

HALIFAX REGIONAL MUNICIPALITY

**HERITAGE ADVISORY COMMITTEE
MINUTES
JUNE 25, 2003**

- PRESENT:**
- Mr. Allan MacLellan, Chair
 - Mr. Tom Creighton, Vice Chair
 - Councillor Bob Harvey
 - Ms. Janet Morris
 - Ms. Margo Grant
 - Dr. Toby Balch
 - Mr. Mark Pothier
 - Mr. Paul MacKinnon
 - Ms. Andrea Arbic
- ABSENT:**
- Councillor Sue Uteck (Regrets)
 - Mr. Jim Trites (Regrets)
 - Mr. Dale Hall
- STAFF:**
- Mr. Kevin Barrett, Heritage Planner
 - Ms. Holly Richardson, Planner
 - Ms. Randa James, Planner
 - Ms. Patti Halliday, Legislative Assistant

Table of Contents

1.	APPROVAL OF MINUTES - MAY 28, 2003	3
2.	APPROVAL OF THE ORDER OF BUSINESS, ADDITIONS AND DELETIONS	3
3.	REPORTS	3
3.1	H00105 - Application for Registration of Beechville United Baptist Church	3
3.2	H00106 - Application for Registration of 600-620 Francklyn Street, School of Theology Properties	5
3.3	H00111 - Proposed Alterations to 85 Fairbanks Street, Dartmouth	5
3.4	H00112 - Proposed Alterations to 5145 Morris Street, Halifax	5
3.5	H00113 - Proposed Alterations to 1252 Queen Street, Halifax	6
4.	PROJECT REVIEWS	7
4.1	Case 00494 - Review Plans for 5251 South Street	7
5.	BARRINGTON STREET CONSERVATION DISTRICT	8
5.1	H00102 - Barrington Street Conservation District - Update	8
6.	INFORMATION ITEMS	8
6.1	Approval Letters	8
6.2	Call for Proposals for Restoration and Redevelopment of Greenvale School, 130 Ochterloney Street, Dartmouth	8
6.3	Notice - Public Information Meeting on Wednesday July 2, 2003 - Case 00527 1230 Barrington Street	8
6.4	Memo - Parking at Grand Parade	9
6.5	Province of Nova Scotia - Heritage Grant Program 2003-2004	9
7.	ADDED ITEMS	9
7.1	Proposed Heritage Incentive Program: Recommendations by Heritage Incentives Sub-Committee	9
8.	DATE OF NEXT MEETING	10

Mr. MacLellan, Chair, called the meeting to order at 3:00 p.m.

1. APPROVAL OF MINUTES - MAY 28, 2003

MOVED by Ms. Janet Morris, seconded by Mr. Tom Creighton, that the minutes of May 28, 2003, be approved, as circulated. MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

2. APPROVAL OF THE ORDER OF BUSINESS, ADDITIONS AND DELETIONS

The Committee agreed to the following changes to the agenda:

The following item was deferred until the next meeting:

- 3.2 H00106 - Application for Registration of 600-620 Francklyn Street, School of Theology Properties

The following item was added to the agenda:

- 7.1 Proposed Heritage Incentive Program: Recommendations by Heritage Incentives Sub-Committee

3. REPORTS

3.1 H00105 - Application for Registration of Beechville United Baptist Church

- C A staff report prepared for Jim Donovan, Manager, Planning Applications, regarding the above, was before the Committee for its consideration.

Mr. Kevin Barrett, Heritage Planner, presented the report to the Committee.

In response to a question of Ms. Morris regarding registering pathways, Mr. Barrett advised that he was not certain a pathway has been registered in the past, BUT confirmation was received from the Province that it is permissible for the Committee to consider such a registration.

Responding to a question of Dr. Balch, Mr. Barrett stated that, at the next step of the process, a description of the area will be provided so in the future the areas registered will be clear.

Mr. Creighton inquired if it is possible for the Committee to evaluate the application based on the history of the property rather than the building. Mr. Barrett responded that the property could be considered the site in terms of the evaluation. He noted the cemetery is also a

feature of the site that can be taken into consideration. If the property was to be registered, Mr. Barrett stated the plaque could be placed on the building or another type of marker may be explored.

Mr. MacLellan noted heritage buildings and heritage sites should be differentiated in terms of evaluation for registration.

For the purpose of this application, the Committee agreed that, for this particular case only, the Committee would accept the scoring of a site rather than the building for the purpose of evaluation of this property. Mr. Barrett noted the evaluation criteria states "properties" which would include more than just the building, and the cemetery and the use of the land could also be evaluated.

It was agreed that the criteria regarding quality of architectural type be omitted for this evaluation as it is not relevant to this application. Also, that aesthetic/architectural merit be changed to aesthetic merit.

An evaluation of the Beechville United Baptist Church ensued, with the following results:

	<u>Criteria</u>	<u>Points</u>
1.	Age 1844	12
2.	Relationship to Important Occasions, Institutions, Personages Local Importance	20
3.	Relationship to surrounding area Good	7
4.	Aesthetic Merit Only or rare example in local area (church by lake used for baptisms)	10
5.	Quality of architectural type	n/a
6.	Extra Points	15

MOVED by Councillor Bob Harvey, seconded by Ms. Andrea Arbic, that the Heritage

Advisory Committee recommend to Regional Council that the Beechville United Baptist Church, Cemetery and pathway be scored a total of 64 points and be recommended to Regional Council to be registered under the HRM Heritage Property Program. MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

MOVED by Dr. Toby Balch, seconded by Ms. Andrea Arbic, that the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend that staff make the harmonization of all of the former municipal units' heritage property evaluation criteria a priority so the Committee has proper evaluation sheets for buildings and a separate evaluation system be developed for heritage sites throughout HRM. MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

3.2 H00106 - Application for Registration of 600-620 Francklyn Street, School of Theology Properties

During Approval of the Order of Business, this item was deferred.

3.3 H00111 - Proposed Alterations to 85 Fairbanks Street, Dartmouth

C A staff report prepared for Jim Donovan, Manager, Planning Applications, regarding the above, was before the Committee for its consideration.

Mr. Barrett presented the report to the Committee, noting staff is recommending approval of the proposed alterations to 85 Fairbanks Street as it meets the Building Conservation Standards.

MOVED by Mr. Paul McKinnon, seconded by Mr. Tom Creighton, that the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend that staff approve the alterations to 85 Fairbanks Street, Dartmouth, as proposed in the staff report dated June 10, 2003. MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

3.4 H00112 - Proposed Alterations to 5145 Morris Street, Halifax

C A staff report prepared for Jim Donovan, Manager, Planning Applications, regarding the above, was before the Committee for its consideration.

Mr. Barrett presented the staff report to the Committee, noting staff is recommending that the Committee not approve the proposed alterations to 5145 Morris Street, Halifax, as the appearance of the rear facade of the building will not be maintained. He noted that should the applicant wish to consider installing a hung vinyl window (three over six) to match an

existing window to the right of the opening, staff would support such a proposal, even with the reduction of the original six over six window.

Ms. Morris suggested a compromise may be to install an awning type window where the top is fixed and the bottom cranks out. In response, Mr. Hiep Nguyen explained his reasons for wanting a casement window, which were detailed in the staff report. He noted that the window is on the rear of the building, not on street level, and is blocked by the adjacent building.

Mr. Barrett noted the applicant has also submitted an application for a heritage incentive grant for financial assistance for window replacement. He stated that it is staff's view that if it is to be replaced it should be hung window so the style would be consistent with other windows on the building and in the area.

Mr. Pothier stated the difference in cost for an awning type window and a casement window would be marginal and an awning type would achieve the benefits the applicant is seeking. Mr. Barrett stated staff would support such a window. The applicant stated if he cannot install a casement window, he will not change it. Mr. Barrett suggested the Committee could approve the awning type window and staff could meet with the applicant to discuss this option further.

MOVED by Ms. Andrea Arbic, seconded by Mr. Mark Pothier, that the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend the proponent be permitted to install an awning type window (three over six pattern) and that staff meet with him to discuss this option further. MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

3.5 H00113 - Proposed Alterations to 1252 Queen Street, Halifax

C A staff report prepared for Jim Donovan, Manager, Planning Applications, regarding the above, was before the Committee for its consideration.

Mr. Kevin Barrett, Heritage Planner, presented the report to the Committee, noting staff is recommending approval of the alterations, as proposed in the staff report dated June 16, 2003.

Dr. Balch suggested perhaps the lattice should have a vertical grid to be more historically accurate. Mr. Barrett responded the Committee could include this in its recommendation.

In response to a question of Mr. Creighton regarding the transom, Mr. Barrett stated it could be left where it is and blocked off from the inside, or it could be relocated above the new door that is being installed on the back facade. Mr. Creighton suggested the existing transom could be left to provide an older characteristic, and that a transom also be added above the

new door. Mr. Pothier stated he disagreed with keeping the existing transom as it has no functionality.

Following a brief discussion regarding the transom, the following motion was put on the floor:

MOVED by Ms. Margo Grant, seconded by Ms. Janet Morris, that the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend approval of the alterations to 1252 Queen Street, Halifax, as proposed in the staff report dated June 16, 2003 and with the suggestion of using vertical grid lattice work and that the transom be retained in its current configuration. MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

(Ms. Arbic eft meeting at 4:05 p.m.)

4. PROJECT REVIEWS

4.1 Case 00494 - Review Plans for 5251 South Street

C A staff report prepared for Paul Dunphy, Director, Planning and Development Services, regarding the above, was before the Committee for its consideration.

Ms. Randa James, Planner, presented the report to the Committee.

Ms. James, Mr. Barrett, and Mr. Louis Lawen, Rockstone Investments Limited, responded to questions of the Committee making the following points:

- C Fire damaged the front portion of the top two floors of the building.
- C The original building was a two storey home, and the mansard roof was an addition to the building. There have also been six more additions over the years.
- C This matter is before the HAC to address the development agreement component and to comment on aesthetics, scale, design, relationship to adjacent building, etc.

Several members of the Committee expressed concern with the large size of the building.

Ms. Morris stated this buildings has true historic interest, and she suggested the front facade be maintained. In response, Mr. Lawen stated the reasons why this building cannot be restored were detailed in depth at the public information meeting. One of the main reasons was safety. Mr. Barrett noted this is not a registered heritage building, and he suggested perhaps a plaque or interpretive panel may be another way to preserve the history of the building. Mr. Lawen stated he intends to create some form of history in the lobby of the building, but noted he would not have any objection to an outside plaque as well. Councillor Harvey expressed concern that encouraging the maintaining of the facade made lead to a

situation similar to Garden Crest.

MOVED by Councillor Bob Harvey, seconded by Mr. Mark Pothier, that the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend that the Peninsula Community Council approve the proposed development agreement for 5251 South Street, pursuant to the Heritage Property Act, contingent upon the attached amendments, Attachment III to the staff report dated June 19, 2003, being adopted by Regional Council and becoming effective pursuant to the requirements of the Municipal Government Act. MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

5. BARRINGTON STREET CONSERVATION DISTRICT

5.1 H00102 - Barrington Street Conservation District - Update

Mr. Kevin Barrett provided the Committee with an update regarding the Barrington Street Conservation District, noting Regional Council approved the HAC's recommendation and staff will be moving forward with it. Mr. Barrett noted one member from the general public and one member from the Business Commission have been added to the Steering Committee.

6. INFORMATION ITEMS

6.1 Approval Letters

Approval letters for the following properties were before the Committee for its information:

- C 471 Poplar Drive, Cole Harbour
- C 1260-64 Queen Street
- C 1903 Barrington Street
- C 37 Pleasant Street, Dartmouth
- C 1581 Barrington Street
- C 2068 Brunswick Street
- C 5677 Inglis Street
- C 5171 George Street

6.2 Call for Proposals for Restoration and Redevelopment of Greenvale School, 130 Ochterloney Street, Dartmouth

A copy of RFP 03-013, To Purchase, Restore and Redevelop Municipally Owned Heritage Property, Greenvale School property, 130 Ochterloney Street, Dartmouth, was provided to the Committee for its information. Mr. Barrett noted the RFP included a clause which states that the purchaser waives the right of de-registration and demolition. The Committee briefly

discussed the RFP. With respect to the pre-submission conference and whether or not members of the public and the HAC are permitted to attend, Mr. Barrett stated it is his understanding that it is an open meeting, but suggested that anyone interested in attending contact Mitch Dickey, Planner, to confirm.

**6.3 Notice - Public Information Meeting on Wednesday July 2, 2003 - Case 00527
1230 Barrington Street**

A notice of the Public Information Meeting to be held on Wednesday, July 2, 2003, regarding Case 00527 - 1230 Barrington Street, was before the Committee for its information. Mr. Barrett noted a revised proposal has been received which includes preservation of the back cottage.

6.4 Memo - Parking at Grand Parade

A memorandum regarding parking at Grand Parade was before the Committee for its information.

6.5 Province of Nova Scotia - Heritage Grant Program 2003-2004

A memorandum from Mr. Peter Newbould, Acting Manager, Heritage Property Program, Nova Scotia Tourism and Culture, regarding the above, was before the Committee for its information.

7. ADDED ITEMS

7.1 Proposed Heritage Incentive Program: Recommendations by Heritage Incentives Sub-Committee

C A memorandum from Dan Norris, Manager, Culture & Heritage, regarding the above, was circulated to the Committee for its consideration.

As Mr. Norris had to leave the meeting early, Dr. Balch presented this item to the Committee on his behalf.

Dr. Balch noted the sub-committee met three times during which time a lot of information was received and reviewed and the members provided Mr. Norris with some recommendations.

Mr. Norris reviewed these recommendations and, as a result, he developed the five point plan for next steps which were included in his report.

Several Committee members expressed concern that the points did not include a lot of

specifics or details. Following a brief discussion, it was suggested that the sub-committee should work on the first point (residential incentives) and come back to the HAC in a specified time period with some details to show exactly how the program should work.

(Mr. Pothier left the meeting at 5:05 p.m.)

Dr. Balch stated the sub-committee members could arrange to meet with Mr. Norris to work on this suggestion and bring something back to the next HAC meeting. Due to the late hour, Mr. MacLellan suggested Committee members could forward further comments on the issue to the subcommittee members via email for their consideration. He also suggested that perhaps it might be appropriate for other staff members and/or pertinent departments to be involved in the discussion. Dr. Balch suggested, for the next HAC meeting, the sub-committee could meet, discuss and comment on the details of the application, add that portion to the report and present it to the HAC at its next meeting, as well as attempt to resolve any of the structural issues that the Committee may be concerned about. The Committee agreed with this suggestion and put forth the following motion:

MOVED by Mr. Paul McKinnon, seconded by Councillor Bob Harvey, that the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend that the sub-committee meet with Mr. Dan Norris to work on the details of Point 1 of the Proposed Five Point Program, Residential Incentives, and report back to next Heritage Advisory Committee meeting (July 23, 2003). MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

8. DATE OF NEXT MEETING

Mr. Barrett stated there may be a need for a special HAC session in the evening on July 9, 2003 to deal with the Brewery Market development agreement. Committee members will be advised once this is confirmed. The date of the next regular meeting will be July 23, 2003.

In response to a question of Mr. Creighton inquiring if there has been any progress on demolition controls, Mr. Barrett advised the Committee that there will be a roundtable discussion with staff around the Province to discuss the Heritage Act.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 5:20 p.m.

Patti Halliday
Legislative Assistant

