

**HERITAGE ADVISORY COMMITTEE
MINUTES
April 28, 2004**

PRESENT: Mr. Allan MacLellan, Chair
Mr. Tom Creighton, Vice-Chair
Councillor Bob Harvey
Councillor Dawn Sloane
Ms. Andrea Arbic
Mr. Dale Hall
Mr. Paul MacKinnon
Mr. Bill Meagher
Mr. Elias Metlej
Mr. Mark Pothier
Mr. Jim Trites

REGRETS: Mr. Ralston MacDonnell

STAFF: Ms. Maggie Holm, Heritage Planner
Mr. Bill Plaskett, Heritage Conservation Planner
Ms. Patti Halliday, Legislative Assistant
Ms. Dorothy Amey, Administrative Support

Table of Contents

1.	APPROVAL OF MINUTES - March 31, 2004	3
2.	APPROVAL OF THE ORDER OF BUSINESS, ADDITIONS AND DELETIONS .	3
3.	BUSINESS ARISING OUT OF THE MINUTES	3
4.	DEFERRED BUSINESS	3
4.1	H00128 - Application for Registration of Memory Lane Heritage Village, Lake Charlotte, NS	3
4.2	Evaluation of Properties - Scoring Sheet	4
4.3	Ratification of In Camera Session Item	4
5.	CONSIDERATION OF NEW BUSINESS	5
5.1	Case 00628 - 5819-37 Cunard St. - Amendment to the MPS	5
5.2	Heritage Incentive Applications	6
6.	INFORMATION ITEMS	7
6.1	Approval Letters - Various Letters	7
6.2	Extracts from Regional/Community Council Minutes	7
7.	ADDED ITEMS	7
8.	DATE OF NEXT MEETING	8

Mr. MacLellan, Chair, called the meeting to order at 3:00 p.m.

1. APPROVAL OF MINUTES - March 31, 2004

MOVED by Councillor Sloane, seconded by Mr. Elias Metlej, that the minutes of March 31, 2004 be approved, as circulated. MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

2. APPROVAL OF THE ORDER OF BUSINESS, ADDITIONS AND DELETIONS

There were no changes to the agenda.

3. BUSINESS ARISING OUT OF THE MINUTES

4. DEFERRED BUSINESS

4.1 H00128 - Application for Registration of Memory Lane Heritage Village, Lake Charlotte, NS

C A staff report prepared for Jim Donovan, Manager, Planning Applications, regarding the above, was before the Committee for its consideration.

With the use of overheads, Ms. Maggie Holm, Heritage Planner, presented the report to the Committee, noting the owner wishes the property to be scored as a site. Mr. Gordon Hammond, Chair, Lake Charlotte Heritage Society, briefly addressed the Committee providing background information on each of the buildings.

Mr. MacLellan and Councillor Sloane commended Mr. Hammond for the community effort in this project.

A discussion ensued regarding alternative forms of recognizing historical sites as it was noted there maybe similar applications in the future. Ms. Holm suggested another subcommittee could be struck to examine this issue. She also stated she could confer with Legal Services to see if the Committee has latitude with respect to designation of sites.

The Committee proceeded to evaluate the site with the following results:

**1. Relationship to Important Occasions,
Institutions, Personages, Eras**

Local Importance

20 pts.

2. Relationship to Surrounding Area

Excellent 10 pts.

Total 30 pts.

MOVED by Councillor Harvey, seconded by Mr. Tom Creighton, that the site located at 28 Clam Harbour Road (Memory Lane Heritage Village), be scored a total of 30 points and that the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend to Regional Council that the site be registered under the HRM Heritage Property Program. MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

(Councillor Harvey left the meeting at 3:40 p.m.)

4.2 Evaluation of Properties - Scoring Sheet

C A staff report prepared for Jim Donovan, Manager, Planning Applications, regarding the above, was before the Committee for its consideration.

Ms. Holm presented the report to the Committee noting Legal Services had the following two issues with the document:

- C The Heritage By-Law is based on the Heritage Property Act and not architectural measures. Therefore, perhaps age and history should be given more weight in the scoring process.
- C There was question as to why the cutoff date for registration was 1945 being the concept behind the Act was to preserve things of historic importance before time changes them. Time acts more quickly now and buildings are no longer built with the expectation that they will stand unchanged forever. If newer buildings are not protected now, they will not be around in 50 years to protect (ie. pre-fab houses built after WWII).

In discussion of the criteria, the Committee made the following suggestions:

- C The age cutoff could be changed to 50 years prior to the date of scoring (i.e 1945 up to 50 years ago)
- C The point allocation could be adjusted to assign some value to buildings after 1945.

It was agreed to defer further discussion of this item until later in the meeting after Ms. Arbic arrived as she was on the subcommittee that developed the criteria.

(Mr. MacKinnon left the meeting at this time.)

4.3 Ratification of In Camera Session Item

C This matter was discussed at an In Camera Session held on March 31, 2004 and was now before the Committee for ratification.

Mr. Plaskett advised the Committee that the sub-committee requested the HAC appoint an additional member: Mr. Frank Medjuck to those appointed in March. The Committee agreed and put forth the following motion:

MOVED by Mr. Tom Creighton, seconded by Mr. Mark Pothier, that the following people be appointed to the Barrington Street HCD Steering Committee:

**Craig Sievert (owner)
Susan Kidney (owner)
Scott Colwell (business)
David Garrett (business)
Oliver Nemeskeri (business)
Kevin Keefe (business)
Brenda MacKenzie (public)
Russell Jarvis (public)
Frank Medjuck**

MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

Mr. Plaskett noted Mr. Jarvis was appointed Chair and Mr. Colwell was appointed Vice-Chair.

5. CONSIDERATION OF NEW BUSINESS

5.1 Case 00628 - 5819-37 Cunard St. - Amendment to the MPS - Gary Porter

C A memorandum to the Heritage Advisory Committee from Gary Porter, Planner, regarding the above, was circulated to the Committee.

Mr. Gary Porter, Planner, presented the report to the Committee. Mr. Porter and the proponents responded to questions of the Committee.

(Ms. Arbic took her place at the meeting at 4:05 p.m.)

Mr. Porter noted the finalized report will come back to the Committee before it is forwarded

to Regional Council.

In discussion of the application, the following points were made:

- C The design reflects the major concerns of the immediate community.
- C The consultation process with the residents has been commendable, and the residents have been in direct dialogue with the developer.
- C Some of the issues raised by the residents that are still being addressed are: balconies, location of air intakes and exhaust, parking garage, and landscaping on June Street, etc.

Mr. Porter stated he is looking for input from the Committee as to whether or not it believes the proposed development fits in with the heritage buildings in the area. And, if it does not, that the Committee provide details explaining its position.

In response to concerns of Mr. MacLellan regarding the location of the tower, it was noted the tower was setback on the two residential streets (June Street and Princess Place) in response to concerns expressed by the residents.

Mr. Trites stated the only concern he has was with respect to the size of the main building and the potential dwarfing effect it will have on the smaller buildings. However, he acknowledged that cost was a factor in the decision to include the tower. Mr. Trites also noted there are many cases where new development blends well with heritage properties, and he was generally in support of this proposal.

Mr. Plaskett suggested a different material or colour for the first three storeys, other than brick, could help decrease the massing.

Following further discussion, the Committee was in general consensus of the proposed development, as presented. Mr. Porter noted the final report may be available for the Committee's next meeting.

(Councillor Sloane left the meeting at 4:50 p.m.)

5.2 Heritage Incentive Applications - Dan Norris

- C A memorandum to the Heritage Advisory Committee from Dan Norris, Manager, Heritage Incentives Program, regarding the above, was circulated to the Committee.

Conflict of Interest

As he was a heritage property owner recommended for a heritage incentive grant, Mr. Trites declared a **Conflict of Interest** and did not vote on this matter.

Mr. Norris presented his report regarding Heritage Applications - Spring 2004 to the Committee.

With respect to Section 3 of the report, Requires Review by HAC and/or Council, Mr. Norris noted that he is discussing the possibility of using more traditional materials with the first applicant and will bring a report back to the Committee.

With respect to the NSCAD application for funds for a condition assessment report and building conservation plan, Mr. Norris suggested a grant not be given at this time and the funding be reconsidered for the actual work when it is done. He noted that he received an information package from NSCAD which could be circulated to the Committee. The Committee agreed that the limited funds available should be used for actual restoration work.

A discussion ensued regarding restoration versus regular maintenance. Mr. Norris agreed to bring back some guidelines to tweak the program with respect to this issue for the next meeting.

MOVED by Ms. Andrea Arbic, seconded by Mr. Bill Meagher, that the Heritage Advisory Committee accept the recommendations re: Heritage Applications - Spring 2004, as presented by Mr. Norris. MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

At this time, the Committee continued its discussion with respect to the proposed scoring sheet.

4.2 Evaluation of Properties - Scoring Sheet (cont'd)

With respect to the timeline names in the Age category, Mr. Norris suggested "Founding of Halifax" be changed to "English Colonization" or "Garristown."

A further discussion ensued regarding changes to the date of construction ranges. It was agreed that the item should be deferred to next month to allow Ms. Arbic and Ms. Holm the opportunity to meet and review the document. It was agreed that, in the meantime, any suggestions or questions of the Committee should be referred to Ms. Arbic or Ms. Holm.

6. INFORMATION ITEMS

6.1 Approval Letters - Various Letters

Copies of approval letters for various properties respecting Level 1 reviews were provided to the Committee for its information.

6.2 Extracts from Regional/Community Council Minutes

An extract from the March 23, 2004 Regional Council minutes regarding 1790 Granville Street was provided to the Committee for its information.

7. ADDED ITEMS

There were no added items.

8. DATE OF NEXT MEETING

The date of the next meeting will be May 26, 2004.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 5:30 p.m.

Patti Halliday
Legislative Assistant