

7.1.1



PO Box 1749
Halifax, Nova Scotia
B3J 3A5 Canada

Governance & District Boundary Review Committee
April 1, 2010

TO: Mayor Kelly and members of the Governance and District Boundary Review Committee

SUBMITTED BY:


Cathy Mellett, Acting Municipal Clerk/Manager

DATE:

March 29, 2010

SUBJECT:

Background - Municipal Representation by Population

INFORMATION REPORT

ORIGIN

As part of the District Boundary Review process consideration should be given to methods of representation regarded as most fair and democratic. Throughout Canadian jurisdictions this has generally been seen as a balance between "representation by population" and "effective representation".

This report provides the Boundary Review Committee with the results of a comparison on the form and municipal representation across a number of comparative areas: HRM's benchmark municipalities, urban municipalities in Atlantic Canada, municipalities through Nova Scotia, as well as comparisons to levels of provincial representation in the Maritime provinces.

Comparisons are not meant to direct the Committee or Council's deliberations but to provide contextual information for the broader consideration of governance in the context of the Halifax Regional Municipality.

BACKGROUND/DISCUSSION

Municipal units vary greatly in terms of history, geography, powers and areas of responsibility, as well as in the expectations of residents of their Council and Councillors. Direct comparisons between municipalities, based solely on population represented, are not necessarily the most appropriate basis for comparison. However, they do provide a basis for discussion.

Appendix A, provides a comparison to HRM's usual benchmark municipalities across a number of factors including population, geography, type of government, size of Council and level of support provided to Councillors. A comparison to the provincial representation for Nova Scotia, New Brunswick and Prince Edward Island is also provided.

Appendix B, provides a comparison to levels of representation in municipalities in Nova Scotia.

Municipal and provincial comparisons are provided based on the 2006 census figures, which are the most recent census figures widely published and available. Readers should be aware that most urban municipalities, including HRM, have experienced significant growth since 2006 and that trend is expected to continue.

Based on the available data the following observations can be made regarding the ratio and model of councillor to resident/voter comparisons:

- HRM's Councillor to resident/voter ratios are comparable to provincial representation in Nova Scotia;
- HRM's Councillor to resident/voter ratios are higher than provincial representation in PEI and New Brunswick;
- Councillors in HRM represent more residents/voters per district than in other large municipalities in Atlantic Canada (Charlottown, Moncton, Fredericton, Saint. John, St. John's and CBRM);
- There are a number of comparable municipalities across Canada that have higher resident/voter ratios than HRM;
- There are a number of comparable municipalities across Canada that have a similar or lower resident/voter ratios than HRM;
- Generally, the larger the number of residents/voters per councillor the more likely that the councillor will have direct constituent support.

BUDGET IMPLICATIONS

There are no direct budget implications to this report.

FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT POLICIES / BUSINESS PLAN

This report complies with the Municipality's Multi-Year Financial Strategy, the approved Operating, Capital and Reserve budgets, policies and procedures regarding withdrawals from the utilization of Capital and Operating reserves, as well as any relevant legislation.

ATTACHMENTS

Attachment A: Governance & Boundary Review - Canadian Municipal and Provincial Comparisons
Attachment B: Municipal Representation in Nova Scotia Municipalities

A copy of this report can be obtained online at <http://halifax.ca/boardscom/DistrictBoundaryReviewCommittee.html> or by contacting the Office of the Municipal Clerk at 490-4210, or Fax 490-4208.

Report Prepared by : Cathy Mellett, A/ Clerk Manager, Office of the Municipal Clerk 490-6456
Anne Totten, Corporate Policy Analyst, External & Corporate Affairs

Attachment A - Governance & Boundary Review - Canadian Municipal and Provincial Comparisons

Cross-Canada Scan - Municipal Representation

Municipality/City	Total Population (2006 census)	No. Of Members on Council (plus Mayor)	Citizens per Councillor	Size of Municipality (sq. km)	Type of Government (Ontario has 2 tier Municipal Govt.- except in large urban areas)	Nature (urban, suburban, rural)
Brampton	433,806	10	43,380	270	Local	Urban, Suburban
Calgary	988,193	14	65,879	727	Regional & Local	Urban, Suburban
Edmonton	730,372	12	60,864	684	Regional & Local	Urban, Suburban
Hamilton	504,559	15	31,534	1,117	Regional & Local	Urban, Suburban & Rural
Halifax Regional Municipality	372,858	23	16,203 (18,000 by 2012)	5,490	Regional & Local	Urban, Suburban & Rural
Laval	368,709	21	17,557	247	Regional & Local	Urban, Suburban
London	352,395	18	19,578	420	Local	Urban, Rural
Mississauga	668,549	11	60,777	288	Local	Urban, Suburban
Ottawa	812,129	23	36,817	3,273	Regional & Local	Urban, Suburban, Rural
Peel Regional (Regional level only)	1,159,405	25	46,376	1,242	Regional	Urban, Suburban & Rural
Quebec City	525,376	37	14,200	549	Regional & Local	Urban, Suburban
Regina	179,246	10	17,925	118	Local	Urban, Suburban
Surrey	394,976	8	49,372	317	Regional & Local	Urban, Suburban
Vancouver (City)	578,041	10	52,581	114	Local	Urban
Vaughan	238,866	8	29,858	273	Local	Urban, Suburban
Victoria	78,079	8	9,760	19.68	Local	Urban, Suburban
Waterloo	97,475	8	12,184	1,368	Local	Urban, Suburban
Winnipeg	633,451	15	42,230	464	Regional & Local	Urban, Suburban

Municipality/City	Total Population (2006 census)	No. Of Members on Council (plus Mayor)	Citizens per Councillor	Size of Municipality (sq. km)	Type of Government (Ontario has 2 tier Municipal Govt.- except in large urban areas)	Nature (urban, suburban, rural)
Municipalities in Atlantic Canada						
Charlottetown P.E.I.	35,000	10	3,500	44	Local	Urban, Suburban
Cape Breton Regional NS	102,250	16	6,390	2,500	Regional	Urban, Suburban, Rural
Fredericton NB	50,535	12	4,211	131	Local	Urban
Moncton NB	125,000	10	12,500	146	Local	Urban
St. John's Nfld.	100,646	10	10,065	804	Local	Urban, Suburban
Saint John NB	68,043	10	6,804	317	Local	Urban, Suburban

Cross Canada Scan - Salary and Support Staff

Municipality/City	Salary - Mayor	Salary - Councillors	Councillor Support
Brampton	Comparable to HRM	Comparable to HRM	Combined - one assistant for every 2 Councillors
Calgary	Higher than HRM	Higher than HRM	Each Councillor has one FT executive assistant and one PT constituency assistant. Not City employees but hired by Councillor using ward budget. Also 5 support staff for Council office - these are City employees
Edmonton	Higher than HRM	Higher than HRM	Each Councillor has a FT executive assistant, and most have a PT research assistant - all contract employees hired by councillor, not City employees. Also have 3 AAs to support Council office (City employees).
Hamilton	Comparable to HRM	Comparable to HRM	Each Councillor has one assistant - hired using ward budget, not City employees. Can choose to hire more than one.
HRM	\$139,330 (2009/2010)	\$71,206 (2009/2010)	One assistant shared by 3-4 Councillors. All municipal employees.
Laval	Comparable to HRM	Lower than HRM	Not available
London	Lower than HRM	Lower than HRM	3 assistants for all 14 Councillors - all are City employees

Municipality/City	Salary - Mayor	Salary - Councillors	Councillor Support
Mississauga	Higher than HRM	Higher than HRM	1 executive assistant and 1 admin assistant for each Councillor. They were all City employees; however new hires are contract employees.
Ottawa	Higher than HRM	Higher than HRM	Each Councillor has 2 to 5 assistants, who are City employees on 4-year contracts.
Peel Regional	Higher than HRM	Lower than HRM	Councillors utilize their assistants from home municipality (Brampton, Mississauga, Caledon),
Quebec City	Comparable to HRM	Comparable to HRM	Not available
Regina	Lower than HRM	Lower than HRM	1 assistant for all 10 councillors
St. John's	Lower than HRM	Lower than HRM	No separate Councillor support - they access assistance from Clerk's Office when necessary
Surrey	Comparable to HRM	Comparable to HRM	Not available
Vancouver (City)	Comparable to HRM	Comparable to HRM	4 assistants for 10 Councillors - all are City employees
Vaughan	Comparable to HRM	Comparable to HRM	1 executive assistant for each Councillor (some City employees, but moving towards them being contract). Councillors can hire more from constituency budget if desired
Victoria	Lower than HRM	Lower than HRM	No separate Councillor support - Clerk's Office and departmental staff provide assistance and Councillors do scheduling themselves
Waterloo	Lower than HRM	Lower than HRM	There is one assistant for all 7 Councillors, and one constituency coordinator for all 7 and the Mayor.
Winnipeg	Comparable to HRM	Comparable to HRM	Each Councillor chooses whether to hire an assistant (14 of 15 currently have them). Assistants are not City employees and funds come from ward budgets.
Charlottetown	Lower than HRM	Lower than HRM	1 assistant for all 10 Councillors. Councillors undertake own constituency work.
Moncton	Lower than HRM	Lower than HRM	No separate Councillor support - Councillors get assistance through Clerk's Office when necessary

*Those cities with salaries highlighted indicate a portion of the salary for Mayor and Councillors is non-taxable. "Comparable to HRM" indicates salary levels within +/-10% of current HRM salaries. "Lower than HRM" indicates salaries more than 10% lower than current HRM salaries. "Higher than HRM" indicates salaries more than 10% higher than current HRM salaries.

Provincial Comparatives

Province	Total Population	No. of MLAs	Citizens per MLA	Type of Govt	Nature	Salary- Premier	Salary - MLA	Support Staff
NS Electoral Districts in HRM	NS pop total 938,000 Number in HRM districts 372,858 (2006 census)	52 MLAs total 21 within HRM + 3 that include portion of HRM but extend outside HRM boundaries	Range from Low 9,714 to high 24,194	Provincial	Urban/suburban/ Rural	\$165,500	\$86,619 (all taxable)	Constituency budget provides for office & support staff hired by members (1-2)
Prince Edward Island	140,000	27 MLAs	Average 5,185	Provincial	Urban/suburban/ Rural	\$136,000	\$65,000 (all taxable)	Constituency budget provides for office & support staff hired by members
New Brunswick	749,000	55 MLAs	Average 10,238	Provincial	Urban/suburban/ Rural	\$164,000	\$85,000 (all taxable)	Constituency budget provides for office & support staff hired by members

Attachment B – Municipal Representation in Nova Scotia Municipalities

Municipal Unit	# councillors	size	population	electors	electoral system
Towns					
Amherst	5 + mayor	12.02km ²	9,505	3,929 (2004 elec)	councillors at large
Annapolis Royal	5 + mayor	2.05hec	449	275 (2004 elec)	councillors at large
Antigonish	5 + mayor	5.15km ²	4,238	3,842 (2004 elec)	councillors at large
Berwick	5 + mayor	572 hec	2,454	946 (2004 elec)	councillors at large
Bridgetown	5 + mayor	3.54km ²	1,035	712 (2005 by-elec)	councillors at large
Bridgewater	5 + mayor	13.61km ²	7,994	5,398 (2004 elec)	councillors at large
Canso	5 + mayor	5.4km ²	911	701 (2004 elec)	councillors at large
Clark's Harbour	5 + mayor	2.9km ²	865	584 (2004 elec)	councillors at large
Digby	5 + mayor	840 acres	2,092	1,543 (2004 elec)	councillors at large
Hantsport	5 + mayor	840 acres	1,191	634 (Dec 2008 elec)	councillors at large
Kentville	5 + mayor	17km ²	5,610	5,039 (2004 elec)	councillors at large
Lockeport	4 + mayor	2.48km ²	645	484 (2004 elec)	councillors at large
Lunenburg	5 + mayor	1,000 acres	2,558	1,824 (2004 elec)	councillors at large
Mahone Bay	5 + mayor	3.13km ²	991	584 (2004 elec)	councillors at large
Middleton	5 + mayor	5.5km ²	1,744	1,214 (2004 elec)	councillors at large
Mulgrave	4 + mayor	17.81km ²	879	584 (2004 elec)	councillors at large
New Glasgow	5 + mayor		9,455	7,180 (2005 elec)	8 councillors from 3 districts
Oxford	6 + mayor	1,900 acres	1,352 (1996)	963 (1997 elec)	councillors at large
Parrsboro	4 + mayor	14.98km ²	1,499	982 (2004 elec)	councillors at large
Pictou	4 + mayor	7.74km ²	3,813	3,098 (2004 elec)	4 councillors from 2 wards
Port Hawksbury	4 + mayor	8.35km ²	3,517	2,650 (2004 elec)	councillors at large
Shelburne	6 + mayor	1,280 acres	2,013	1,547 (2004 elec)	councillors at large
Springhill	4 + mayor	11.03km ²	3,941	3,100 (2004 elec)	councillors at large
Stellarton	4 + mayor	4,717	4,717	3,270 (2004 elec)	4 councillors from 2 wards
Stewiacke	4 + mayor	17.87km ²	1,421	589 (2005 by-elec)	councillors at large
Trenton	5 + mayor	1,440 acres	2,741	2,088 (2005 by-elec)	councillors at large
Truro	4 + mayor	11,785	11,785	3,690 (2004 elec)	6 councillors from 3 districts
Westville	5 + mayor	4,147 acres	3,813	2,682 (2004 elec)	4 councillors from 2 districts
Windsor	4 + mayor	2,226 acres	3,778	2,743 (2006 by-elec)	councillors at large
Wolfville	5 + mayor	7.31km ²	3,858	2,673 (2004 elec)	councillors at large
Yarmouth	5 + mayor	1,062 hec	7,162	5,902 (2004 elec)	councillors at large

Municipal Unit	# councillors	size	population	electors	electoral system
Municipalities					
Municipality of the County of Annapolis	11		18,995 ('95)	13,607 (1997 elec)	councillors select warden
Municipality of the County of Antigonish	10		14,239	11,163 (2004 elec)	councillors select warden
Municipality of the District of Argyle	9		8,853	5,484 (2004 elec)	councillors select warden
Municipality of the District of Barrington	7		7,415	5,981 (2004 elec)	councillors select warden
Cape Breton Regional Municipality	13 + mayor		105,988	87,868 (2004 elec)	Mayor elected at large
Municipality of the District of Chester	7		10,741	6,286 (2004 elec)	councillors select warden
Municipality of the District of Clare	8		8,813	7,304 (2004 elec)	councillors select warden
Municipality of the County of Colchester	11 + mayor		32,233	25,995 (2004 elec)	Mayor elected at large
Municipality of the County of Cumberland	10		16,021	11,446 (2004 elec)	councillors select warden
Municipality of the District of Digby	5		7,853	5,950 (2004 elec)	councillors select warden
Municipality of the District of Guysborough	7		5,942 ('96)	4,454 (1997 elec)	councillors select warden
Halifax Regional Municipality	23 + mayor		372,958	258,295 (2004 elec)	Mayor elected at large
District of East Hants	13		22,401	15,246 (2004 elec)	councillors select warden
Municipality of the District of West Hants	9		13,581	10,756 (2004 elec)	councillors select warden
Municipality of the County of Inverness	6		15,519	11,974 (2004 elec)	councillors select warden
Municipality of the County of Kings	11		47,814	30,970 (2004 elec)	councillors select warden
Municipality of the District of Lunenburg	12 + mayor		25,184	17,823 (2004 elec)	Mayor elected at large
Municipality of the County of Pictou	14		21,553	16,467 (2004 elec)	councillors select warden
Region of Queens Municipality	9 + mayor		11,177	5,736 (2004 elec)	Mayor elected at large
Municipality of the County of Richmond	10		9,740	7,717 (2004 elec)	councillors select warden
Municipality of the District of Shelburne	7		4,828	3,480 (2004 elec)	councillors select warden
Municipality of the District of St. Mary's	7		3,042 ('96)	2,276 (1997 elec)	councillors select warden
Municipality of the County of Victoria	6		7,862	5,662 (2004 elec)	councillors select warden
Municipality of the District of Yarmouth	7		10,524	7,574 (2006 fed)	councillors select warden