# HERITAGE ADVISORY COMMITTEE MINUTES

September 23, 2009

PRESENT: Ms. Catherine Thibeault, Vice Chair

Ms. Susan Carroll Mr. Arthur Irwin Ms. Lisa Miller Mr. Mark Archibald Ms. Tori Jarvis

Councillor Lorelei Nicoll Councillor Jennifer Watts

REGRETS: Mr. Stephen Terauds, Chair

Mr. Adam Conter Ms. Carly Sorensen

STAFF: Mr. Bill Plaskett, Heritage Planner

Ms. Sheilagh Edmonds, Legislative Assistant

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

1.	CALL TO ORDER	3
2.	APPROVAL OF MINUTES	3
3.	APPROVAL OF THE ORDER OF BUSINESS AND APPROVAL OF ADDITIONS AND DELETIONS	3
4.	BUSINESS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES	3
5.	DEFERRED ITEMS:	3
6.	CORRESPONDENCE, PETITIONS & DELEGATIONS: 3.1 Correspondence:	3
7.	REPORTS: 7.1 Case 01299: Amending Agreements - Greenvale School, 130 Ochterloney Street	3
8.	ADDED ITEMS	5
9.	DATE OF NEXT MEETING	5
10	AD IOURNMENT	5

#### 1. CALL TO ORDER

The Vice Chair called the meeting to order at 3:07 p.m. in the Duke Room 1 meeting room, 5251 Duke Street, Halifax.

## 2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

MOVED by Ms. Carroll, seconded by Mr. Irwin that the minutes of August 26, 2009 be approved. MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

3. APPROVAL OF THE ORDER OF BUSINESS AND APPROVAL OF ADDITIONS AND DELETIONS

MOVED by Ms. Carroll, seconded by Ms. Miller that the agenda as presented be approved. MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

- 4. **BUSINESS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES**: None
- 5. **DEFERRED ITEMS:** None
- 6. CORRESPONDENCE, PETITIONS & DELEGATIONS:
- **6.1 Correspondence:** None
- 6.2 Petitions: None
- **6.3** Presentations: None
- 6.4 Updates from HAC Members HRM Committees and HAC Sub-committees no updates
- 7. REPORTS:
- 7.1 Case 01299: Amending Agreements Greenvale School, 130 Ochterloney Street

A staff report dated August 20, 2009 was submitted.

Mr. Darrell Joudrey, Planner, outlined the application by Dexel Developments Ltd. (Dexel) requesting a substantive amendment to their existing development agreement pertaining to the removal of the existing chimney.

At 3:11 p.m. Councillor Nicoll entered the meeting.

In his remarks, Mr. Joudrey explained that the chimney had already been demolished and that the developer does not wish to replace it, adding that this action not only contravenes the conditions of the Development Agreement but it ignores HRM's basic

conservation standards on retaining and restoring features to the greatest extent possible. Mr. Joudrey advised that staff provided an alternative to the developer of replacing the chimney with a replica, meeting specifications set out by staff, but this was also rejected by the developer. Mr. Joudrey added that staff are unable to support Dexel's request to eliminate the chimney and feel that it must be replaced.

Mr. Joudrey noted that Mr. Louis Lawen, representing Dexel was in attendance to respond to any questions the Committee may have.

Mr. Joudrey, Mr. Bill Plaskett, and Mr. Kurt Pyle, Acting Supervisor, Planning Applications responded to questions, clarifying the following points:

- the chimney is not required for heating the original ventilation shafts will serve as the vents
- staff provided the alternative of allowing a replica chimney rather than a structural chimney
- the Development Agreement does not spell out any repercussions for not complying with retaining the chimney

Mr. Lawen addressed the Committee and explained that he had a mason onsite to repoint the chimney, however, the mason found a crack and would not attempt to repair it as he was afraid that once he started working it would fall over. He advised that there was no structural integrity within the chimney and it was not torn down deliberately.

In response to a question by Mr. Archibald, Mr. Lawen advised that he not have official reports from a structural engineer or from the mason in regard to the structural integrity of the chimney.

Mr. Lawen outlined the work to date he has put into the building and noted other prominent architectural features of the building, such as the vent towers, the overhang, and the windows. He advised that rebuilding the chimney would take away from the architectural features of the building. Mr. Lawen also pointed out that his project was not a restoration of the building.

MOVED by Mr. Archibald, seconded by Ms. Miller that the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend Regional Council refuse to approve the removal of the chimney from the heritage building at 130 Ochterloney Street, Dartmouth.

In moving the motion Mr. Archibald advised that he was in support of the staff recommendation because the Development Agreement identified the chimney as an important feature and it was removed without consultation or substantiation.

### THE MOTION WAS PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY

At 4:00 p.m. Mr. Irwin retired from the meeting.

In reference to the motion, Mr. Pyle questioned whether the Committee wanted to provide a recommendation with regard to the chimney replacement or leave it to staff

and, if so, he suggested that a motion be put forward in this regard.

MOVED by Mr. Archibald, seconded by Ms. Miller that the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend the chimney be replaced with a replica of a reinforced brick sheathed plywood box anchored to the remaining chimney and that this new feature match the old design in colour, texture and other visual qualities, including height and, where possible, materials. Further it is recommended that the developer work closely with HRM Heritage Planners to arrive at a suitable design. MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

- 8. ADDED ITEMS: None
- 9. DATE OF NEXT MEETING: October 28, 2009
- 10. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 4:03 p.m.

Sheilagh Edmonds Legislative Assistant