

HERITAGE ADVISORY COMMITTEE
MINUTES

August 27, 2008

- PRESENT:** Mr. Tom Creighton, Chair
Councillor Robert Harvey, Vice Chair
Councillor Dawn Sloane
Ms. Susan Carroll
Mr. Mark Pothier
Mr. Michael Cross
Ms. Lisa Miller
Mr. Stephen Terauds
- ABSENT:** Mr. Arthur Irwin (regrets)
Ms. Catherine Thibeault (regrets)
Mr. Ryan Deschamps
- STAFF:** Mr. Bill Plaskett, Heritage Planner
Ms. Sheilagh Edmonds, Legislative Assistant

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. CALL TO ORDER 3

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES: 3

3. APPROVAL OF THE ORDER OF BUSINESS AND APPROVAL OF
ADDITIONS AND DELETIONS 3

4. BUSINESS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES:

4.1 Demolition of Historic Buildings 6

4.2 Demolition of Nonregistered Heritage Structure 6

5. DEFERRED ITEMS: 3

6. CORRESPONDENCE, PETITIONS & DELEGATIONS:

6.1 Correspondence: 3

6.2 Petitions: 3

6.3 Presentations 3

6.4 Updates from HAC Members - HRM Committees and
HAC Sub-committees 3

7. REPORTS:

7.1 Case H00224: Substantial Alterations to 287 Portland Street,
Dartmouth, a Municipally Registered Heritage Property 4

7.2 Case H00221 - Application to Consider 1101 South Park Street,
Halifax, as a Municipally Registered Heritage Property 4

8. ADDED ITEMS: 6

9. DATE OF NEXT MEETING: 6

10. ADJOURNMENT 7

1. **CALL TO ORDER:**

The Chair called the meeting to order at 3:12 p.m.

2. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES:**

MOVED by Councillor Sloane, seconded by Mr. Pothier that the minutes of July 23, 2008 be approved. MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

3. **APPROVAL OF THE ORDER OF BUSINESS AND APPROVAL OF ADDITIONS AND DELETIONS**

There were no additions or deletions to the agenda.

The Chair advised that Councillor Harvey had another meeting to attend and would be leaving early. He suggested and **it was agreed** to deal with the staff reports as the first order of business, in the event Councillor Harvey would have to leave before the Committee was able to deal with them.

5. **DEFERRED ITEMS:** None

6. **CORRESPONDENCE, PETITIONS & DELEGATIONS:**

6.1 Correspondence: None

6.2 Petitions: None

6.3 Presentations: None

6.4 **Updates from HAC Members - HRM Committees and HAC Sub-committees**

Councillor Sloane advised that at the last HRM by Design meeting there was a discussion on increasing public consultation. She added that although she could not attend the meeting, she forwarded a suggestion recommending developers be required to hold a 'meet and greet' with individuals living within 30 metres of their proposed project, before HRM staff begins their process.

Mr. Cross advised that he has been copied on a number of e-mails regarding the Cultural Advisory Committee (CAC). He noted that it appears the Committee may or may not be defunct, adding that the Committee member's terms expired the end of July but Regional Council has not made any new appointments. Mr. Cross noted that, as the HAC's representative on the Cultural Advisory Committee, he felt it was a very worthwhile Committee and would like the HAC's endorsement to follow up and to get clarification on the status of the CAC.

MOVED by Councillor Sloane, seconded by Ms. Miller that the Municipal Clerk's Office be advised that the Heritage Advisory Committee supports the continuation of the Cultural Advisory Committee, and requests clarification on its status. MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

As agreed during the approval of the agenda, the Committee dealt with the staff reports at this time.

7. REPORTS:

7.1 Case H00224: Substantial Alterations to 287 Portland Street, Dartmouth, a Municipally Registered Heritage Property

A staff report dated July 23, 2008 was submitted.

Mr. Plaskett reviewed the application by Tamara Perlmutter, for substantial alterations of 287 Portland Street, Dartmouth.

In his presentation, Mr. Plaskett advised that the application is essentially for vinyl window replacement all around the building. Also, he pointed out that the existing bay windows are very tall and it is very difficult to find sash windows of that height in vinyl, so the proposal is to replace these windows with a fixed main and awning type of window, as shown in Attachment A of the staff report.

Mr. Plaskett responded to questions.

In response to concerns expressed that vinyl windows contravene the heritage standards, Mr. Plaskett advised that there is precedent for allowing vinyl windows, noting that the Committee has previously approved vinyl windows. Mr. Plaskett added that, in some cases, staff have been able to persuade property owners to use wood, with the heritage incentives program, but he did not know if the property owner in this case had been approached by the heritage planner.

During discussion on this matter, concern was also expressed as to whether the alterations would meet the building conservation standards, and that they would change the Victorian character of the building.

MOVED by Councillor Sloane, seconded by Mr. Cross that this matter be deferred pending follow-up and report back by staff on whether the property owner has explored the option of the heritage incentives program to provide assistance in regard to using wood for the windows, rather than vinyl.

THE MOTION TO DEFER WAS PUT AND PASSED.

At 3:28 p.m. Stephen Terauds entered the meeting.

7.2 Case H00221 - Application to Consider 1101 South Park Street, Halifax, as a Municipally Registered Heritage Property

A staff report dated July 29, 2008 was submitted.

Mr. Bill Plaskett, Heritage Planner, provided an overview of the request by Mr. Gordon MacLean to consider 1101 South Park Street, Halifax, as a municipal heritage property.

In his remarks, Mr. Plaskett advised that extensive research was carried out on the property and provided by the property owner and was attached to the staff report. In this regard, Mr. Plaskett noted that the building is in the Arts and Crafts Style and the only alteration has been the filling-in of a porch, and this has been done in keeping with the character of the home. He noted that most of the surrounding buildings are Victorian, and that there are some heritage properties in the general area.

Mr. Plaskett responded to questions, and the Committee scored the property as follows, as per the Evaluation Criteria for Registration of Heritage Buildings:

Criterion	Highest Possible Score	Score Awarded
1. Age	25	9
2. a) Relationship to Important Occasions, Institutions, Personages or Groups OR 2. b) Important/Unique Architectural Style or Highly Representative of an Era	20	15
3. Significance of Architect/Builder	10	6
4. a) Architectural Merit: Construction type/ building technology	10	5
4. b) Architectural Merit: Style	10	5
5. Architectural Integrity	15	12
6. Relationship to Surrounding Area	10	10
Total	100	62

SCORE NECESSARY FOR DESIGNATION 50

MOVED by Councillor Sloane, seconded by Ms. Carroll that the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend Regional Council:

1. **Set a date for a heritage hearing to consider the application for registration of 1101 South Park Street, Halifax as a Municipally Registered Heritage Property; and**
2. **Approve the registration of 1101 South Park Street, Halifax, (shown in Map 1 of the July 29, 2008 staff report) under the HRM Heritage Property program.**

MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

At 3:40 p.m. Councillor Harvey retired from the meeting.

4. **BUSINESS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES:**

4.1 **Demolition of Historic Buildings** - Information by Mr. Clary Kempton

This matter had been added to the agenda of the July 23, 2008 meeting; at that time it was deferred to this meeting for discussion.

- Information by Mr. Clary Kempton entitled, *Heritage Plan*, was submitted
- Information by Mr. Bill Plaskett, Heritage Planner, responding to Mr. Kempton's submission, was circulated to the Committee.

The Chair referred to Mr. Kempton's proposed measures for protecting heritage buildings and noted that much of what he is recommending is beyond the scope of this committee.

Mr. Cross disagreed advising that the Committee has a mandate to advocate for heritage and that, although a lot of the recommendations fall under Provincial jurisdiction, the Committee can have an opinion and make representation on the matter.

Mr. Plaskett reviewed his responses in regard to Mr. Kempton's recommendations for protecting historic buildings. In his remarks Mr. Plaskett advised that some of Mr. Kempton's suggestions are already being carried out, and a number of other initiatives are being addressed by the HRM by Design project.

A discussion ensued as to how the Committee should respond to Mr. Kempton's submission and it was noted that Mr. Kempton seems unaware of what the Municipality is currently doing in regard to the items he put forward. It was suggested that Mr. Plaskett send his responses to Mr. Kempton pointing this out this fact and asking Mr. Kempton to provide more details if he required further clarification.

Mr. Plaskett advised that HRM by Design have planned a presentation to the Heritage Advisory Committee next month, and he suggested that since this issue connects with their work, the Committee may want to hear what is in their Plan in regard to heritage matters, before taking any action.

In concluding the discussion, the Chair advised that the Committee would wait to hear the HRM by Design presentation before making a decision on whether to take further action. As well, Mr. Plaskett would provide his response to Mr. Kempton, and advise him to provide more detail if he wanted clarification on any of the items.

4.2 **Demolition of Nonregistered Heritage Structure (Mr. Arthur Irwin)**

Mr. Irwin was not in attendance to address this item.

8. **ADDED ITEMS:** None

9. **DATE OF NEXT MEETING:** September 24, 2008

10. **ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting adjourned at 4:37 p.m.

Sheilagh Edmonds
Legislative Assistant