

# HALIFAX REGIONAL MUNICIPALITY

---

## HALIFAX REGIONAL COUNCIL MINUTES April 1, 2003

### PRESENT:

Mayor Peter J. Kelly  
Deputy Mayor Harry McInroy  
Councillors: Steve Streach  
Gary Hines  
Keith Colwell  
Ron Cooper  
Brian Warshick  
Condo Sarto  
Bruce Hetherington  
Jim Smith  
John Cunningham  
Jerry Blumenthal  
Dawn Sloane  
Sheila Fougere  
Russell Walker  
Diana Whalen  
Linda Mosher  
Stephen Adams  
Brad Johns  
Robert P. Harvey  
Len Goucher  
Reg Rankin  
Gary Meade

### REGRETS:

Councillor: Sue Uteck

### STAFF:

Mr. Dan English, Acting Chief Administrative Officer  
Mr. Barry Allen, Municipal Solicitor  
Ms. Vi Carmichael, Municipal Clerk  
Ms. Jan Gibson, Deputy Municipal Clerk (evening session)  
Ms. Sherryll Murphy, Legislative Assistant  
Ms. Patti Halliday, Legislative Assistant (evening session)

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

1.	INVOCATION .....	4
2.	APPROVAL OF MINUTES .....	4
3.	APPROVAL OF THE ORDER OF BUSINESS AND APPROVAL OF ADDITIONS AND DELETIONS .....	4
4.	BUSINESS ARISING OUT OF THE MINUTES .....	4
5.	MOTIONS OF RECONSIDERATION .....	4
6.	MOTIONS OF RESCISSION .....	4
7.	CONSIDERATION OF DEFERRED BUSINESS .....	4
8.	PUBLIC HEARING .....	4
8.1	By-Law S-203, Respecting Smoke Free Places .....	4
9.	CORRESPONDENCE, PETITIONS & DELEGATIONS .....	5
9.1	Correspondence .....	5
9.2	Petitions .....	5
9.2.1	Petition - Councillor Colwell - Public Transit Route for Lawrencetown5	5
9.3	Presentations .....	5
9.3.1	Greater Halifax Partnership (GHP) Quarterly Report Stephen Dempsey, President & CEO .....	6
9.3.2	Halifax Regional Development Agency (HRDA) Quarterly Report Gerald Gabriel, General Manager .....	6
10.	REPORTS .....	7
10.1	GRANTS COMMITTEE .....	7
10.1.1	By-Law T-210, An Amendment to By-Law T-201 Respecting Tax Exemption for Non-Profit Organizations: 2002-2003 Appeals and Revisions .....	7
10.2	CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER .....	7
10.2.1	Tender 03-202, Retaining Wall and Guard Rail Replacement, Ferguson's Cove Road, Western Region .....	8
10.2.2	Gateway / Community Greeting Signage .....	8
11.	MOTIONS .....	10

12.	ADDED ITEMS .....	10
12.1	Process re Emergency Aid re Flooding - Councillor Adams .....	10
13.	NOTICES OF MOTION .....	11
13.1	Councillor Walker - Notice of Motion - First Reading of an Amendment to Bylaw T-202 Respecting Tax Exemption for Non-Profit Organizations ...	11
13.2	Councillor Hetherington - Notice of Motion - First Reading of an Amendment to By-law O-103, Respecting Open Air Burning .....	11
13.3	Notice of Motion - Councillor Streach - Amendment to Section 13 of Administrative Order Number One, Respecting the Rules of Procedure of Council - Utilization of the Electronic Voting System .....	11

1. **INVOCATION**

The meeting was called to order at 1:35 p.m. with Councillor Whalen leading the invocation.

2. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES** - None

3. **APPROVAL OF THE ORDER OF BUSINESS AND APPROVAL OF ADDITIONS AND DELETIONS**

Additions:

12.1 Process for Emergency Aid re Flooding - Councillor Adams

The following item was added to the Information Item agenda:

1. Memorandum from Director, Shared Services dated March 31, 2003 re: Request for Proposal 02-007, Cellular Communications.

4. **BUSINESS ARISING OUT OF THE MINUTES** - None

5. **MOTIONS OF RECONSIDERATION** - None

6. **MOTIONS OF RESCISSION** - None

7. **CONSIDERATION OF DEFERRED BUSINESS** - None

8. **PUBLIC HEARING - 6:00 p.m.**

8.1 **By-Law S-203, Respecting Smoke Free Places**

The Chair advised that, as advertised, this matter will be dealt with at 6:00 p.m. this evening.

Councillor Hetherington referred to the conduct of the Public Hearing to be held this evening and suggested, given that the public hearing is scheduled to continue tomorrow, a limit be placed on the length of public hearing for this evening.

**MOVED by Councillor Hetherington, seconded by Councillor Blumenthal that the public hearing be held from 6:00 p.m. until 9:00 p.m. tonight.**

A discussion ensued and the **MOTION WAS PUT AND DEFEATED.**

Members of Council voting **in favour** of the motion: Deputy Mayor McInroy and Councillors

Streach, Hines, Colwell, Warshick, Hetherington, Blumenthal, Sloane, Mosher, Adams, and Rankin.

Members of Council voting **against** the motion: Mayor Kelly and Councillors Cooper, Sarto, Smith, Cunningham, Fougere, Walker, Whalen, Johns, Harvey, Goucher, Meade.

Given that members of Council must be present in the Chamber during the entire hearing, it was **MOVED by Councillor Hetherington, seconded by Councillor Blumenthal that Council break after every 45 minutes. MOTION PUT AND PASSED** with Councillors Cooper, Cunningham, Fougere, Walker and Whalen voting **against** the motion.

**MOVED by Councillor Mosher, seconded by Councillor Sloane that those persons present this evening who do not have an opportunity to speak be placed on a list and only those persons on the list would have the opportunity to speak at a continuation of the public hearing.**

After a discussion the **MOTION WAS PUT AND DEFEATED.**

Members of Council voting **in favour** of the motion: Councillors Colwell, Smith, Cunningham, Blumenthal, Sloane, Fougere, Walker, Whalen, Mosher, Adams, Harvey.

Members of Council voting **against** the motion: Mayor Kelly, Deputy Mayor McInroy and Councillors Streach, Hines, Cooper, Warshick, Sarto, Hetherington, Johns, Goucher, Rankin, and Meade.

## **9. CORRESPONDENCE, PETITIONS & DELEGATIONS**

### **9.1 Correspondence - None**

### **9.2 Petitions**

#### **9.2.1 Petition - Councillor Colwell - Public Transit Route for Lawrencetown**

Councillor Colwell submitted a petition on behalf of almost 400 residents of Lawrencetown calling on Metro Transit to install a public transit route connecting the community of Lawrencetown with metro (Halifax and Dartmouth) as soon as possible.

Councillor Colwell requested that this petition be forwarded to Metro Transit.

### **9.3 Presentations**

< An information report dated March 20, 2003 submitted by Betty MacDonald, Director,

Governance and Strategic Initiatives, was distributed to members of Council.

Ms. Betty MacDonald, Director, Governance and Strategic Initiatives, noted that the Information Report before Council summarized the achievements mid-way through the three year Service Agreements the Halifax Regional Municipality has with the Greater Halifax Partnership and the Halifax Regional Development Agency. Ms. MacDonald noted that staff had prepared this report in order that it come in conjunction with these groups reporting to Council.

**9.3.1 Greater Halifax Partnership (GHP) Quarterly Report Stephen Dempsey, President & CEO**

- < A document entitled Greater Halifax Partnership Mid-Contract Review to Halifax Regional Municipality (For the period April 1, 2001 - December 3, 2002) dated March 25, 2003 was before Council for consideration.
- < Distributed to members of Council were the Financial Statements, Greater Halifax Economic Development Partnership Association, December 31, 2002

Mr. Don Mills, Chair of the Board of Directors and Mr. Stephen Dempsey, President and CEO, of the Greater Halifax Partnership gave a presentation entitled Mid-Term Review after which Mr. Dempsey responded to questions from members of Council. A copy of the presentation is on file.

Councillor Blumenthal, on behalf of Council, noted that Councillor Fougere's term on the Greater Halifax Partnership Board has expired and thanked Councillor Fougere for her hard work while serving on the Board.

Mayor Kelly thanked Mr. Mills and Mr. Dempsey for their presentation.

**9.3.2 Halifax Regional Development Agency (HRDA) Quarterly Report Gerald Gabriel, General Manager**

- A folder of information including a Case Studies regarding Tourism development in St. Margaret's Bay and Eastern Matters, Business Plan for 2003-2004 and 2001-2003 Halifax Regional Development Agency clients, was before Council for consideration.

Mr. Gerald Archibald, Chair and Mr. Gerald Gabriel, General Manager, of the Halifax Regional Development Agency, gave a presentation outlining the activities of the Agency over the last 18 months and providing highlights of plans for the future. Mr. Gabriel then responded to questions from members of Council.

Mayor Kelly thanked Mr. Archibald and Mr. Gabriel for their presentation.

**10. REPORTS**

**10.1 GRANTS COMMITTEE**

**10.1.1 By-Law T-210, An Amendment to By-Law T-201 Respecting Tax Exemption for Non-Profit Organizations: 2002-2003 Appeals and Revisions**

- A staff report dated January 8, 2003 submitted by Jim Hobin, Chair, HRM Grants Committee, was before Council for consideration.

**MOVED by Councillor Walker, seconded by Councillor Streach that Regional Council:**

- 1. Approve the addition of new organizations as recommended in Section A of the January 8, 2003 report from the Grants Committee.**
- 2. Approve the decline of applications as recommended in Section B of the Discussion section of the January 8, 2003 report from the Grants Committee.**
- 3. Approve the revisions to Schedules 26 to 29 as recommended in Section C of the Discussion section of the January 8, 2003 report from the Grants Committee.**
- 4. Authorize staff to proceed to a public hearing.**

Councillor Hetherington requested an update regarding the proposal that not for profit Housing Associations across Halifax Regional Municipality be granted tax relief as long as they guarantee to apply these savings would be used to improve/upgrade their properties.

**MOTION PUT AND PASSED.**

Members of Council voting **in favour** of the motion: Mayor Kelly and Councillors Hines, Colwell, Cooper, Warshick, Sloane, Fougere, Walker, Whalen, Adams, Johns, Goucher, and Meade.

Members of Council voting **against** the motion: Deputy Mayor McInroy, and Councillors Streach, Sarto, Hetherington, Smith, Cunningham, Blumenthal, Mosher, Harvey, Rankin.

**10.2 CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER**

**10.2.1 Tender 03-202, Retaining Wall and Guard Rail Replacement, Ferguson's Cove Road, Western Region**

- A staff report dated March 26, 2003 prepared for Mr. Dan English, Acting Chief Administrative Officer, was before Council for consideration.

**MOVED by Councillor Adams, seconded by Councillor Mosher that Regional Council award Tender No. 03-202, Retaining Wall and Guide Rail Replacement, Ferguson's Cove Road - West Region to J.R. Eisener Contracting Limited for materials and services listed at the unit prices quoted for a Tender Price of \$134,780, plus net HST for a total of \$143,445 from Account No. CZR00357, Resurfacing, with funding authorized as per the Budget Implications section of this report. MOTION PUT AND PASSED** with Deputy Mayor McInroy and Councillors Harvey and Rankin voting against the motion.

Councillor Hetherington noted there was no policy relative to the location of retaining walls on private property. He went on to indicate that HRM installs these retaining walls on private property in connection with road work or sidewalks and then is not able to maintain the walls. Councillor Hetherington indicated that HRM should maintain these walls and should have a policy in place to that end.

The Acting Chief Administrative Officer indicated that he did not know whether HRM installed retaining walls on private property, however, he suggested that if HRM did there would be some arrangement, possibly a lease arrangement, to cover off such things as maintenance. Mr. English went on to indicate that staff would look into this matter and report back to Council.

**10.2.2 Gateway / Community Greeting Signage**

- A draft Traffic and Transportation Services, Community Greeting Sign Policy, April 2003 was circulated to Council.

Mr. Dave McCusker gave a presentation regarding Greeting/Gateway Signs for Halifax Regional Municipality the highlights of which were:

- Greeting/Gateway Signs for HRM - Three (3) Categories
  - < 100 series Highway gateways
  - < Secondary Highway boundary signs
  - < Community greeting signs
- 100 Series Gateways
  - < Three (3) locations within HRM
  - < Installation will follow Provincial guidelines

- < May be located at actual boundary/core boundary (staff's preference is actual boundary)
- < Approximate cost \$11,000 per sign
- Secondary Highway boundary signs
  - < Nine or ten locations within HRM
  - < Smaller type signs (\$50 per sign)
- Community Greeting Signs
  - < Draft policy for community sponsorship
  - < One of two possible ways to achieve: cost share with communities or Halifax Regional Municipality look at installing in line with 911
  - < Traffic signs and not billboards
  - < Achieves consistency and no other signs will be approved
  - < Visitors will look to these for way finding
  - < Allows unique community slogan tab.
- Funding/Timing
  - 100 Series Gateways - included in current Tourism budget. Awaiting final Provincial approval and Destination Halifax preliminary approval received. More tweaking required and staff anticipates will be returning to Council for final approval
  - Secondary Highway boundary signs - included in current Tourism budget with work to begin immediately
  - Community Greeting Signs - Work is ongoing on the policy. Staff will return to Council for final approval

A brief questioning of staff ensued and it was **MOVED by Councillor Goucher, seconded by Councillor Adams that consideration of this matter be deferred to a future Committee of the Whole. MOTION PUT AND PASSED.**

Members of Council voting **in favour** of the motion: Mayor Kelly, Deputy Mayor McInroy, Streach, Hines, Colwell, Cooper, Warshick, Sarto, Hetherington, Fougere, Whalen, Adams, Johns, Harvey, Goucher and Rankin.

Members of Council voting **against** the motion: Councillors Smith, Cunningham, Blumenthal, Sloane, Walker, Mosher, and Meade.

11. **MOTIONS** - None

**12. ADDED ITEMS**

**12.1 Process re Emergency Aid re Flooding - Councillor Adams**

- This matter was added to the agenda during the setting of the agenda.
- A memorandum dated April 1, 2003 from John O'Brien, Corporate Communication Officer, was circulated to Council.

Councillor Adams referred to the flooding over the last 48 hours and noted that a number of residents of HRM had been negatively impacted by the heavy rainfall. Councillor Adams indicated that there is a Provincial mechanism in place to help those residents recover losses. He went on to request that the Call Centre representative be brought up to date with regard to this opportunity for help through the Province. The Councillor went on to note that Councillors could then refer any inquiries they received to the Call Centre.

His Worship noted that a Provincial program has been discussed and that HRM would be assisting in developing a database in this regard. He requested that staff provide an update.

Mr. Peter Bigelow, Manager, Real Property Planning advised that Minister Olive has brought forward a Disaster Financial Assistance Program which has been passed in the House. HRM is assisting with that program in that the Call Centre will be up and operational later today to answer questions and Public Service Announcements will be issued through the CAO's office. He went on to note that persons or businesses having experienced damage will be able to obtain the Provincial aid package information at HRM's Customer Service Centres. Mr. Bigelow noted that the information available through the Call Centre today will be generic and that it will take approximately two days to have the program in place.

Councillor Cooper requested a brief information report in the near future on how this event is rated as storms are rated (i.e. one in fifty, one in one hundred). He suggested that this storm may well be a benchmark HRM will refer to in the future.

Councillor Mosher noted that she had received a number of flooding calls which have been attributed to recent blasting and excavating. She noted in particular properties on the St. Margaret's Bay Road which have not experienced flooding in 35 years did so during this storm. Councillor Mosher indicated residents are concerned that the flooding is due to water being diverted to their properties as a result of blasting and excavating. Councillor Mosher asked staff what they would recommend if this is in fact the case.

At the request of the Mayor, Councillor Mosher agreed to speak with staff relative to this matter.

Councillor Goucher asked if a database of all the persons who have called in will be maintained, so that when the information on the Provincial aid program is available it will be dispersed to those callers. He went on to indicate that he felt this was essential in this situation.

Cathie Mellett, Service Coordinator, Shared Services, advised that there is very little information regarding what the Province is going to provide. She went on to note that staff would keep Council updated as this information is received.

Given Ms. Mellett comments, Councillor Goucher requested that a data base be maintained.

**13. NOTICES OF MOTION**

**13.1 Councillor Walker - Notice of Motion - First Reading of an Amendment to Bylaw T-201 Respecting Tax Exemption for Non-Profit Organizations**

Councillor Walker gave Notice of Motion of his intention, at the next regular meeting of Halifax Regional to be held on Tuesday, the 8<sup>th</sup> day of April 2003, to move First Reading of a by-law to amend By-law T-201 Respecting Tax Exemption for Non-Profit Organization through the additional and deletion of organizations as detailed in By-law T-210, An Amendment to By-law T-201

**13.2 Councillor Hetherington - Notice of Motion - First Reading of an Amendment to By-law O-103, Respecting Open Air Burning**

Councillor Hetherington gave Notice of Motion of his intention, at the next regular meeting of Halifax Regional Council to be held on April 8, 2003, to introduce First Reading of the By-Law O-103, Respecting Open Air Burning

**13.3 Notice of Motion - Councillor Streach - Amendment to Section 15 of Administrative Order Number One, Respecting the Rules of Procedure of Council - Utilization of the Electronic Voting System**

Councillor Streach gave Notice of Motion of his intention, at the next regular meeting of Halifax Regional Council to be held on April 8, 2003, to introduce a motion to amend Section 15 of Administrative Order Number One, Respecting the Rules of Procedure of Council, that will give the Chair some discretion in the utilization of the electronic voting system in respect to substantive motions.

At this point, the meeting recessed to be reconvened at 6:00 p.m. for the public hearing relative to By-law S-203, Respecting Smoke Free Places.

Mayor Kelly called the meeting back to order at 6:00 p.m. All members of Council were present, except for Councillor Uteck (Regrets).

**8. PUBLIC HEARINGS**

**8.1 By-Law S-203, Respecting Smoke Free Places**

The following was submitted in favour of the proposed by-law:

- C Petition from the Nova Scotia Dental Association containing 77 signatures.
  
- C Publications: Submitted by Capital Health “Daily News: Big Tobacco Conspiracy”, “Daily News: Fighting the Smoke Ban”, “Industry Watch: Physicians for a Smoke-Free Canada”, “Metropolitan Halifax Chamber of Commerce: Position Statement (Smoke Free Public Places)”, “Review: Review of the quality of studies on the economic effects of smoke-free policies on the hospitality industry”, “KPMG: Economic Impact Analysis of the Smoke Free By Laws on the Hospitality Industry in Ottawa”, and “News Release: Majority wants HRM bars, restaurants and casinos to be 100% smoke free, poll finds”.  
Submitted by Dr. Alex Gillis, Interim President and CEO of the IWK: “Physicians for a Smoke-Free Canada”, “Tourism and Hotel Revenues Before and After Passage of Smoke-Free Restaurant Ordinances”. Submitted by Catherine Cole “Physicians for a Smoke-Free Canada: Halifax Regional Municipality Council should protect all workers from second-hand smoke by banning smoking in all workplaces with no exceptions.”
  
- C Correspondence received from: Sandra Creighton, Sarah Negus, Dr. Andrew Lynk, Ken Murton, Dr. Noreen Walsh, Dr. G. Bethune, Allan Callard, Diane Bailey, Lea Brovedani, Barbara Vye, Lindsay Ward, June Boswell, Diane Gibbons, Carol Loncarevic, Kirstin Crabtree, Tim Nettle, Gail Freeman, Molly Gillis, Simon Sagar, Louise Schurman, Jenny Take, Todd Hill, Dr. Dennis Bowie, Jessie-Lee Langille, Colleen Dunphy, Cindy Were, Jim Anderson, Boyce Rice, Ida Denyes, Dianne Slaunwhite, Sarah Teal, Dr. Lynn Crosby, Dr. Craig St. Peters, Phyllis Burke, Kim Wieggers, Harry Coutts, Maureen Flick, Kathy Moggridge, Dr. Katherine Robinson, Sharon Fraser, Joel Powell, Dr. Conrad Fernandez, Helen Zebedee, Ken Bowers, Dean Van, Dr. Scott Halperin, Gail Peterson, Gaye Squires, Brad Traves, Shirley Campbell, Lara Sheehan, Gary Hector, Andrew Edwards, Rene Coulombe, Sabrina Vatcher, Vince Marsh, Norma Kennedy, Lori Reynolds, Dr. Paul Renault, Nancy and Dave Worth, Pam Hancock, C. Covert, L. J. Roberts, Jan Pottle, Sharon MacIntosh, June and Karl Hall, Paul Wells, Anne Cogdon, Morgane Cameron, David and Dolores Beresford-Green, Carol King, Steve Ashford, Gary and Viv Evans, Rebecca LeBlanc, Mary Smith-Marquis, Landry Glenn, Janice Sampson, Randy Reede, James and Teresa Fanning, Bill VanGorder, Dennis and Carol Peters, Donna Gates, Nancy Stoddart, Carla and Stephen Purcell, Kevin Lynch, Jamie MacArthur, Anne Louise

O'Brien, Sharon MacIntosh, Sylvia J. Wist, Elizabeth Mann, Cheryl Nickerson, Robert Strang, Dr. Karen Mann, Shirley MacIntosh, Natasha Lynn Chow, Cory G. Cox, Brian Tuttle, Stephanie Oldfield, Karen Furneaux, David Wimberly, Ed Kinley, Dr. John Hanly, Dr. Andrew McIvor, Valerie Payn for Metropolitan Halifax Chamber of Commerce, Dr. Natalie Yanchar, Dr. Kempton Hayes, Glenn Keeping, U. Nagpal, Jenny Take, Kim Strong, Jane Everist on behalf of C.P. Allen High School, Shawn and Kim Silver, Moira Sutherland, Natalie Nichols, Dr. Robert Miller, S. Giles, Tony Benson, Melanie Huxter, Joe Burke, Andrea Hilchie-Pye, Mark Emberly, Allan Callard, Stephanie Reidy, Ellis Betensky, Corinne Boudreau, Amy Tremble, John Dow, Tisha White, Deanna Cogdon

The following was submitted against the proposed by-law:

- C Correspondence received from: Bruce Lusby, Les Muise, Brad Hebb, RANS (Restaurant Association of Nova Scotia), Carolyn Vaughan, The Lions Head Tavern & Grill, Brian Doherty, Darlene MacKinnon, Thomas Wile - re: Designated Smoking Rooms in London Ontario, Darlene MacKinnon, Mary Patterson, Scott Norton, Mick Garagan

Ms. Barbara Nehiley, Planning and Development Services, provided a brief overview of the By-Law prior to the Public Hearing.

Mayor Kelly thanked Ms. Nehiley for her presentation.

Responding to a question of Councillor Blumenthal, Mr. Barry Allen, Acting Municipal Solicitor, stated the casino could be covered under the By-law if that is Council's direction.

Councillor Adams inquired about legions, and Ms. Nehiley responded they are included under private clubs.

Councillor Harvey requested that, following the public hearing, the taxi and limousine issue be clarified and that taxis be covered under the By-Law only when in service and not as a private vehicle.

In response to a question of Councillor Streach regarding cost implications, Ms. Nehiley clarified that intent of the provincial legislation and stated the municipality would only be responsible for enforcement of where HRM goes beyond the provincial restrictions. Mr. Dan English, Acting Chief Administrative Officer, added that if Council decides to proceed with the enactment of the proposed By-Law, staff would come back to Council with a report regarding the cost implications. He indicated this report could be before Council on April 15 or 22 depending on when the public hearing concludes.

Councillor Mosher requested clarification on how correspondence regarding the proposed by-law sent directly to individual Councillors could be added to the public record. Ms. Jan

Gibson, Deputy Municipal Clerk, responded that, if requested by a Councillor, the Municipal Clerk's Office would forward the correspondence on to all members of Regional Council. Councillor Mosher stated she had many email messages that she would forward to staff for distribution to Council.

Councillor Colwell stated he would have liked to have known the cost implications of the proposed By-Law before the public hearing. He expressed concern that the municipality will eventually end up enforcing the provincial restrictions as well.

Councillor Sloane inquired about the implications of who would be responsible for compensating owners who have already installed smoking rooms if the proposed By-Law is adopted. Mr. English responded that reimbursement would be a legal issue and it could be addressed by staff at the same time as costs and resources.

In response to a question of Councillor Sarto regarding nursing homes, Ms. Nehiley stated the provincial regulations restrict smoking in nursing homes except for designated areas. This proposed By-Law will not impact nursing homes, long-term care facilities or group homes.

Councillor Warshick inquired if the definition section in the By-Law is up for discussion during the debate of the By-Law. Mr. Barry Allen, Acting Municipal Solicitor, responded in the affirmative.

Mayor Kelly called for members of the public wishing to speak either in favour of or against the proposed By-Law.

**Heather Crowe, Ottawa**

Ms. Heather Crowe, Ottawa, addressed Council noting she was before Council to put a face to cancer caused by secondhand smoke. Ms. Crowe was a non-smoking waitress for 40 years and has been diagnosed with cancer. Ms. Crowe's situation was the first case in Ontario for Workman's Compensation that established the fact there is a health hazard with secondhand smoke. She spoke in support of a 100 percent smoke-free workplace for restaurant workers. In closing, Ms. Crowe urged Council to make a humane decision and make her last person in the industry to die from secondhand smoke.

**Matthew Wall, 5448 North Street, Halifax**

Reading from prepared correspondence, Mr. Matthew Wall addressed Council stating the issue before Council is a moral one, and Council needs to choose between protecting the lives of the restaurant and bar staff or letting money and the fear of losing money cloud its moral and civic duty to protect human life.

**Neil Collishaw, Research Director, Physicians for Smoke Free Canada, Ottawa**

Dr. Collishaw addressed Council stating banning smoking in all workplaces is the right thing to do as it effectively protects public health, it is fair to all workers, employers and the general public. It is feasible and costs little. He stated this has been demonstrated over and over again in many municipalities across Canada and the United States. Dr. Collishaw stated there is plenty of evidence that proves a smoking ban is good for business overall. For example, in California where the ban has been in place for many years, sales in restaurants and bars are up. In Ottawa, more bars and restaurants have opened than closed in the one year following the implementation of the ban. Dr. Collishaw acknowledged there will be costs involved with the implementation of the By-Law, but they will be small compared to the public health benefit. He stated Council needs to protect the bar and restaurant industry workers. With respect to ventilation solutions, Dr. Collishaw stated there are not any, and smoking rooms do not protect the workers or create a level playing field. In closing, Dr. Collishaw urged Council to send the tobacco industry packing, ban smoking in all workplaces, and help Heather Crowe obtain her dying wish.

On a Point of Order, Councillor Adams requested that speakers who reference data and statistics to please provide this information in writing, if possible. For example, the Councillor stated he would like more information on Dr. Collishaw's comments regarding the ban in California, the model used, and the number of businesses opened and closed.

**Bruce McLaughlin - Chair, Board of Capital Health**

Mr. McLaughlin addressed Council stating he is a former smoker, parent and basketball coach who now understands the effect of secondhand smoke. He noted there are many competing interests in this issue, commercial interests being one. However, Mr. McLaughlin stated some public debates cannot be resolved effectively by the laws of supply and demand due to overriding public interest, and the smoking debate is one of these issues. The commercial interests will not bring an end to smoking within a reasonable time, consequently, he advocated Council for its legislative intervention. Mr. McLaughlin stated this is an opportunity for Council to show true leadership and to prevent further cases, like Heather Crowe's, by banning smoking in all public places.

**Dr. Alec Gillis, Interim President and CEO, IWK Health Centre**

Dr. Gillis spoke in support of the By-Law stating society has not paid the type of attention to prevention of illness in the past as it deserves. He noted there are many legislative measures such as seatbelts, helmets, childproof containers, etc., which provide huge benefits to society. Dr. Gillis noted HRM is not nearly as healthy as it should be and much of it is preventable. He stated the evidence that links smoking to multiple illnesses and early death cannot be disputed. Scientific evidence that links secondhand smoke with asthma, heart disease and

cancer is equally impressive. Tobacco smoke is so dangerous it has been classed in the United States as a Class A carcinogen, meaning it is unsafe at any level. Rooms containing tobacco smoke can have up to six times the air pollution of a busy highway. Being in a smoking environment for two hours is the equivalent of smoking four cigarettes. Dr. Gillis stated smoking and exposure to secondhand smoke are the most serious preventable health problems in Canada. If a ban is universal, businesses do not suffer. In closing, Dr. Gillis urged Council to be leaders in passing legislation to make the region healthier.

**Lindsay Lockie, Student, Millwood Elementary School**

Miss Lockie spoke in support of the By-Law, stating it would benefit everyone. She stated it would discourage smoking and make HRM a happier and healthier community and would show the municipality is working towards a healthier and brighter future.

**Ryan McKenna, Student, Cole Harbour High School**

Mr. McKenna stated he was 100 percent in favour of a 100 percent smoke-free municipality. He expressed concern with the effect secondhand smoke has on students seeking employment in the hospitality industry. Mr. McKenna stated there should be no disagreement with respect to this By-Law and HRM needs to be 100 percent smoke free.

**Caitlin Armstrong, Student, Millwood Elementary School**

Miss Armstrong addressed Council stating she knows people who have stopped going to public places because of smoke. She stated she does not think the smokers realize the impact smoke has on people around them. Miss Armstrong stated HRM should be 100 percent smoke free because it will make the community a better, healthier place to live.

**Adam Stewart, Student, Eastern Shore District High**

Mr. Stewart spoke in favour of the by-law, stating smoking is disgusting and he does not agree with it. Mr. Stewart stated he has been pressured to smoke many times and chose not to as it is suicidal.

**Katie Brewster, Student, Millwood Elementary School**

Miss Brewster addressed Council stating when she is in a restaurant with people who are smoking she thinks how it will harm her health as smoking is very dangerous. Miss Brewster stated she hopes HRM will be made 100 percent smoke free.

**Charles Crosby - Vice President, Coalition for Smoke Free Nova Scotia, and Member of the Board of Directors of the Nova Scotia Lung Association**

Mr. Crosby addressed Council stating he is a resident of District 12, a parent, and a business owner who frequents bars and restaurants. With regard to polls and statistics, Mr. Crosby stated any results wanted can be achieved by changing the format of the question, and he urged Council to analyse any factors presented as it is an important facet of leadership. He expressed difficulty with members of Council who have abdicated their leadership by stating it is a provincial issue. In closing, Mr. Crosby stated he hopes his son can grow up in a smoke free HRM, and Council has the opportunity to provide this. He urged Council to take it.

### **RECESS**

Council recessed at 6:50 p.m. and reconvened at 7:05 p.m.

At this time, Mayor Kelly clarified a few issues with regard to the process. He advised that following this session, the Public Hearing will continue tomorrow from 1:30 p.m. to 4:00 p.m.

Due to the number of people present wishing to speak, Mayor Kelly stated a further session will be scheduled for next Tuesday commencing at 10:00 a.m. If further sessions are required, they will be scheduled at that time. With regard to the speakers list, Mayor Kelly advised people who sign the list will be given preference tomorrow because of their scheduling, if at all possible. For those that do not sign, they will still be able to come back tomorrow or next Tuesday and still have the opportunity to speak.

### **Kyle Barter, Student**

Mr. Barter stated smoking not only affects the smoker and others, it also affects the environment and animals. He stated Council should adopt the By-Law to make HRM 100 percent smoke free.

### **Dr. Anthony Lamplugh**

Dr. Lamplugh stated the debate is not about business concerns nor stopping smoking. It is about disease prevention with special emphasis on secondhand smoke, respiratory diseases and cancer. Dr. Lamplugh stated the dramatic arrival of a new worldwide epidemic, SARS, is showing how little we know and the need to go back to the first principles of disease control, not treatment, but prevention. He stated that in his 45 years of practice, he encountered many people with cancer. In the past, cancer was seen to be a death sentence, but there are now countless survivors due to improved treatments. Dr. Lamplugh stated more ways to prevent this disease will be discovered in the future. He noted this By-Law provides a chance to avoid future disease and stated he trusts healthy common sense will prevail.

### **Rachelle Slattery, Student, Sackville**

Miss Slattery spoke in support of HRM becoming 100 percent smoke free because she believed non-smokers should be able to go to public places without breathing in smoke. She noted smoke free sections in restaurants really do not make a difference. Miss Slattery stated if the threat of secondhand smoke is lessened, all of HRM will be a happier and healthier place. In closing, Miss Slattery stated she is speaking for the future of young people and urged Council not to risk their lives and those of their families and make HRM 100 percent smoke free.

**Janet Randall**

Ms. Randall stated she is a co-owner of a restaurant which was changed over to an entirely smoke free establishment. She acknowledged that some customers were probably lost, but the majority still come to the restaurant. With regard to sales, Ms. Randall stated they have continued to increase over the last five months. She stated her restaurant is proud to provide a healthy environment for its customers and staff. In closing, Ms. Randall urged Council to pass the By-Law to ban smoking in all public places, including bars, restaurants, and the casino, so all business are on the same playing field.

**Matthew Sample, Student, Millwood Elementary School**

Mr. Sample stated he believed secondhand smoke is very dangerous. Non-smoking sections in restaurants do not help as they feel the same as smoking sections. Mr. Sample stated he is also concerned with what the smoke is doing to his health.

**Dr. Drew Bethune, Thoracic Lung Cancer Surgeon, Co-coordinator, Thoracic Oncology Group**

Dr. Bethune stated he has spent the last twenty years operating on people with lung cancer. He stated Council needs to know the reality of diseases associated with tobacco to make an informed decision. Dr. Bethune stated the results of poor decisions in tobacco policy result in unnecessary deaths. He noted lung cancer is fatal 85 percent of the time and there has been no significant impact made on this cure rate. Nova Scotia is in the Top 3 of new lung cancers among all the provinces in Canada and in the Top 3 in smoking rates. Dr. Bethune stated this is a serious problem and tobacco control is the only effective way to reduce lung cancer. He noted that secondhand smoke causes more cardiovascular illnesses than cancer. Dr. Bethune urged Council to take steps to deal with diseases related to tobacco, noting bar and restaurant workers have the same rights as other workers regarding protection of their health. He stated HRM will be smoke free sooner or later, and further delays will only cause more people to die. Public health is the primary issue for Canadians, and he asked that Council consider these issues.

**Marguerite Fougere, Dartmouth**

Ms. Fougere addressed Council noting four generations of her family have experienced the effects of smoking and stated her priority was to appeal for the next two generations of her family. She noted a recent survey of HRM indicated 7 of 10 people report that secondhand smoke limits their enjoyment of indoor public places. In closing, she asked Council to help keep her family healthy.

**Ann Cogdon, Waverley**

Ms. Cogdon stated she is in strong support of the smoke free places by-law because she believes Council has an opportunity and a responsibility to create healthy public policy. Health represents a broader concept than just treatment facilities which are a provincial responsibility. Everyone has a responsibility to create health in our communities. Municipal government plays a key role in the health of its citizens, by creating policies and programs that promote safety and create healthy communities every day. The proposed by-law is no different than those initiatives. Ms. Cogdon stated it is time for HRM to step up to the plate. In a poll conducted in HRM in the last two weeks by Opinion Trac Research it was indicated that 73% would support the By-law, 26% were opposed. With regard to business, the poll showed that restaurants would see a 37% increase in patronage and bars would see a 17% increase. Ms. Cogdon stated these results show Council has the full support of the majority of residents of HRM for this By-Law. In closing, Ms. Cogdon stated the Halifax Chamber of Commerce is on record for its support of a 100 percent smoke free by-law. She urged Council to disregard the scare tactics and listen to the evidence.

**Bob Miller, President, Nova Scotia Medical Society**

Dr. Miller spoke in support of the By-Law stating smoking is an addiction, not a choice. He stated there is no question that secondhand smoke kills and the number one people affected by secondhand smoke illnesses is the hospitality industry. With respect to filtering systems, Dr. Miller stated there are none that work as it is impossible to filter the toxins out of secondhand smoke. Studies commissioned by the Department of Health showed no proven loss of business to the hospitality industry as a result of a 100 percent smoke free by-law. Dr. Miller stated the provincial legislation is not enough as it does not protect workers. With regard to the casino, he stated HRM can take steps to include it under its jurisdiction. Dr. Miller stated Workman's Compensation has designated secondhand smoke a carcinogen and a toxin. He questioned if this is ignored, and workers are exposed to that, what will be the potential liability. In closing, Dr. Miller urged Council to vote in favour of a 100 percent smoke free public places by-law for HRM.

**Dr. Gerry Brosky, Family Physician, Halifax**

Dr. Brosky addressed Council noting he was on the HRM committee struck to examine this issue five years ago which resulted in By-Law S-200. Dr. Brosky stated there has been no

effect locally from this by-law as it has been ignored, and it is now known internationally as the Halifax approach which does not work. He stated partially banning smoking in a restaurant or bar simply does not work. He noted the "Courtesy of Choice" program was put forth by the tobacco corporations. Dr. Brosky stated the provincial regulations create more exposure to secondhand smoke for employees and patrons after 9:00 p.m. and gives the example to youth they should smoke to be cool. He suggested if HRM is serious about reducing youth smoking, this example needs to be eliminated. In closing, Dr. Brosky urged Council to continue the work of the late Kate Carmichael and do the right thing and make indoor air clean all the time.

**Bill Turpin, Managing Director, GPI Atlantic Research Institute**

Mr. Turpin addressed Council stating GPI completed a report relating to the economics of the smoke-free workplace. This report reviewed all the existing studies on the economic impact of smoke-free legislation. Mr. Turpin stated he believed Council had copies of this report, but, if not, he could provide them. He noted the results of the studies, spanning a decade in time and eight US states, indicated that smoke free legislation has no impact on business in the long term. In fact, several studies found that restaurant, bar, hotel and tourism receipts increased following smoke-free legislation, suggesting it may actually be good for business.

**Dr. Michael Goodyear, Canadian Oncology Society**

Dr. Goodyear stated the time for action is here, and Council has the opportunity to show leadership nationally and internationally. He noted HRM will eventually become smoke free and questioned why not now. Dr. Goodyear stated smokers are now the minority and the numbers are continuing to decline. Making places smoke free saves lives and helps people beat their addiction. With respect to liability, Dr. Goodyear stated everyone is responsible for their own immediate environment, and he urged Council not to listen to the arguments of business and create a level playing field. He suggested if HRM becomes smoke free, other Nova Scotian municipalities will follow.

**Janice Sampson**

Ms. Sampson addressed Council stating it has the opportunity to protect the health of employees and patrons, to protect business and government from future and probable legal action, to give a message to youth that smoking is an unacceptable social habit, and to give business a level playing field. Ms. Sampson stated everyone knows smoking is dangerous to health, and she does not wish to see any more needless deaths due to smoking. In closing, Ms. Sampson submitted a petition in support of the by-law.

**Alison MacDonald**

Ms. MacDonald addressed Council in support of the by-law stating it will build on the provincial regulations which do not go far enough in responding to the health risks associated with exposure to tobacco. She noted Nova Scotia has the highest rates of deaths from cancer and respiratory disease in the country and there is no question tobacco exposure plays a significant role in these disease statistics. Ms. MacDonald stated an equally significant issue is the negative impacts on an individual's quality of life as a result of exposure to tobacco. 75% of Nova Scotians have at least one major risk factor for cardiovascular disease, including stroke. Ms. MacDonald stated Council must do what it can to lessen the burden of disease on the health care system and increase the quality of life and the health of the people it was elected to represent. In closing, Ms. MacDonald urged Council to use its collective voice and do the right thing and insist that public exposure to tobacco will be lessened by voting in favour of a 100 percent smoke free indoor public places by law.

### **RECESS**

Council recessed at 7:50 p.m. and reconvened at 8:05 p.m.

### **Mr. David Henry**

Mr. Henry addressed Council speaking against the proposed By-Law stating he owns a couple of licensed restaurants in the downtown area and a large part of his clientele smoke. He suggested once the cost of smoking to the public health system becomes more than what the government receives from smoking, it becomes an issue. Mr. Henry stated his job is to run his business and urged Council to leave him alone to do so and let the provincial law deal with the issue.

### **Mr. Luke Leslie, Student, St. Pat's High School**

Speaking in support of the by-law, Mr. Leslie stated he was giving a voice to what he sees in his age group regarding this issue. As youth, he stated they almost take it for granted how nice it is to go into a restaurant in Halifax and not have to worry about secondhand smoke. Mr. Leslie suggested this same convenience should be extended to patrons of bars and the casino.

### **Dr. Glen Guilderson , Chiropractor, Representing the Chiropractors of Nova Scotia including the Nova Scotia Council of Chiropractors**

Dr. Guilderson stated the Chiropractors of Nova Scotia strongly support a smoking ban in HRM for health reasons and personal reasons. He stated that he views the present laws as archaic and unfair. As a non-smoker and an advocate of non-smoking, Dr. Guilderson stated he was disappointed to see the artificial curfew of 9:00 p.m. set which requires those not wanting to be exposed to secondhand smoke to go home early. Dr. Guilderson stated he

hopes these archaic rules will go the same way as was the case in the past for the airline industry. In closing, Dr. Guilderson stated exposing workers to secondhand smoke is an avoidable workplace injury.

**Rene Coulombe**

Mr. Coulombe addressed Council stating he would like his government to make a statement that smoking is not acceptable from a health point of view and set the example for future generations. He noted he is a medical student at Dalhousie University and has a moral responsibility to speak on behalf on his future patients' best health interest. Mr. Coulombe stated the detrimental effects of secondhand smoke cannot be ignored, and this is HRM's chance to set an example for the Province. In closing, Mr. Coulombe noted he would spend more time and money in bars and restaurants if they were 100 percent smoke free.

**Mr. G. Lively**

Mr. Lively stated in a perfect world cigarettes would be banned. However, he noted this is not a perfect world and he suggested that anyone on Council who votes against this by-law will be leaving themselves and HRM open for liable at some point. In closing, Mr. Lively stated this by-law should be passed without question.

**Melissa Andrew**

Ms. Andrew, a resident of internal medicine at Dalhousie, addressed Council regarding the by-law stating she sees the effect smoke and secondhand smoke has on health every day. She noted this is an extremely important issue to a lot of residents, and the institution of simple public health policy could reduce the number of illnesses. Ms. Andrews stated she and her colleagues are making choices of where they want to practice in the future, and one strong consideration is whether a community really values the health of its citizens. This proposed by-law is one way for HRM to show that it is such a community.

**Mr. Jean Lively**

Mr. Lively addressed Council stating he has never protested anything before nor asked his government for much, but he stated he supports the proposed by-law and he urged Council to pass it.

**Mr. Warren Meek, Dutch Village Pharmacy Ltd.**

Speaking in support of the by-law, Mr. Meek addressed Council stating HRM has the right to control where and when people may or may not do certain things. He noted some opponents to the proposed by-law believe they have the right to allow smoking in their place of business.

Mr. Meek stated that in 2000, when the sale of tobacco in his pharmacy was restricted, he predicted that he would lose significant business and experience the loss of several jobs. He chose to focus on the positives such as using the free space for alternative products, less theft, fewer loss of merchandise insurance claims, etc. Mr. Meek suggested that Council needs to understand that while some business owners and Councillors in opposition of the by-law are scared of a smoke free world, their fears are unfounded. He stated the majority of businesses will adjust quickly to the new way of doing business and will do more and better business just like he did.

**Elaine Shelton, Dartmouth**

Ms. Shelton stated she no longer frequents local pubs unless there is a smoke free space featuring entertainment. She stated she is well aware of the health risks and chooses not to expose herself to them. Ms. Shelton outlined health problems of her family members and friends due to secondhand smoke, noting they are not unique from other people in HRM. In closing, she urged Council to protect the residents of HRM and introduce a 100 percent smoke free public places by-law.

**Carl Nightingale, Dartmouth**

Speaking in support of the by-law, Mr. Nightingale questioned why this is being debated considering the amazing amount of evidence in support of it. He suggested one reason may be the strategic withdrawal of the tobacco industry. He noted they were vehemently opposed to the provincial legislation, but now they are saying it is strong enough. Mr. Nightingale quoted from the spring edition of *The Engineer*, the newsletter of the Association of Professional Engineers of Nova Scotia, which addressed designated smoking rooms, and noted there is nothing in the procedure that ensures the health and safety of those using them. They are designed to contain the smoke within the room. Mr. Nightingale questioned what that does for the people working there. In closing, he urged Council to be careful in listening to the arguments of the other side, noting he believes a lot residents will remember how Councillors vote on this issue.

**Paula Veinot, Representing the Public Health Association of Nova Scotia**

On behalf of the Public Health Association of Nova Scotia, Ms. Veinot stated a 100 percent smoking ban in all indoor public places will provide the best level of protection of the health of residents. The Association believes that the health of the population depends on the creation of certain conditions: a healthy economy, healthy communities, and a healthy environment. Ms. Veinot stated research demonstrates that the proposed economic devastation for business is not true. Recent public opinion research on the attitudes of HRM residents with respect to secondhand smoke and a smoke free public places by-law indicates that any lost business would be recouped by an increase in patronage by those wishing a

smoke free atmosphere. Ms. Veinot stated Council also has the opportunity to resolve the economic inequities created by the current provincial regulations by creating a level playing field. She added that the proposed by-law would send a clear message that tobacco use is not acceptable for children and adults alike. In closing, Ms. Veinot stated the Association recommends that Council listen to what the public has said and provide its residents with the opportunity for a truly healthy community by adopting the by-law.

In response to a question of Councillor Adams, Ms. Veinot stated bars that currently permit smoking after 9:00 p.m. have a unfair economic advantage.

### **Pam Sanford, Cole Harbour**

Ms. Sanford spoke in support of the proposed by-law stating Council has the power to effect change and save lives. She stated the health of constituents is in Council's hands and they have a responsibility to them. Ms. Sanford urged Council not to buy into the information coming from the hospitality industry who are receiving financial support from the tobacco industry to try and discourage Council from doing the right thing. She asked Council to take a strong look at responsible communities who have already made the change and review their statistics and talk to the residents. Ms. Sandford stated the by-law should be easier to enforce and economically less of a burden for small establishments. In closing, Ms. Sanford stated by ridding the community of smoke, Council will be sending a strong clear message that smoking is dangerous, and she urged Councillors to think carefully of the consequences of their decision.

Responding to a question of Councillor Mosher regarding Ms. Sanford's comments regarding financial support from the tobacco industry, Ms. Sandford apologized for her comments stating it is a personal feeling on her part from information that she has been reading during the past few years on tobacco free legislation, and it was not meant to insult the hospitality industry.

### **Rene Quigley**

Mr. Quigley addressed Council regarding the proposed by-law stating this issue should have been addressed in November 2002. With regard to the Ottawa legislation, it was his understanding that many local bars closed and were replaced by franchise bars which do not reflect local economy or culture. Other effects were some entertainers left the area, conferences were relocated, etc. Mr. Quigley noted in 2002 a smoke free bar was opened in Halifax, but it changed by the end of the year. He expressed concern with the effect a 100 percent ban would have on the hospitality industry in HRM as it is a razor thin market. Mr. Quigley suggested the discussion should be about air quality and not a smoking by-law, because the buildings that have gone smoke free have air conditioning units with 100 percent recycled air and no fresh air. He stated toxins are released in the air from other sources such as copiers, computers and other office equipment. In closing, Mr. Quigley stated he believed the provincial legislation should be studied and the impact examined down the road.

**RECESS**

Council recessed at 8:50 p.m. and reconvened at 9:05 p.m.

**Mike Schmid, Dartmouth**

Mr. Schmid addressed Council regarding the by-law noting he is in the nightclub business as well as being a chartered accountant. Mr. Schmid stated he knows what is best for his business and this by-law should not be a priority for HRM as there are other issues that need to be addressed such as the harbour cleanup, street snow removal, etc. With respect to Toronto, Mr. Schmid stated they had a total smoking ban and have since changed to legislation similar to what the Province of Nova Scotia has implemented. A ban also did not work in Kentville. Mr. Schmid stated he would not spend the money on smoking rooms if he did not think they were necessary. In closing, Mr. Schmid stated if a smoking ban was good for business, he would ban smoking in his establishments himself.

**Ruth Fox, Clayton Park**

Speaking in support of the by-law, Ms. Fox stated she is a nurse, a cancer survivor and a non-smoker. She expressed disappointment that the Province has taken such a lackluster approach to this issue. Ms. Fox stated she is ashamed at times that the Province gives lip service to health yet they make money on addictions such as alcohol and nicotine. She noted the government also puts money into treating diseases that are preventable and only one percent of tax dollars goes to prevention and promotion of health. Ms. Fox also expressed disappointment that this by-law did not come forward sooner and that so much time and energy has been spent arguing about it. In closing, Ms. Fox stated she would like to believe Council will do the right thing for the right reasons.

**Morgan Cameron, Halifax**

Ms. Cameron, speaking in support of the by-law, stated she is affected by secondhand smoke due to allergies and this has influenced her ability to seek work in the hospitality industry. In closing, Ms. Cameron stated the by-law would open her personal world greatly, and she urged Council to support it.

**Kim Mundle, Spryfield**

Ms. Mundle addressed Council noting smoking is no longer considered normal. She stated nonsmokers want to go frequent bars and restaurants but do not want to ruin their health doing it. As a result, many have given up on the downtown scene. In closing, she stated if they knew it was safe, more people would start going out again.

**Judith Cabrita, TIAN'S**

Speaking against the by-law, Ms. Cabrita stated many of the members of TIANS have already made a marketplace decision to be completely smoke free, and many others have built a large part of their business catering to a smoking clientele. TIANS also actively markets to countries with huge smoking populations. Ms. Cabrita stated HRM has a responsibility to the business community as well as the taxpayer. She noted the business community has acted in good faith with the new provincial legislation and have made adjustments and spent money conforming to it. Ms. Cabrita stated the proposed by-law targets the hospitality industry and is selective and discriminatory. She further stated that it is not conducive to building a healthy business environment to have one level of government compete with another over the same regulatory issue. She urged Council to not build legislation where it is already in place. Ms. Cabrita suggested until tobacco becomes an illegal substance, HRM should not even consider a ban. She noted there is still 24 percent of the community smoking. Ms. Cabrita stated this by-law will also add another level of challenging enforcement for the owners and employees as this legislation puts the weight on them. Ms. Cabrita stated a 100 percent ban will not create a level playing field as certain types of restaurants rely far more on customers who smoke. For example, a restaurant with a significant take-out business would not be nearly as affected as a bar. In closing, Ms. Cabrita stated ventilation systems work, bans do not.

**Dale Colbran, Dartmouth**

Mr. Colbran addressed Council noting he operates a non-smoking restaurant. With respect to playing fields, he urged Council to look at the different facts of different communities mentioned who have implemented smoking bans. He stated they are not, in fact, total bans.

Mr. Colbran stated tobacco products are permitted to be sold by the government, the government is making money from the sale, and to put the onus on small business is not fair. In closing, Mr. Colbran urged Council to look at the facts and consider the provincial legislation as being good for the time being.

In response to a question of Councillor Blumenthal, Mr. Colbran stated permitting smoking in legions and casinos can create a uneven playing field. He noted that New York City does not have a total ban as there are places where smoking is permitted.

Councillor Streach requested that the staff report explain what other municipalities are doing with regard to this issue compared to HRM.

**Sharon Fraser**

Ms. Fraser speaking in support of the by-law stated the Province let the residents down. She stated this is a golden opportunity for Council to do the right thing and make HRM healthier.

**Greg Myers, Big Leagues Group**

Speaking against the by-law, Mr. Myers reminded Council of what the hospitality industry does for HRM in terms of employment, community support, charity support, and the local economy. He stated business has slowed since the provincial regulations were implemented and a full ban will be worse. As a result, the support given to the community will be lessened. In closing, Mr. Myers stated Big Leagues Group has spent over \$100,000 complying with the provincial legislation which works great.

As there were no further speakers at this time, Council agreed to recess at 9:30 p.m., and to reconvene tomorrow at 1:30 p.m.

Vi Carmichael  
Municipal Clerk