# Options for Managing Advertising Signage Provincial Highway 333

Transportation Standing Committee February 28<sup>th</sup> 2013



# The Pilot Area

#### Highway 333 Scenic gateways



### **Overview**

- \* Sign clutter along Highway 333
- \* Community & Council wants solution
- \* SMBRTDA, Chamber, Business & Community
- \* Public Highways Act Amended in 2011
- \* Council initiates process in January 2012
- \* Program objectives & options explored
- \* Implementation logistics & costs explored

# **Council's Direction**

Develop a Sign By-law & supporting program based on the following:

□ Highway 333 Pilot – gateway areas

- Program Principles:
- 1. Affordability (cost neutral or cost limited),
- 2. Flexibility (HRM controls implementation)
- 3. Sustainability (effective management & enforcement)
- 4. Community collaboration and/or partnership

Explore enabling measures & collaboration with the Province

# Key Findings:

- □ Sign clutter is a problem along entire Hwy 333 loop
- □ Province will not enforce outside of HRM By-law area
- Gateway areas only will partially achieve objectives
- More realistic financial implications not cost neutral
- □ Enabling measures are limited to a Sign By-law
- Legal considerations need to be understood



















### Tantallon



#### **Prospect - Goodwood**





### **Objectives**



Environmental Clean Landscape Scenic Beauty



Economic Wayfinding Community Promotion



**Safety** Traffic Flow Pedestrians



Implementation Affordable Adaptable Collaborative

### **Community Input:**

- \* Signs that direct the travelling public
- \* Limit or eliminate business promotion
- \* Protect scenic beauty that comes first
- \* Priority for safe and efficient traffic flow
- \* Support the local economy & community
- \* Adopt sign management zones & standards
- \* Enforce, enforce, enforce

### **OPTION 1 - Uniform Directional Signs**

| Description    | Way-finding for travellers – (not promotional advertising)<br>Signs owned and maintained by HRM<br>Series of directional and assurance signs<br>License fees – "Pay-to-Play"<br>All existing signs removed  |
|----------------|---|
| Cost Estimates | Annual:\$106,000 (entire highway)<br>\$11,000 (gateways only)Start-up:\$102,500 (both scenarios)  |
| Analysis       | Highest cost-benefit ratio out of the three options<br>HRM management means lower quality control issues<br>Lower site monitoring for approvals<br>Regular enforcement means service level commitment from<br>More positive economic spin-offs for community & business<br>Supported by best practice |

#### **Option 1 Uniform Directional Signs**



\$93/participant after 3 renewals

1 renewal, or \$500/participant after 3 renewals

#### **OPTION 2 – Promotional Advertising Signs**

| Description    | Promotional advertising with enforced standards<br>Signs owned and maintained by businesses<br>Annual or multi-year licence fee - some cost recovery<br>Regular enforcement needed<br>Provincial ROW permits still required<br>Some or all of existing signs would be removed |
|----------------|---|
| Cost Estimates | Annual:\$145,000 (entire highway)<br>\$30,000 (gateways only)Start-up:\$80,000 (no design work needed from HRM)   |
| Analysis       | Would limit sign clutter but not eliminate it<br>Not supported by best practice<br>Essentially implementation of existing Provincial program<br>License inspections and enforcement efforts higher<br>Cost recovery the highest but trade-off is more signs                   |

### Option 2 Regulated Promotional Signs

#### Example Standards:





### OPTION 3 - No Signs

| Description    | Gateways only or entire highway (as per Council 's direction)<br>No advertising or directional signs permitted<br>All existing signs would be removed<br>No program delivery needed   |
|----------------|---|
| Cost Estimates | <ul> <li>Annual: \$115,000 (entire highway)<br/>\$20,000 (gateways only)</li> <li>Start-up: \$50,000 (still requires records keeping and IT support)</li> </ul>   |
| Analysis       | Lowest cost-benefit ratio - fewer objectives achieved<br>This is a prohibitive approach not supported by business<br>Provincial Highways Act allows signs now – negative optics for HRM<br>Legal considerations - Freedom of Expression<br>Costs would be largely enforcement , storage of signs, and<br>communication<br>Not largely supported by Advisory Committee or business community |

#### **Prospect - Goodwood**





### Tantallon



## Assumptions

- New HRM service dedicated resources & annual budget
- \* Focussed enforcement program
- \* No Provincial enforcement of other illegal signs
- \* Ministerial approval for future amendments
- \* Solution needed for full length of Hwy 333 loop
- \* Community can support but not enforce