

HALIFAX REGIONAL MUNICIPALITY

**HERITAGE ADVISORY COMMITTEE
MINUTES
MAY 26, 2004**

PRESENT:

Mr. Allan MacLellan, Chair
Mr. Tom Creighton, Vice Chair
Councillor Bob Harvey
Councillor Dawn Sloane
Mr. Dale Hall
Mr. Ralston MacDonnell
Mr. Paul MacKinnon
Mr. Bill Meagher
Mr. Elias Metlej
Mr. Mark Pothier
Mr. Jim Trites

Regrets:

Ms. Andrea Arbic

Staff:

Ms. Maggie Holm, Heritage Planner
Mr. Dan Norris, Manger, Culture and Heritage
Mr. Gary Porter, Planner
Ms. Patti Halliday, Legislative Assistant
Ms. Dorothy Amey, Administrative Support

Table of Contents

1.	APPROVAL OF MINUTES - APRIL 28, 2004	3
2.	APPROVAL OF THE ORDER OF BUSINESS, ADDITIONS AND DELETIONS .	3
3.	BUSINESS ARISING OUT OF THE MINUTES	3
4.	CONSIDERATION OF DEFERRED BUSINESS	3
4.1	Evaluation Criteria Report	3
5.	NEW BUSINESS	3
5.1	H00132 - Application for Registration of 2548 Gottingen Street	3
5.2	H00133 - Proposed Addition to 149 Prince Albert Road, Dartmouth	4
5.3	H00134 - Proposed Alterations to 47 North Street, Dartmouth	5
5.4	Case 00628 - MPS & LUB Amendment DA for Cunard Street and June Street	5
5.5	Case 00605 - Application for a Development Agreement - 1684 Grafton Street, Halifax	6
5.6	Conceptual Plan Alternatives for Regional Planning Presentation	7
5.7	Heritage Commemoration	9
5.7.1	Joe Howe Mural	9
5.7.2	Joe Howe Gravesite Markers	9
5.7.3	British Home Children	9
5.8	Heritage Incentives	9
5.8.1	NSCAD Presentation	9
5.8.2	Regional Planning Workshops	9
6.	INFORMATION ITEMS	9
6.1	Approval Letters - Various Letters	10
6.2	Extracts from Regional/Community Council Minutes	10
6.3	Temporary Signs - Camp Hill Cemetery/Joe Howe Graveside	10
7.	Updates	10
8.	Added items	10
8.1	Discussion re July Meeting	10
8.2	New Material for Heritage Plaques	10
9.	DATE OF NEXT MEETING	10
10.	ADJOURNMENT	10

The meeting was called to order at 3:05 p.m.

1. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES - APRIL 28, 2004**

MOVED by Councillor Sloane, seconded by Mark Pothier, that the minutes of April 28, 2004 be approved, as circulated. MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

2. **APPROVAL OF THE ORDER OF BUSINESS, ADDITIONS AND DELETIONS**

The following item was added to the agenda:

8.2 New Material for Heritage Plaques

3. **BUSINESS ARISING OUT OF THE MINUTES**

4. **CONSIDERATION OF DEFERRED BUSINESS**

4.1 **Evaluation Criteria Report**

C Revised Evaluation Criteria for Registration of Heritage Properties Halifax Regional Municipality was circulated to the Committee.

Ms. Maggie Holm, Heritage Planner, presented the revised criteria to the Committee.

As Ms. Arbic was unable to attend this meeting, it was agreed to defer discussion of this item to the next meeting.

5. **NEW BUSINESS**

5.1 **H00132 - Application for Registration of 2548 Gottingen Street**

C A staff report prepared for Jim Donovan, Manager, Planning Applications, regarding this item was before the Committee for its consideration.

Ms. Alfreda Withrow, Research Consultant, presented the historical report on 2548 Gottingen Street, Halifax, to the Committee.

The Committee proceeded to evaluate the property with the following results:

Criteria

Points

1. Age

Construction Date 1894-95 10 pts

**2. Relationship to Important Occasions,
Institutions, Personages, Eras**

Local importance - architect 10 pts

3. Relationship to Surrounding Area

Excellent - building is a definite asset to surrounding
area 10 pts

4. Aesthetic/Architectural Merit

Original facade 5 pts

Good example of architectural type: building competently
displays the major architectural characteristics of the
type and is aesthetically pleasing 15 pts

TOTAL 50 pts

MOVED by Councillor Sloane, seconded by Tom Creighton, that the Heritage Advisory Committee score 2548 Gottingen Street 50 points and recommend to Regional Council that this property be registered under the HRM Heritage Property Program. MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

5.2 H00133 - Proposed Addition to 149 Prince Albert Road, Dartmouth

C A staff report prepared for Jim Donovan, Manager, Planning Applications, regarding this item was before the Committee for its consideration.

Ms. Holm presented the report to the Committee.

(Mr. Metlej took his place at the meeting at 3:30 p.m.)

Following a brief discussion, the following motion was put.

MOVED by Councillor Harvey, seconded by Jim Trites, that the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend approval of a change in location of a previously approved addition to 149 Prince Albert Road, as proposed in the staff report dated May 26, 2004. MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

5.3 H00134 - Proposed Alterations to 47 North Street, Dartmouth

C A staff report prepared for Jim Donovan, Manager, Planning Applications, regarding this item was before the Committee for its consideration.

Ms. Holm presented the report to the Committee.

A brief discussion ensued regarding the proposed screen door and windows. Concern was expressed by members of the Committee regarding the style of the proposed windows and it was the general consensus that a more appropriate style would be single or double hung in a similar vertical/rectangular fashion, as is the case now, in a two over two style. Some concern was also expressed with the proposed Victorian style of the screen door.

MOVED by Jim Trites, seconded by Mark Pothier, that the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend approval of the application for alterations to 47 North Street, as presented, subject to the windows being single or double hung in a similar vertical/rectangular fashion, as is the case now, in a two over two style, and the screen door being submitted as a separate application. MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

5.4 Case 00628 - MPS & LUB Amendment DA for Cunard Street and June Street

C A report prepared for Paul Dunphy, Director, Planning and Development Services, regarding the above, was before the Committee for its consideration. Page 11 of the report was circulated to the Committee.

Mr. Christopher Young, Architect, Duffus Romans Kundzins Rounsefell Architects Limited, presented the report to the Committee and responded to questions. He noted the earliest start time for construction is October and the construction will take about a year to complete and may be phased.

Mr. Meagher suggested the Committee take a recorded vote on substantive issues such as this as it is important to know where each member stands. A discussion ensued regarding the mandate of the Committee. Councillor Harvey explained that the HAC is only voting on the impact of the proposed development on the adjacent heritage properties, and the Planning Advisory Committee will be providing a recommendation to the Peninsula Community Council

on the amendments to the Halifax MPS and the Halifax LUB. Mr. Porter added the Committee is being asked to comment to the Peninsula Community Council as to whether the proposed building fits in with the adjacent heritage properties.

With respect to the potential impacts of the proposed development agreement for 5837 Cunard Street and 2372 June Street on the adjacent registered heritage properties, it was the general consensus that overall the impacts would be acceptable from a heritage perspective.

MOVED by Jim Trites, seconded by Mark Pothier, that the Heritage Advisory Committee advise the Peninsula Community Council that it believes the potential impacts, of the proposed development agreement for 5837 Cunard Street and 2372 June Street, on the adjacent registered heritage properties are acceptable. MOTION PUT AND PASSED. (Mr. MacDonnell and Mr. Meagher voted against the motion.)

5.5 Case 00605 - Application for a Development Agreement - 1684 Grafton Street, Halifax

C A report prepared for Paul Dunphy, Director, Planning and Development Services, regarding the above, was before the Committee for its consideration.

Mr. Gary Porter, Planner, presented the report to the Committee.

A discussion ensued regarding the height of the proposed building, and Ms. Holm explained the question for the Committee is how would a building of this proposed height effect heritage buildings in area. Mr. Porter noted the height was originally proposed to be 20 storeys. Following the public information meeting, the developer dropped the height to 17 storeys, but staff felt it was still too high and suggested it be in the range of 12 storeys, but this did not satisfy the developer's economic needs.

Mr. Trites noted at the last meeting the Committee was comfortable with the design, materials, etc., and stated the Committee should be focussing its comments on effect of the proposed building height on the adjacent dispensary building Mr. Creighton stated the comments should not be narrowed down to that one property. Mr. MacKinnon noted that whatever is decided here, the Committee needs to be consistent when the larger industrial development adjacent to it comes to the HAC in the future.

On behalf of Heritage Trust of Nova Scotia, Ms. Elizabeth Pacey briefly addressed the Committee making the following points:

C Heritage Trust is extremely concerned with the proposal and support the staff recommendation.

- C Very few cities in the world have a star-shaped fortress, such as Citadel Hill, as its centre point.
- C There needs to be a low scale district in front of Citadel Hill to appreciate the view.
- C The tallness, scale and mass of the proposed building will have a detrimental effect on the Brunswick Street sub-area.
- C She referenced the policies that govern the impact on this area: Policy 6.3.1 *The intent of such height controls shall be to establish a generally low to medium rise character of development in the area of approximately four traditional storeys in height immediately adjacent to Citadel Hill and increasing with distance therefrom*, and the Central Business District Policy 7.2.1.
- C Heritage Trust urged the HAC to respect and study these 2 policies and consider the special importance of low scale new developments that have been put in the Brunswick Street sub-area and reduce the height of this proposal to fit in with the Brunswick Street sub-area.

Councillor Sloane stated she was not comfortable making a motion without seeing more visual representation of the development.

The proponent noted they will have information in two weeks time regarding an analysis of the policies mentioned by Ms. Pacey which can be shared with the Committee at that time.

Mr. MacLellan acknowledged that height is an economical question, but noted that staff and many members of the Committee believe the proposed height of this building is a bit out of scale.

MOVED by Tom Creighton, seconded by Ralston MacDonnell, that the Heritage Advisory Committee advise the Peninsula Community Council that it believes the potential impacts of the proposed development agreement for 1684 Grafton Street, Halifax, on the adjacent registered heritage properties are unacceptable. MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

5.6 Conceptual Plan Alternatives for Regional Planning Presentation

- C A package of information regarding Regional Planning was circulated to the Committee.

Ms. Maureen Ryan, Planner, gave a brief overview of the information package noting staff is looking for feedback by the end of June. Due to time constraints, she stated the PowerPoint presentation regarding the conceptual plan alternatives could be rescheduled for another time if the Committee so wished. Ms. Ryan noted there are also 13 open house sessions being held that Committee members could attend.

Ms. Ryan encouraged the Committee members to review the citizen's guide and provide feedback in the form of surveys included in package. She noted a collective response could also be submitted by the HAC. Ms. Ryan noted there is additional information available that staff would like to forward on to the HAC and she agreed to forward it to staff for inclusion in the next agenda package.

The Committee agreed to deal with Item 5.8.1 NSCAD Presentation at this time.

5.8.1 NSCAD Presentation

- C An Information Report prepared for Lew Rogers, Director, Recreation, Tourism and Culture, regarding the above was before the Committee for its information.

CONFLICT OF INTEREST

Mr. Ralston MacDonnell declared a **Conflict of Interest**, as he was a member of the Board, NSCAD, and withdrew himself from the discussion and vote on this issue.

Ms. Deborah Carver, Executive Director, Development and Special Projects, NSCAD, and Mr. Graeme Duffus, Architect, made a presentation to the Committee requesting that it reconsider its position with respect to their request for a heritage incentive grant for a building assessment study. Mr. Duffus circulated three examples of similar studies for the Committee to view. He noted the study would include a detailed condition assessment, necessary work to be done, recommendations on restoration repair and rehabilitation, a plan that prioritizes and deals with the urgent repairs first, and estimates the kind of money required to be raised to complete the work. He stressed the importance of putting funding in place for this study. The total cost of the study is \$24,000.

Councillor Sloane inquired if similar requests have been approved in the past. Ms. Holm stated not through the HAC but they have been approved through the HRM Grant Program. Mr. Norris noted the deadline for application to that program was December 31, 2003; therefore, they could not apply to this program until December 2004.

Mr. MacKinnon inquired if NSCAD is granted money now, does it preclude them from coming back to apply again when the actual work is done. Mr. Norris stated any owner of a heritage property can apply to the heritage incentive program annually.

In response to a question of clarification of Mr. MacLellan of what is expected of the HAC, Mr. Norris noted this grant request falls outside the boundary of the heritage incentive program and staff are seeking endorsement of the HAC for an exception.

MOVED by Councillor Sloane, seconded by Paul MacKinnon, that although the

NSCAD application falls outside the parameters of the heritage incentive program, based on the merits of the study, the Heritage Advisory Committee recommends to Regional Council that the request for a grant of \$10,000 for the proposed study be approved. MOTION PUT AND PASSED. (Mr. Meagher voted against the motion. Mr. MacDonnell did not vote as he declared a Conflict of Interest.)

Mr. MacLellan requested that future reports to the Committee clearly state whether or not a recommendation is required from the Heritage Advisory Committee and information reports be clearly identified under the appropriate section on the agenda.

5.7 Heritage Commemoration

5.7.1 Joe Howe Mural

C A staff report prepared for Lew Rogers, Director, Recreation, Tourism, Culture, regarding the above, was before the Committee for its consideration.

Mr. Dan Norris briefly reviewed the staff report.

MOVED by Mark Pothier, seconded by Jim Trites, that the Heritage Advisory Committee approve the application by the Joseph Howe Initiative to alter the exterior appearance of 1717 Barrington Street, with the addition of a 17" by 34" mural to the south (or side) elevation of the building depicting Joe Howe. MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

5.7.2 Joe Howe Gravesite Markers

C An information report prepared for Lew Rogers, Director, Recreation, Tourism and Culture, regarding the above, was before the Committee for its information.

This was for information purposes only.

5.7.3 British Home Children

C An information report prepared for Lew Rogers, Director, Recreation, Tourism and Culture, regarding the above, was before the Committee for its information.

This was for information purposes only.

5.8 Heritage Incentives

5.8.1 NSCAD Presentation

This item was addressed earlier in the meeting.

5.8.2 Regional Planning Workshops

This item was addressed under Item 5.6 Conceptual Plan Alternatives for Regional Planning Presentation

6. INFORMATION ITEMS

6.1 Approval Letters - Various Letters

6.2 Extracts from Regional/Community Council Minutes

6.3 Temporary Signs - Camp Hill Cemetery/Joe Howe Graveside

7. Updates

8. Added items

8.1 Discussion re July Meeting

It was agreed there would be no July meeting.

8.2 New Material for Heritage Plaques

Ms. Holm briefly reviewed new material for heritage plaques. It was agreed to defer discussion of this issue until the next meeting.

9. DATE OF NEXT MEETING

The date of the next meeting will be Wednesday, June 23, 2004.

10. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 5:40 p.m.

Patti Halliday
Legislative Assistant