

**HERITAGE ADVISORY COMMITTEE**

**May 25, 2005**

**MINUTES**

**PRESENT:**

Mr. Tom Creighton, Chair  
Councillor Dawn Sloane  
Councillor Bob Harvey  
Mr. Clarence Butler  
Mr. Paul MacKinnon  
Mr. Bill Meagher  
Mr. Mark Pothier  
Mr. Caley MacLennan  
Mr. Elias Metlej  
Mr. Ralston MacDonnell

**REGRETS:**

Ms. Andrea Arbic, Vice Chair  
Mr. Bill Mont

**STAFF:**

Mr. Bill Plaskett, Heritage Conservation Planner  
Mr. Dan Norris, Manager, Culture and Heritage  
Ms. Dorothy Amey, Administrative Support  
Ms. Stephanie Parsons, Legislative Assistant

**Table of Contents**

1.	APPROVAL OF MINUTES - April 27, 2005 .....	3
2.	APPROVAL OF THE ORDER OF BUSINESS, ADDITIONS AND DELETIONS .	3
3.	BUSINESS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES .....	3
4.	DEFERRED ITEMS: .....	3
4.1	Heritage Incentive Grant application - 1325 Hollis Street .....	3
4.2	Presentation - Beechville Community Association .....	3
5.	NEW BUSINESS .....	3
5.1	H00163 - Application for Registration of William Black Memorial United Church, 10515 Peggys's Cove Road. ....	3
5.2	H00153 - Application for Deregistration of 78 Shore Road, Dartmouth ...	5
5.3	H00176 - Application for alternations at 1663 Argyle Street .....	6
6.	UPDATES .....	6
6.1	Presentation of Civic Heritage Signs Package .....	6
7.	INFORMATION ITEMS .....	7
7.1	Approval Letters .....	7
7.2	Extracts from Regional/Community Council Minutes .....	7
7.3	Heritage Incentive Grant Application Practices .....	7
7.4	Letter from Mainland South Heritage Society .....	7
8.	ADDED ITEMS .....	7
9.	ADJOURNMENT .....	7

The Chair called the meeting to order at 3:05 p.m.

**1. APPROVAL OF MINUTES - April 27, 2005**

**MOVED by Councillor Dawn Sloane, seconded by Mr. Caley MacLennan, that the minutes of April 27, 2005, be approved. MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.**

**2. APPROVAL OF THE ORDER OF BUSINESS, ADDITIONS AND DELETIONS**

The Order of Business was accepted.

**3. BUSINESS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES - NONE**

**4. DEFERRED ITEMS**

**4.1 Heritage Incentive Grant application - 1325 Hollis Street**

- A memo dated April 13, 2005 was before the Committee for consideration.

Mr. Bill Plaskett provided an overview of the memo. He noted that the Applicant is requesting that the Committee review the original application as it was determined by the Committee that asphalt shingles were not historically correct on the building and therefore does not meet the eligibility requirements of the program. He also advised that the intent of the incentive program is to require the use of historical materials but the Committee has approved applications that did not use historical materials.

He also advised that Ms. Maggie Holm is recommending that the Committee approve the application based on past practices.

**MOVED by Councillor Sloane, seconded by Mr. Clarence Butler, that the Heritage Advisory Committee approve Application # 66 at 50% of cost up to \$10,000. MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.**

**4.2 Presentation - Beechville Community Association**

Mr. Bill Plaskett advised the Committee that the ownership of the path is in question. The Committee recommended that staff advise the Beechville Community Association to submit an application for the registration of the Beechville United Church and Cemetery.

**5. CONSIDERATION OF NEW BUSINESS**

**5.1 H00163 - Application for Registration of William Black Memorial United Church, 10515 Peggys's Cove Road**

C A staff report dated May 2, 2005, was before the Committee for consideration.

Ms. Alfreda Withrow provided a historical overview of the William Black Memorial Church. It was noted that:

- the church was erected in 1823
- it is a provincially registered property

In response to various questions from the Committee Ms. Withrow advised that the Church was provincially registered in the 1990's and that the tower was added in 1953.

**Scoring Summary**

<b>Criterion</b>	<b>Score</b>	<b>Comment</b>
1. Age	20	1786-1830
2. A) Relationship to Important Occasions, Institutions, Personages or Groups OR 2. B) Important/Unique Architectural Style or Highly Representative of an Era	10	Option A Provincially/ Moderately related to specific association with important occasions, institutions, personages and groups
3. Significance of Architect/Builder	3	Locally Significant
4. A) Architectural Merit: Construction type/building technology	6	Moderately rare/early example
4. B) Architectural Merit: Style	6	Moderately rare/early example
5. Architectural Integrity	5	Major Changes
6. Relationship to Surrounding Area	8	The building is an important architectural asset contributing to the heritage character of the surrounding area.
<b>Total</b>	<b>58</b>	

**MOVED by Mr. Mark Pothier, seconded by Mr. Ralston MacDonnell, that the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend that Regional Council approve application H00163,**

**as proposed in the staff report dated May 2, 2005, for the registration of William Black Memorial United Church, 10515 Peggys's Cove Road. MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.**

**5.2 H00153 - Application for Deregistration of 78 Shore Road, Dartmouth**

C A staff report dated May 11, 2005, was before the Committee for its consideration.

Ms. Bill Plaskett, Planner reviewed the application as presented in the report.

It was noted that:

- the application is based on the recent discovery that extensive structural repairs need to be done and that the property owners are financially unable to bear the cost of the repairs
- staff explored possible solutions which could correct the problems and retain the building
- staff recommends in favour of deregistration

In response to questions from the Committee the Applicant advised that:

- there is a retaining wall behind the house
- three contractors conducted an assessment of the house and determined that the foundation, sills and two chimneys need to be replaced and advised that it was not cost effective to repair
- the house has not officially been declared structurally unsafe
- he has not received a quote on demolition cost
- relocating the house to build a new foundation is too costly
- Ms. Holm advised that the maximum support that the Heritage Advisory Committee can provide is \$10,000

In response to Mr. MacDonnell, Mr. Plaskett advised that the house was registered based on age and style. Mr. MacDonnell also commented that it is difficult to support an application for de-registration that goes against the principle of Heritage Preservation.

The Chair advised the Committee that if the application is refused it may trigger a demolition application. Mr. MacDonnell commented more information is required before a decision can be made.

In response to further questions by the Committee the Applicant also advised that:

- An HRM Building Official confirmed the contractor's assessment of the structural repairs that are required and that the foundation needs to be replaced.

- He has no concerns about having a Conservation Architect examine the building as long it is not at his expense.
- Ms. Holm has already investigated potential alternatives and had advised him that there were resources available to have a conservation study done.

Mr. Plaskett advised that demolition would cost approximately \$16,400 and construction would cost approximately \$100,000. The cost to fix the house is estimated at \$85,000. Mr. MacDonnell commented that the application must be judged on the principles of heritage and not on the best value of the land.

Councillor Sloane commented that there maybe other organizations such as Heritage Trust who may be able to provide assistance.

The Chair suggested that the Committee make a recommendation to Regional Council to approve \$1,000 for a Conservation Plan for the building.

After further discussion the following motion was placed:

**MOVED by Councillor Sloane, seconded by Mr. MacDonnell that the Heritage Advisory Committee defer this application for thirty days and that staff explore alternative options for funding assistance with local and provincial heritage groups. MOTION PUT AND PASSED.**

### **5.3 H00176 - Application for alternations at 1685 Argyle Street**

- A staff report dated May 16, 2005, was before the Committee for its consideration.

Mr. Plaskett reviewed the application as per the staff report.

**MOVED by Mr. MacDonnell, seconded by Mr. Pothier, that the Heritage Advisory Committee approve the alterations to 1685 Argyle Street, as proposed in the staff report dated May 16, 2005. MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.**

## **6. UPDATES**

### **6.1 Presentation of Civic Heritage Signs Package Dan Norris**

- An information report entitled "Interpretive Signage " was before the Committee for informational purposes.

Mr. Dan Norris, Manager, Culture and Heritage, advised the Committee that HRM has taken steps to provide more information on the properties that it owns. Interpretive signage is

intended to offer visitors and residents an opportunity to learn more about the natural and man-made elements where the Interpretive Signage is located.

He advised that the Millennium “marker of distinction” was originally developed by the Halifax Foundation. These markers identify people, places or events of local historical significance. They are typically mounted on Nova Scotia stone.

The general interpretive panel is made of aluminum, fibreglass or steel panels and will be used to identify sites of historical significance or provide interpretation of natural or man-made site elements. The general interpretive panel will include pictures.

The Chair thanked Mr. Norris for his presentation.

## **7.0 INFORMATION ITEMS**

### **7.1 Approval Letters**

Various approval letters were provided to the Committee for its information.

### **7.2 Extracts from Regional/Community Council Minutes - NONE**

### **7.3 Heritage Incentive Grant Applications Practices**

Mr. Plaskett advised that the report was not available.

### **7.4 Letter from the Mainland South Heritage Society**

No discussion.

## **8. ADDED ITEMS**

Mr. MacDonnell advised the Committee that there has been a call for representation on the Provincial Heritage Strategy Committee.

The Chair encouraged members of the Heritage Advisory Committee to apply.

In response to Mr. MacDonnell, Mr. Plaskett advised that the Heritage Management Plan Concept will be brought forward at the next meeting.

## **9. ADJOURNMENT**

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 4:45 p.m.

Stephanie Parsons  
Legislative Assistant