

HALIFAX REGIONAL MUNICIPALITY

HALIFAX REGIONAL COUNCIL COMMITTEE-OF-THE-WHOLE MINUTES April 1, 1997

PRESENT: Mayor Walter Fitzgerald
Deputy Mayor Jack Greenough
Councillors: Bill Dooks
Gordon R. Snow
David Hendsbee
Ron Cooper
Harry McInroy
Condo Sarto
Bruce Hetherington
Clint Schofield
John Cunningham
Graham L. Downey
Larry Uteck
Howard Epstein
Russell Walker
Bill Stone
Ron Hanson
Stephen Adams
Barry Barnet
Bob Harvey
Peter Kelly
Reg Rankin
Jack Mitchell

REGRETS: Councillor: Jerry Blumenthal

STAFF MEMBERS: Mr. Ken Meech, Chief Administrative Officer
Mr. Wayne Anstey, Municipal Solicitor
Ms. Vi Carmichael, Municipal Clerk
Ms. Patti Halliday, Assistant Municipal Clerk
Ms. Jane Nauss, Assistant Municipal Clerk

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. COMPOST BINS 3

 1.1 Request for Proposal #96-165 - Source Separated Organic
 Collection Containers 3

 1.2 Public Presentations 6

 1.2.1 Lorretta J. Smith 6

 1.2.2 Don Wright 6

 1.2.3 Michael Matthews 6

 1.1 Request for Proposal #96-165 - Source Separated Organic
 Collection Containers (con't) 7

Mayor Fitzgerald called the meeting to order at 3:00 p.m.

1. COMPOST BINS

1.1 Request for Proposal #96-165 - Source Separated Organic Collection Containers

- A staff report prepared for George McLellan, Commissioner of Regional Operations regarding the Request for Proposal #96-165 - Source Separated Organic Collection Containers, was before Council for discussion.
- Copies of the staff presentation were circulated as well as correspondence from Mr. David Wimberley.

Mr. Jim Bauld, Manager, Solid Waste, and Mr. Ray Halsey, Technical Manager, Engineering Services, made a presentation to Council regarding the events leading to the container recommendation. Highlights of the presentation included the following:

- Community Stakeholder Committee (CSC) Objectives
- CSC Strategy on Organics
- Procurement Process - Approval of Evaluation Criteria, Respondents, Stage 1 Evaluation and development of short-list, Stage 2 Evaluation
- Issues Raised by Council - Cost & Method of Payment, Size, Exemptions, Local Content, Choice
- Container Results in Other Jurisdictions
- Summary
- Recommended Action
- Incremental System Costs - Carts vs. Bags

Councillor Hendsbee stated he supports the CSC Strategy, the staff recommendation and the process. He left the meeting at this time to participate in the public tax demonstration being held at the Halifax and Dartmouth Ferry Terminals.

Councillor Walker stated he did not want to see the carts paid for through the tax rate. In reviewing the questions in Appendix 1 of the report, Councillor Walker made the following comments:

- Question #2 - The number of tractor-trailer loads that will be required to deliver the carts will probably be more than 280.
- Question #6 - How many people were exempt in the pilot program, how long were the driveways, and what policy was in place?
- Question #7 - Four weeks ago, Council agreed to test pilot a smaller cart. Why this is not being done sooner?
- Question #10 - How will the billing will administered if it is determined later that more carts are needed for a building?
- Question #11 - The report should clearly state residents cannot use another

container.

- Question #13 - It is not recommended that the carts be cleaned.
- Question #14 - The resident will not own the cart as it will belong to the property.

Councillor Walker noted the time line for the project is now November 1, 1998, and questioned the rush to make a decision.

Councillor Stone addressed Council with the following statements:

! This presentation should have been made to Council earlier.

Mr. Halsey agreed, in hindsight, this is what should have happened. However, prior to the SWRAC meeting, the document became public and the media picked up on the cost of the cart. The issue of payment was not part of this report and was to be brought back at a later date.

! Councillor Stone asked if the bags were eliminated at Stage 1 due to the cost factor.

Mr. Halsey replied this was a major consideration, and Appendix 2 of the report details the evaluation criteria.

! Councillor Stone stated there are a number of people who currently compost and do not have any organic waste.

Mr. Halsey replied if anyone can demonstrate they have no organic waste, within the definition they have created, they would not require a cart. However, experience indicates most backyard composting, if not all, is related to green kitchen waste. Exemptions will be dealt with on a case to case basis.

With respect to carts for apartment buildings, Mr. Halsey stated, assuming a user pay system, the landlord would purchase the carts, and charge the tenants.

! Councillor Stone inquired if the apartments would still be required to collect solid waste with a private company.

Mr. Halsey replied any building larger than six units would be able to take part in the program, but through private collection as they do now.

! Councillor Stone suggested consideration should be given to allowing these buildings to join the process instead of putting it out to a private company.

With respect to the cost of the carts, Councillor Kelly stated IPL can provide the same cart at an approximate \$2 million cost saving. He suggested an actual tender call should be conducted on the carts rather than a Request for Proposal on the overall system. Mr. Halsey stated IPL did not submit a bid, and noted the \$2 million saving is

very subjective as it is easy for a supplier to bid lower when the amount of the other bid is known in advance. Councillor Kelly questioned the difference in prices of the carts in different municipalities. Mr. Otto Fasthuber, Executive Vice President & General Manager, SSI Schaefer Canada, clarified by stating the carts for one of the other municipalities was not an aerated cart. The price of the Schaefer carts in the Ottawa Valley was the same as the HRM price.

Councillor Schofield stated if there is a possibility of a \$2 million difference it should be examined. He stated he has received many phone calls from residents suggesting bags should be considered as an alternative.

Councillor Rankin submitted copies of his comments which he read into the record.

Councillor Hetherington stated for the record, Councillor Blumenthal called him earlier today, and he is very much against the containers. Councillor Hetherington stated the public does not like the containers because they have no knowledge of them. Everyone has been taken into consideration in this process except the taxpayer. He agreed that Councillor Kelly's information regarding a possible \$2 million saving needs to be examined.

Councillor Hetherington requested a list of names and addresses of all those residents who participated in the pilot project be provided to the Councillors' Office so they can conduct their own survey.

Mr. George McLellan, Commissioner of Regional Operations, responded to the comments made by Council making the following points:

- The people involved have done a very good job in terms of the presentation and the procurement process.
- The procurement process was well advertised and this particular process was discussed before Council previously.
- Council has always received copies of the SWRAC minutes.
- A good procurement process has been followed and staff has yielded a recommendation.
- The criteria used to determine the proposed \$2 million dollar saving is not known and the cart may not be the same as the Schaefer cart.
- At some point, a decision needs to be made.
- If there is going to be a land fill site, it is going to be organic free, and needs to be up and running long before November 1998.
- Behavioural impact is needed, and this cannot be obtained without experience.
- Staff has made a firm and clear recommendation, and now it is Council's decision.

Councillor Sarto inquired if the counter top kitchen container is optional to which Mr. Halsey replied it could be considered. With respect to seniors and disabled, Councillor Sarto inquired if consideration is being given to provide some assistance for these

people to move the carts closer to the house rather than the curbside to which Mr. Halsey replied in the affirmative.

Deputy Mayor Greenough suggested the carts be offered on an optional basis initially to determine the response.

Mayor Fitzgerald, at this point, encouraged Council to make a decision and move ahead on this issue.

Council agreed to move the public presentations up on the agenda to be dealt with next.

1.2 Public Presentations

1.2.1 Lorretta J. Smith

- A letter from Ms. Lorretta J. Smith opposing the purchase of the composting carts, was before Council.

Ms. Lorretta Smith, resident, read from a prepared text strongly opposing the composting carts.

1.2.2 Don Wright

Mr. Don Wright, member of the Community Stakeholders Committee, made a brief presentation to Council reviewing the development of the Integrated Waste Resource Management strategy and its progress towards implementation. In closing, Mr. Wright urged Council to proceed with the implementation of the strategy.

Councillor Hendsbee returned to the meeting at this time.

1.2.3 Michael Matthews

Mr. Michael Matthews, President, Caster-Rack Systems Ltd., representing Schaefer Canada in the Atlantic Provinces since 1984, made a presentation to Council making the following points:

- After three years, communities currently using the carts are in favour of them and the size of the cart is no longer an issue.
- The information given earlier that the same carts are available in other areas for a lower price is not true. The price for the Schaefer carts includes an ID tag, a roll out to every resident, educational support and identifying a list to keep track of the containers.
- With regards to IPL, they have not manufactured a product to date that is not in the prototype stage, nor do they have a community anywhere in Canada that is using their containers to collect organics.

- The public is upset with a lot of issues and the carts are taking the flack.
- He has complete confidence in the ability of the compost containers to work, but it is very important to get the public support. This requires a detailed communication education plan which is to be completed and needs to be implemented.

In closing, Mr. Matthews stated the net benefit to the taxpayers of the complete organic diversion system should be compared to the cost of landfilling.

MOVED by Councillor Stone and Deputy Mayor Greenough that this issue be deferred to the end of the regular Council Session this evening. MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

The Committee adjourned at 5:00 p.m. and after meeting in Regular Session, resumed meeting as Committee of the Whole at 9:00 p.m.

1.1 **Request for Proposal #96-165 - Source Separated Organic Collection Containers Con't**

MOVED by Councillors Harvey and Barnet to approve the purchase of 90% of the total number of carts from the company Schaefer System International Limited, who received the highest total score in the RFP evaluation process, and submitted the lowest price for residential curbside organics collection containers;

Further, to approve the purchase of 10% of the total number of carts from the company Rehrig Pacific Company.

In speaking to the Motion, Councillor Dooks expressed concern that no pilot project had been carried out in the rural area.

Councillor Walker enquired as to why the process must proceed so quickly; therefore, he suggested this matter be deferred to April 15, 1997. Further, he suggested "First Brands" address Council as they wish to provide an alternative. Finally, he suggested that bins be provided first to those who are interested with the remainder to be phased in.

In response to Councillor Walker's statement, Mr. George McLellan advised there was merit in the suggestion to phase in the containers. He suggested that all containers could be purchased now with 50% delivered for a six month pilot project. Further, he stated that staff will make more of an effort in District 1.

Councillor Barnet cautioned Council as to the costs which could accrue to the municipality should nothing be done in this regard. Further, he expressed concern with

the fact that Council could jeopardize the whole tendering process if it becomes involved in the tendering process. In closing, Councillor Barnet suggested Council make a decision due to the fact that for ten years, a solution has been sought to deal with solid waste.

In response to an enquiry from Mayor Fitzgerald, Councillor Barnet stated he was prepared to accept bins for everyone in his District.

To clarify the matter at hand, Mr. Ken Meech addressed Council noting the municipality has an Application filed with the Department of the Environment (DOE) on the basis that the municipality can reduce the size of the Front End Processor (FEP). Further, the municipality is anticipating the Department will support a smaller FEP. The other option is to build a bigger FEP which will cost more, however, this goes against the principle of dealing with solid waste in a responsible manner. A decision must be made soon as Council does not have the luxury of additional time.

Councillor Hanson expressed concern over the perceived division of the municipality - rural vs urban. Further, he suggested it would be irresponsible for Council to get involved in the tendering process.

Councillor Epstein stated that Councillor Dooks has raised points of merit; further, Council should proceed with caution if carts are to be introduced within the entire Region. Councillor Epstein enquired if there was a plan for cleaning the containers and what role paper would play in this regard.

In response to an enquiry from Councillor Epstein if HRM staff had contacted staff from other municipalities who were currently utilizing bins, Mr. Ray Halsey, Solid Waste, and Mr. George McLellan, both stated that staff would contact them tomorrow.

Councillor Kelly stated that Council does not necessarily have to support a recommendation of SWRAC; therefore, Council can recommend one composting facility.

Councillor Hendsbee supported the recommendation of the Community Stakeholders Committee and staff to date. Further, he agreed with the comments of Mr. Ken Meech. Councillor Hendsbee stated he was prepared to have carts implemented in his District. Also, he suggested areas could be excluded for the current time pending education of the public.

Councillor Stone suggested staff place an information advertisement in the newspapers to educate the public on the matter at hand.

Councillor Cunningham expressed concern on the \$5 fee for a counter top container and suggested that other containers could be used i.e. ice cream containers.

Councillor Cooper stated that Council needs to be aggressive and support the Strategy

and Community Stakeholders Committee and attempt to reduce the amount of waste to the Residual Disposal Facility (RDF) through the FEP.

Deputy Mayor Greenough, to clarify, stated that 50% would be rolled out as per the demonstration project followed by an aggressive education program, with the other 50% being distributed subsequent to the demonstration project.

MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

1.3 **Request for Presentation for Compost Bags - Councillor Walker**

It was the consensus of Council to **not** permit a presentation for composting bags to take place on April 8, 1997, during the Committee of the Whole.

MOVED by Deputy Mayor Greenough and Councillor Hetherington to adjourn the meeting at 10:40 p.m. MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

Vi Carmichael
MUNICIPAL CLERK