

**HERITAGE ADVISORY COMMITTEE
MINUTES
August 27, 2003**

PRESENT:

Mr. Allan MacLellan, Chair
Mr. Tom Creighton, Vice Chair
Councillor Bob Harvey
Dr. Toby Balch
Mr. Dale Hall
Ms. Andrea Arbic
Mr. Jim Trites
Mr. Paul MacKinnon
Ms. Janet Morris

REGRETS:

Mr. Mark Pothier
Ms. Margo Grant

STAFF:

Mr. Jim Donovan, Manager, Planning Applications
Mr. Dan Norris, Manager, Culture and Heritage
Ms. Patti Halliday, Legislative Assistant
Ms. Dorothy Amey, Administrative Support

Table of Contents

1.	APPROVAL OF MINUTES - JULY 23, 2003	3
2.	APPROVAL OF THE ORDER OF BUSINESS, ADDITIONS AND DELETIONS .	3
3.	REPORTS	3
3.1	H00116 - Application for Registration of 2901 Windsor Street, Halifax (The Halifax Forum)	3
3.2	H00109 - Application for Registration of 1274 Hammonds Plains Road, Halifax County (St. James Church Cemetery)	4
3.3	H00110 - Application for Registration of 6247-49 Jubilee Road, Halifax (Buckley's Health Centre)	5
3.4	H00118 - Review of proposed exterior alteration (window replacement) to 1685 Argyle Street	6
3.5	H00119 - Proposed Alterations (window replacements) at 1685 Argyle Street - The Carleton Hotel	7
4.	INFORMATION ITEMS	8
4.1	Approval Letters	8
4.2	Information Report - H00106 - Demolition of 600, 602, 618 and 620 Francklyn Street	8
4.3	Discussion re By-laws and Planning Guidelines/Criteria for Heritage Properties (Andrea Arbic)	8
4.4	Memo - Materials from the July 23, 2003 HAC meeting	8
4.5	Memo - Heritage Sites Evaluation Criteria - Update to Heritage Binders ..	8
4.6	Memo - Statue Proposal - Granville Street Mall	8
4.7	Letter from Margaret MacInnis - Proposed Development - Corner of Cunard and Agricola	8
4.8	Staff response to Letter from Margaret MacInnis	8
4.9	Memo - Change in meeting times for Heritage Advisory Committee	8
5.	ADDED ITEMS	8
5.1	Proposed Heritage Incentives for HRM	8
6.	DATE OF NEXT MEETING	8

1. APPROVAL OF MINUTES - JULY 23, 2003

As he was unable to attend this meeting, Mr. Mark Pothier advised staff he did not vote in favour of the motion to recommend the Francklyn Street properties for registration, and asked that the minutes be amended to reflect that the motion was not unanimous.

Mr. Creighton noted a typographical error on Page 11. The word "compliment" should read "complement."

MOVED by Mr. Jim Trites, seconded by Mr. Dale Hall, that the minutes of July 23, 2003, be approved, as amended. MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

2. APPROVAL OF THE ORDER OF BUSINESS, ADDITIONS AND DELETIONS

The following item was added to the agenda:

5.1 Proposed Heritage Incentives for HRM

3. REPORTS

3.1 H00116 - Application for Registration of 2901 Windsor Street, Halifax (The Halifax Forum)

C A staff report prepared for Paul Dunphy, Director, Planning and Development Services, regarding the above, was before the Committee for its consideration.

Mr. Darryl Kelman, Researcher, presented the heritage research report on the property.

(Ms. Morris took her place at the meeting at 6:45 p.m.)

The Committee proceeded to evaluate 2901 Windsor Street, with the following results:

1. Age

1927 5 points

2. Relationship to Important Occasions, Institutions, Personages, Eras

Provincial Importance 15 points
Local Importance 2 points

3. Relationship to Surrounding Area

Community centre for the area

Building is very compatible with surrounding buildings are area

7 points

4. Aesthetic/Architectural Merit

A lengthy discussion ensued regarding the aesthetic/architectural merit of this building, and the following points were made:

- C About 50% of the bricks are repointed.
 - C The windows were bricked in during the 1960s due to the amount of light coming in and decay in the windows.
 - C Some members believed the brick arena to still be unique as there are no others in the area, even though it does not look like the original building.
 - C The entire property will be registered and, as a result, the modern buildings will be under the umbrella of registration, unless specified otherwise by subdividing the property.
 - C The proponent's intent was to only register the main forum building.
 - C The proponents were encouraged to give consideration to restoring some of the Cobb features in future renovations.
-
- (i) Only or rare example of particular architectural type in Halifax 4 points
 - (ii) Original facade 2 points
 - (iii) Fair example of architectural type: 10 points
Building displays some architectural characteristics worthy of note, and is acceptable from an aesthetic point of view.

MOVED by Andrea Arbic, seconded by Janet Morris, that the Heritage Advisory Committee score 2901 Windsor Street a total of 45 points and recommend to Regional Council that the property be registered under the HRM Heritage Property Program. MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

3.2 H00109 - Application for Registration of 1274 Hammonds Plains Road, Halifax

County (St. James Church Cemetery)

- C A staff report prepared for Paul Dunphy, Director, Planning and Development Services, regarding the above, was before the Committee for its consideration.

Ms. Dorothy Amey, Administrative Support, presented the research report on behalf of Ms. Alfreda Withrow, Researcher.

The Committee proceeded to evaluate 1274 Hammonds Plains Road, Hammonds Plains, with the following results:

1. Relationship to Important Occasions, Institutions, Personages, Eras

Local importance 20 points

2. Relationship to Surrounding area

Good. Site is very compatible with surrounding area 7 points

TOTAL 27 points

Mr. MacLellan suggested it would be nice to have a plaque installed at the cemetery to provide information regarding its history.

MOVED by Mr. Tom Creighton, seconded by Councillor Harvey, that the Heritage Advisory Committee score 1274 Hammonds Plains Road 27 points and recommend to Regional Council that this property be registered under the HRM Heritage Property Program. MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

3.3 H00110 - Application for Registration of 6247-49 Jubilee Road, Halifax (Buckley's Health Centre)

- C A staff report prepared for Paul Dunphy, Director, Planning and Development Services, regarding the above, was before the Committee for its consideration.

Ms. Dorothy Amey, Administrative Support, presented the research report on behalf of Ms. Alfreda Withrow, Researcher.

The Committee proceeded to evaluate 6247-49 Jubilee Road with the following results:

1. Age		
	1902	7 points
2. Relationship to Important Occasions, Institutions, Personages, Eras		
	Local importance	10 points
3. Relationship to surrounding area		
	Good. Building is very compatible with surrounding buildings and area.	7 points
4. Aesthetic/Architectural Merit		
	Good example of architectural type: Building competently displays the major architectural characteristics of the type and is aesthetically pleasing.	15 points
	Original Facade	
	Although there were no historical photos to indicate the original facade, the proponent indicated it was fairly original.	3 points
	Continued commercial use of the property.	5 points
	TOTAL	47 points

MOVED by Councillor Harvey, seconded by Mr. Jim Trites, that the Heritage Advisory Committee score 6247-49 Jubilee Road, Halifax, a total of 47 points and recommend to Regional Council that this property be registered under the HRM Heritage Property Program. MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

3.4 H00118 - Review of proposed exterior alteration (window replacement) to 1685 Argyle Street

- C A staff report prepared for Paul Dunphy, Director, Planning and Development Services, regarding the above, was before the Committee for its consideration.

Mr. Jim Donovan, Manager, Planning Applications, presented the staff report to the Committee, noting staff is recommending approval based on a review of the application in terms of the conservation standards.

A discussion ensued and Mr. Trites stated his only concern is with regard to materials, noting the Committee would be approving the application based on a drawing that does not have a lot of details. He stated he would prefer to see a more detailed design. In response, the applicant stated he could provide an engineering sketch. Mr. MacLellan suggested the Committee could approve the application, pending the submission of a detailed drawing. Mr. Creighton suggested it be deferred to the next meeting.

Rather than hold the applicant up for another month, Mr. MacLellan sketched a proposed design based on the Committee's comments. The following motion was then put forth:

MOVED by Mr. Paul MacKinnon, seconded by Mr. Dale Hall, that the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend approval by staff of the alteration to 1685 Argyle Street, Halifax, as described in the staff report dated August 12, 2003 with the following detailing: that the propane enclosure be completely constructed of 2 x 2 x 3/16" galvanized steel angle, the mullions be 1 x 1/4" galvanized flat steel bar, the security mesh be 1/2" galvanized steel mesh, all supported from two or three galvanized steel hinges, and that the gate frame be painted two coats primer, one finish coat to match the colour of the new proposed windows, the galvanized steel mesh to be painted one coat primer, two coats finish black flat enamel. MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

3.5 H00119 - Proposed Alterations (window replacements) at 1685 Argyle Street - The Carleton Hotel

- C A staff report prepared for Paul Dunphy, Director, Planning and Development Services, regarding the above, was before the Committee for its consideration.

Mr. Donovan presented the staff report to the Committee. A discussion ensued regarding wood versus vinyl windows and whether or not white is an historically appropriate window colour.

Mr. Norris noted a recommendation is coming forth for commercial facade improvements that would apply to this project and may help offset costs. The applicant noted the cost for wood windows would be \$76,000 compared to \$20,000 for vinyl.

It was agreed that the applicant and staff should engage in dialogue about the possibilities of receiving a heritage incentive grant.

MOVED by Mr. Tom Creighton, seconded by Mr. Jim Trites, that this matter be deferred to the next meeting subject to the Committee receiving more technical advice and dialogue taking place between the applicant and staff regarding grants. MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

Due to the late hour, the meeting adjourned at 8:50 p.m. It was agreed to hold a special meeting in the next one to two weeks to deal with the Proposed Heritage Incentives for HRM as well as Case H00119. The following items were not addressed:

4. INFORMATION ITEMS

4.1 Approval Letters

C Approval letters for the following properties were before the Committee for its information:

- 4.1A - 5759 Inglis Street, Halifax
- 4.1B - 5476 Clyde Street, Halifax
- 4.1C - 5308 South Street, Halifax
- 4.1D - 5482 Clyde Street, Halifax
- 4.1E - 5182 Bishop Street, Halifax
- 4.1F - 50 Wentworth Street, Dartmouth.

4.2 Information Report - H00106 - Demolition of 600, 602, 618 and 620 Francklyn Street

4.3 Discussion re By-laws and Planning Guidelines/Criteria for Heritage Properties (Andrea Arbic)

4.4 Memo - Materials from the July 23, 2003 HAC meeting

4.5 Memo - Heritage Sites Evaluation Criteria - Update to Heritage Binders

4.6 Memo - Statue Proposal - Granville Street Mall

4.7 Letter from Margaret MacInnis - Proposed Development - Corner of Cunard and Agricola

4.8 **Staff response to Letter from Margaret MacInnis**

4.9 **Memo - Change in meeting times for Heritage Advisory Committee**

5. **ADDED ITEMS**

5.1 **Proposed Heritage Incentives for HRM**

Deferred to special meeting.

6. **DATE OF NEXT MEETING**

The date of the next regular HAC meeting will be September 24, 2003.

Patti Halliday
Legislative Assistant