seamus McGreal presented the application for substantial alteration to 1259 Barrington Street, a registered heritage property, to construct an addition in the rear yard consisting of four storeys with seven residential units. In his remarks, Mr. McGreal advised that the Development Officer has determined that this application does not have to be vetted through the Design Review Committee, because the proposal will not materially change the external appearance of the building facing street lines. Mr. McGreal advised that staff were recommending approval based on the following reasons: the addition will not be visible from any street; there will be minimal change to the character defining elements of the building; the addition will replace a 1988 addition that has fallen into a state of disrepair; and the addition will be constructed in a way that there will be the appearance of two separate structures.

MOVED by Councillor Mason, seconded by Mr. Brison that the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend that Halifax Regional Council approve the proposed substantial alteration of the William Esson House as outlined in Attachments A to C of the March 8, 2013 staff report. MOTION PUT AND APSSSED.

- 8. ADDED ITEMS: None**
- 9. NEXT MEETING DATE – April 24, 2013**
- 10. ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting adjourned at 5:10 p.m.

Sheilagh Edmonds
Legislative Assistant