#### HALIFAX REGIONAL MUNICIPALITY

#### HERITAGE ADVISORY COMMITTEE MINUTES

December 11, 2013

- PRESENT: Mr. Stephen Terauds, Chair Mr. Nelson Brison Ms. Deborah Larter Ms. Janet Morris Mr. David Houlihan Ms. Emma Sampson Councillor David Hendsbee
- REGRETS: Mr. Richard White Ms. Monica MacDonald, Vice Chair Ms. Sarah Levy
- STAFF: Mr. Seamus McGreal, Heritage Planner Ms. Sheilagh Edmonds, Legislative Assistant Ms. Maggie Holm, Heritage Planner Mr. Lachlan Barber, Legislative Support

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

1.	CALL	TO ORDER	3
		1.1 Election of Vice-Chair	3
2.	APPR	OVAL OF MINUTES	3
3.		OVAL OF THE ORDER OF BUSINESS AND APPROVAL OF ADDITIONS	
4.		NESS ARISING OUT OF THE MINUTES: None	
5.		SIDERATION OF DEFERRED BUSINESS: None	
6.	CORF	RESPONDENCE, PETITIONS & DELEGATIONS	4
	6.1	Correspondence	4
		6.1.1. Correspondence dated November 26, 2013 from Phil Pacey,	
		Heritage Trust	4
	6.2	Petitions: None	4
	6.3	Presentation: None	4
	6.4	Updates from HAC Members - HRM Committees /HAC Sub-committees:	
		None	4
7.	REPC	DRTS	4
	7.1	Staff	4
		7.1.1 Case H00932: Application to Consider 5518 North Street, Halifax,	
		as a Registered Municipal Heritage Property	4
		7.1.2 Case 00393: Substantial Alteration to 1101 South Park Street, Halifax - Dumaresq House, a Registered Municipal Heritage	
		Property	5
		7.1.3 Case 00381: Substantial Alteration to 1877 Hollis Street, Halifax, a	ĩ
		Registered Municipal Heritage Property	
8.	Addeo	d Items	
	8.1	Case H00379: Substantial Alteration to 1124 Robie Street, Halifax,	
		Oakland Lodge, a Registered Municipal Heritage Property.	9
9.	NEXT	MEETING DATE – January 22, 2014 1	
10.		URNMENT	

## 1. CALL TO ORDER

The Chair called the meeting to order at 3:07 p.m. in the Halifax Hall, City Hall, 1841 Argyle Street, Halifax.

3

## 1.1 Election of Vice-Chair

The Chair invited nominations for Vice-Chair of the Committee.

There was discussion among members as to whether it would be possible to postpone the appointment of a Vice-Chair until after the vacancies on the committee are filled. Ms. Edmonds, Legislative Assistant, explained that it would be best to proceed with the appointment because some committee experience is desirable for the Vice-Chair position.

Mr. Nelson nominated Ms. Sampson. Ms. Larter seconded the nomination. Councillor Hendsbee moved to close nominations.

The Chair declared Ms. Sampson Vice-Chair.

## 2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

MOVED by Councillor Hendsbee, seconded by Ms. Sampson, that the minutes of October 23, 2013 be approved. MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

# 3. APPROVAL OF THE ORDER OF BUSINESS AND APPROVAL OF ADDITIONS AND DELETIONS

Addition:

8.1 Case H00379: Substantial Alteration to 1124 Robie Street, Halifax, --Oakland Lodge, a Registered Municipal Heritage Property

The Chair mentioned the addition of a report on Oakland Lodge, Case H00379, and noted that all the reports would be dealt with, time permitting.

MOVED by Ms. Morris, seconded by Mr. Brison, that the agenda, as amended, be approved. MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

- 4. BUSINESS ARISING OUT OF THE MINUTES: None
- 5. CONSIDERATION OF DEFERRED BUSINESS: None

#### 6. CORRESPONDENCE, PETITIONS & DELEGATIONS:

#### 6.1 Correspondence

# 6.1.1. Correspondence dated November 26, 2013 from Phil Pacey, Heritage Trust

4

A letter dated November 26, 2013, regarding Case 17863: Development Agreement – 99 Ochterloney Street, was received from Mr. Phil Pacey on behalf of the Heritage Trust. The committee acknowledged that the correspondence was received.

It was noted that the Public Hearing for this case already took place at Harbour East Community Council.

Councillor Hendsbee suggested forwarding the correspondence to staff.

- 6.2 Petitions: None
- 6.3 **Presentation: None**
- 6.4 Updates from HAC Members HRM Committees /HAC Sub-committees: None
- 7. **REPORTS**:
- 7.1 Staff

## 7.1.1 Case H00932: Application to Consider 5518 North Street, Halifax, as a Registered Municipal Heritage Property

A staff report dated October 29, 2013 was submitted.

The committee members agreed that ample information was available in the report and therefore a presentation was not required.

Mr. McGreal responded to questions. The following points were clarified:

- Any suggestions provided by the committee can be appended to the report when the recommendation goes to Council.
- The relationship to the street is addressed in the report as "proximity to street with no setback from property line."

The committee reviewed the application, evaluating it against the HRM Criteria for Registration of Heritage Buildings and scoring it as follows:

Criterion	Highest Possible Score	Score Awarded
1. Age	25	13
2. a) Relationship to Important Occasions,		
Institutions, Personages or Groups		
OR	20	14
2. b) Important/Unique Architectural Style or Highly		
Representative of an Era		
3. Significance of Architect/Builder	10	7
4. a) Architectural Merit: Construction type/building	10	0
technology		
4. b) Architectural Merit: Style	10	3
5. Architectural Integrity	15	13
6. Relationship to Surrounding Area	10	9
Total	100	59

5

During the evaluation there was some interest expressed by committee members in acknowledging the heritage significance of a collection of buildings in the same style, designed by the same architect, in the vicinity of the property. It was agreed that staff would initiate a process to examine this possibility.

#### MOVED by Ms. Sampson, seconded by Ms. Morris, that the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend that Halifax Regional Council

1. Set a date for a heritage hearing to consider the application; and

2. Approve the registration of 5518 under the HRM Heritage Property Program as shown on Map 1 of the staff report.

#### MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

#### 7.1.2 Case 00393: Substantial Alteration to 1101 South Park Street, Halifax -Dumaresq House, a Registered Municipal Heritage Property

A staff report dated November 7, 2013 was submitted.

Due to time restrictions, Mr. Seamus McGreal, Heritage Planner, provided brief highlights of the prepared presentation.

The proposed development is to extend an earlier addition to transform an alcove into a larger room. The main architectural elements will be preserved and a window will be added. Staff recommends in favour of the proposal.

Mr. McGreal answered questions from the committee members. The property owner was in attendance to provide additional detail.

6

The committee agreed that the proposed addition is very complementary to the character defining elements of the house and that it is architecturally compatible.

MOVED by Councillor Hendsbee, seconded by Mr. Houlihan, that the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend that Halifax Regional Municipality approve the proposed substantial alteration to the Dumaresq House as outlined in Attachments A through C of the staff report.

#### MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

# 7.1.3 Case 00381: Substantial Alteration to 1877 Hollis Street, Halifax, a Registered Municipal Heritage Property.

The staff report dated October 1, 2013 was submitted.

Ms. Maggie Holm, Heritage Planner, presented the proposal and showed historical photos of the building. The following points were highlighted.

- The location of the subject property is highly visible at the entrance to downtown Halifax.
- The building dates from 1841 and has ties to early trade in Halifax, including the first blended tea company to operate in the city.
- It is well known as the Morse's Teas building but was also historically known as the Jerusalem Warehouse.
- After a fire in 1927 additional floors were added to the building. Today it retains Georgian architectural style and materials. The former pitched roof was visible on the south side until recently when it was covered by a new construction. Its facades are ironstone with granite trim.
- Its heritage value included 2 large Morse's Teas signs which were recently painted over.
- The proposal involves painting a new sign reading "Jerusalem Warehouse" in brick coloured paint on the Lower Water Street façade and reserving the sign bands on the north and west facades for tenant use. The new arrangement would allow the building to evolve with changing uses.

Ms. Holm responded to questions.

The Chair asked when the Morse's Teas signs were painted. Ms. Holm advised that the earliest records of the signs are in photos from the 1960s.

Mr. Houlihan passed around a photo dated 1920s with Morse's Teas signs. He recounted personal connections to early businesses occupying the building. He stated that Morse's Teas occupied the building as of 1910.

Councillor Hendsbee asked if the heritage plaque would need to be changed. Ms. Holm replied that building names change over time with different uses and clarified that the plaque would not need to be changed.

7

The Chair asked for clarification of the legal ramifications of the fact that the sign, a character-defining element, was altered without approval. Ms. Holm explained that this question had been put aside in light of the proposal before the committee.

Mr. Hendsbee asked for clarification about the reason for placing the Jerusalem Warehouse sign on the Lower Water Street façade and allowing other signs on the other façades. Ms. Holm clarified that there are limitations on façade signage on buildings in downtown.

Ms. Larter asked why the applicant wished to change the sign to Jerusalem Warehouse. Ms. Holm explained that this was their preference.

Ms. Sampson asked whether the sign bands are included in the Statement of Significance for the building. Ms. Holm advised that they are.

Following questions of clarification, the Chair asked for the recommendation to be put on the floor in order that the Committee could then enter a discussion.

#### MOVED by Ms. Morris, seconded by Councillor Hendsbee that the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend that Halifax Regional Council approve the proposed substantial alteration to 1877 Hollis Street, Halifax, as outlined in Attachment A of the October 1, 2013 staff report.

The Committee members expressed agreement that the Morse's Teas signs held heritage value and were a well-known landmark in the downtown landscape. There was thus some uncertainty about painting the name "Jerusalem Warehouse" on one of the facades. There was a sense among committee members that although the name is not historically inaccurate it doesn't reflect the heritage value of the building and may amount to a false sense of historical development.

Councillor Hendsbee said that he appreciates the connection to history in the name "Jerusalem Warehouse" but worried about its religious connotations.

The Chair pointed out that an appropriate font would be required.

Ms. Larter asked for clarification about the options before the Committee. Ms. Holm explained that Council is looking for a recommendation from the HAC on the matter. Councillor Hendsbee stated that this issue is analogous to a naming rights conflict.

The Chair suggested that the Morse's Teas sign might be restored on one sign band and that the others be allowed to change. He suggested the bands should be historically sensitive but can advertise current tenants. Ms. Larter suggested that the Morse's Teas would be most appropriate on the north side.

8

Uncertainty was expressed about the status of the two sign bands that would be used for current tenants. Ms. Holm clarified that all the signs would reproduce the historical font. She added that the north and west-facing signs would be governed by downtown LUB.

The Chair invited the Committee to express their views on the two elements of the proposal: 1) to provide painted signage for future tenants on 2 sides; and 2) to paint Jerusalem Warehouse on one side instead of Morse's Teas.

Ms. Morris said that it is difficult to comment on the tenant signs without further knowledge of who the tenants will be. She went on to say that she has no major difficulties with the proposal but added that it would be good to maintain Morse's Teas signage somewhere on the building.

Other members of the committee expressed a preference for the Morse's Teas sign but also an understanding of the perspective of the applicant.

Councillor Hendsbee suggested the addition of a photo of the old signs to a plaque on the building. Staff clarified that this could be appended to the recommendation in order to assist the public in understanding the history of the building. Mr. Nelson expressed support for this idea.

Ms. Sampson stated that she would prefer blank walls over the Jerusalem Warehouse sign.

The Chair asked Ms. Edmonds for clarification on the process. She suggested amending the motion to include conditions.

Ms. Holm provided a clarification on an earlier point: the municipal heritage property plaque indicates the Jerusalem Warehouse name. Another plaque created by NSCAD and the province bears the Morse's Teas name.

The Chair confirmed Councillor Hendsbee's proposed amendment to the motion.

MOVED by Councillor Hendsbee, seconded by Ms. Morris, to amend the motion to include requiring the owner to provide a graphic depiction of the building under its format with the Morse's Teas signage in a manner that is visible to the public.

#### THE AMENDMENT WAS PUT AND DEFEATED.

The Chair suggested to proceeding with the staff recommendation with an amendment to require the proposed east-facing sign band to read Morse's Teas instead of

Jerusalem Warehouse. All other elements of the recommendation would be retained. This amendment was moved by Ms. Sampson.

9

MOVED by Ms. Sampson, seconded by Councillor Hendsbee, that the motion be amended require that instead of 'Jerusalem Warehouse', the painted sign say Morse's Tea on one panel.

#### THE AMENDMENT WAS PUT AND PASSED.

The Chair called for a vote on the amended motion which now reads:

MOVED by Ms. Morris, seconded by Councillor Hendsbee that the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend that Halifax Regional Council approve the proposed substantial alteration to 1877 Hollis Street, Halifax, as outlined in Attachment A of the October 1, 2013 staff report with the condition that, instead of 'Jerusalem Warehouse', the painted sign say Morse's Tea on one panel.

## MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

#### 8. Added Items

8.1 Case H00379: Substantial Alteration to 1124 Robie Street, Halifax, --Oakland Lodge, a Registered Municipal Heritage Property.

A staff report dated December 2, 2013 was submitted.

A discussion of the case highlighted the following points:

- The proposed substantial alteration is to subdivide the property. The deregistration of the adjoining property would come to the committee at a later date. Mr. McGreal pointed out that subdivision of large lots is a historical pattern of development that continues in many parts of the city. The entire stone wall along the street will remain registered with the heritage property.
- An earlier proposal to create a park on a small portion of the property on the street side of the stone wall was deemed by staff to be not feasible.
- Plans for the adjoining lot are not available but would proceed as an as-of-right development, not through a development agreement. Although the committee members would have liked to see construction plans for the adjoining lot, there is no mechanism in the Heritage Property Act to request them.
- Committee members expressed the view that any possible new construction on an adjoining lot should be historically sensitive and complementary to the heritage property.

#### MOVED by Councillor Hendsbee, seconded by Mr. Brison, that the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend that Halifax Regional Council approve the

proposed substantial alteration to the Oakland Lodge as identified in Attachment A of the staff report.

MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

- 9. NEXT MEETING DATE January 22, 2014.
- 10. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 5:12 p.m.

Lachlan Barber Legislative Support