

**HERITAGE ADVISORY COMMITTEE
MINUTES
SEPTEMBER 29, 2004**

PRESENT:

Mr. Tom Creighton, Vice Chair
Councillor Bob Harvey
Ms. Andrea Arbic
Mr. Ralston MacDonnell
Mr. Bill Meagher
Mr. Elias Metlej
Mr. Mark Pothier
Mr. Jim Trites

STAFF:

Ms. Maggie Holm, Heritage Planner
Mr. Dan Norris, Manager, Culture and Heritage
Ms. Patti Halliday, Legislative Assistant
Ms. Dorothy Amey, Administrative Support

ABSENT:

Mr. Allan MacLellan (Regrets)
Mr. Dale Hall (Regrets)
Mr. Paul MacKinnon (Regrets)
Councillor Dawn Sloane

Table of Contents

1.	APPROVAL OF MINUTES - AUGUST 19, 2004	3
2.	APPROVAL OF THE ORDER OF BUSINESS, ADDITIONS AND DELETIONS .	3
3.	BUSINESS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES	3
4.	CONSIDERATION OF NEW BUSINESS	3
4.1	H00139 - Application for Registration of 6324 York Street	3
4.2	H00143 - Application for Registration of 2370 Moran Street	4
4.3	H00146 - Application for alterations (windows) at 5663 Inglis Street	6
4.4	Heritage Incentives Program - Fall 2004	7
5.	INFORMATION ITEMS	7
5.1	Approval letters - Various letters 5.1A - 5.1L	7
5.2	Extracts from Regional / Community Council Minutes - None	7
6.	UPDATES	7
6.1	Heritage Matters Binder updates - Registered Property listings	7
6.2	HAC Calendar for the balance of 2004	7
7.	ADDED ITEMS	7
7.1	Heritage Case H00147 - Review of Proposed Exterior Alterations to 78 Shore Road (a municipal heritage property), Dartmouth, NS	7
8.	DATE OF NEXT MEETING	8

Mr. Creighton, Vice Chair, called the meeting to order at 4:15 p.m.

1. APPROVAL OF MINUTES - AUGUST 19, 2004

MOVED by Councillor Harvey, seconded by Mark Pothier, that the minutes of August 19, 2004 be approved, as circulated. MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

2. APPROVAL OF THE ORDER OF BUSINESS, ADDITIONS AND DELETIONS

The following items were added to the agenda:

7.1 Heritage Case H00147 - Review of Proposed Exterior Alterations to 78 Shore Road (a municipal heritage property), Dartmouth, NS

7.2 Demolition Controls

3. BUSINESS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES

4. CONSIDERATION OF NEW BUSINESS

4.1 H00139 - Application for Registration of 6324 York Street

C A staff report prepared for Jim Donovan, Manager, Planning Applications, regarding the above, was before the Committee for its consideration.

Ms. Alfreda Withrow, Researcher, presented her report to the Committee. Councillor Harvey also provided some information on this property as it was once the home of his great-grandfather.

The Committee then proceeded to score the property using the newly adopted revised evaluation criteria.

SCORING SUMMARY

Criterion	Highest Possible Score	Score Awarded
1. Age <i>This building was constructed in 1884.</i>	25	13

2. a) Relationship to Important Occasions, Institutions, Personages or Groups OR 2. b) Important/Unique Architectural Style or Highly Representative of an Era <i>This Italianate style building is a good representative of its era and most finishes appear to be original.</i>	20	12
3. Significance of Architect/Builder <i>No information available to identify the architect/builder</i>	10	0
4. a) Architectural Merit: Construction type/building technology <i>Balloon frame, fairly common, moderately early example</i>	10	5
4. b) Architectural Merit: Style <i>Italianate</i>	10	5
5. Architectural Integrity <i>The building is largely unchanged</i>	15	15
6. Relationship to Surrounding Area <i>This building is an important architectural asset</i>	10	10
Total	100	60

The Committee agreed to proceed with the next evaluation before making a decision on this application.

4.2 H00143 - Application for Registration of 2370 Moran Street

C A staff report prepared for Jim Donovan, Manager, Planning Applications, regarding

the above, was before the Committee for its consideration.

Ms. Alfreda Withrow, Researcher, presented her report to the Committee.

The Committee then proceeded to score the property with the following results:

SCORING SUMMARY

Criterion	Highest Possible Score	Score Awarded
1. Age <i>This building was constructed between 1866-68</i>	25	13
2. a) Relationship to Important Occasions, Institutions, Personages or Groups OR <i>This building has national importance in light of Dr. Oswald Theodore Avery's accomplishments.</i> 2. b) Important/Unique Architectural Style or Highly Representative of an Era	20	20
3. Significance of Architect/Builder <i>This building was constructed by a local master carpenter.</i>	10	3
4. a) Architectural Merit: Construction type/building technology <i>Moderately rare/early example</i>	10	5
4. b) Architectural Merit: Style <i>Moderately rare/early example</i>	10	5

5. Architectural Integrity <i>There have been some modest changes made to this building.</i>	15	6
6. Relationship to Surrounding Area <i>Although this building contributes to the street scape, it is the most modified building.</i>	10	5
Total	100	57

A discussion ensued regarding the total score required for designation. Several members of the Committee stated it was their understanding that the passing score agreed upon was lower than 65. It was the general consensus of the Committee that 65 points was unrealistic and a qualifying score of 50 points would be more appropriate. Mr. Norris noted a typographical error in Section 1 - Age, noting the phrase "following construction" should read "before construction." Therefore, the following motion was put:

MOVED by Ralston MacDonnell, seconded by Mark Pothier, that the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend to Regional Council that the Evaluation Criteria be modified to correct the qualifying score (50 points) and the typographical error in Section 1 - Age. MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

MOVED by Andrea Arbic, seconded by Ralston MacDonnell, that the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend to Regional Council that 6324 York Street, Halifax, and 2370 Moran Street, Halifax, be registered under the HRM Heritage Property Program, pending Council's approval of the revised evaluation criteria. MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

As Mr. MacDonnell had to leave early, it was agreed to deal with Item 7.2 Demolition Controls at this time.

7.2 Demolition Controls

Mr. MacDonnell provided a brief verbal update regarding the work of the sub-committee with respect to demolition controls. The sub-committee recently met and its recommendation to the Committee was to encourage HRM to undertake a public forum on the broader issue of a heritage management plan, not just demolition controls. Representatives from other areas who have experience in this issue could be invited to attend. Mr. MacDonnell suggested if the Committee felt this was the right direction, the sub-committee is willing to continue to work on

this in detail and come back to the Committee at its next meeting with a plan as to how this can take place. The sub-committee could also explore the possibility of obtaining partnerships in this initiative.

Ms. Holm noted there are a lot of internal stakeholders that need to be involved as well. Mr. Creighton suggested that this time be placed on the October agenda for further discussion. In the meantime, the initiative could be discussed at the staff level.

(Mr. MacDonnell left the meeting at 5:25 p.m.)

4.3 H00146 - Application for alterations (windows) at 5663 Inglis Street

C A staff report prepared for Jim Donovan, Manager, Planning Applications, regarding the above, was before the Committee for its consideration.

Ms. Maggie Holm, Heritage Planner, presented the report to the Committee noting staff is recommending the applicant maintain the one over one window style, with approval to use a vinyl product, as opposed to a “tilt and turn” style.

MOVED by Andrea Arbic, seconded by Jim Trites, that the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend approval of the alterations to 5663 Inglis Street, as proposed by staff in the September 1, 2004 report. MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

4.4 Heritage Incentives Program - Fall 2004

C A report prepared by Dan Norris, Regional Coordinator, Heritage Incentive Program, regarding the above, was before the Committee for its consideration.

Mr. Norris presented Table 1 of the report to the Committee.

MOVED by Mark Pothier, seconded by Andrea Arbic, that the Heritage Advisory Committee provide support for Table One: List of Recommended Heritage Incentives proposed by Halifax Regional Municipality staff in the report to the Committee dated September 23, 2004. MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

Mr. Norris proceeded to present Table 2 of the report. In his presentation, it was noted that Planning staff have now approved the applications for 7 Newcastle Street and 47 Pleasant Street. It was also noted that 17 George Street has recently been sold and, therefore, the application was withdrawn at this time. With regard to 1300 Hollis Street, it was noted that the owner is now considering a wooden sign and the application will be brought back at a later date.

MOVED by Mark Pothier, seconded by Andrea Arbic, that the Heritage Advisory Committee provide support for Table Two: List of Pending Heritage Incentive Recommended Heritage Incentives (with the exception of 17 George and 1300 Hollis Street) proposed by Halifax Regional Municipality staff in the report to the Committee dated September 23, 2004, pending further review and approval as a Level One alteration by Planning staff. **MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.**

5. INFORMATION ITEMS

5.1 Approval letters - Various letters 5.1A - 5.1L

5.2 Extracts from Regional / Community Council Minutes - None

6. UPDATES

6.1 Heritage Matters Binder updates - Registered Property listings

6.2 HAC Calendar for the balance of 2004

7. ADDED ITEMS

7.1 Heritage Case H00147 - Review of Proposed Exterior Alterations to 78 Shore Road (a municipal heritage property), Dartmouth, NS

C A staff report prepared for Jim Donovan, Manager, Planning Applications, regarding the above, was circulated to the Committee for its consideration.

Ms. Maggie Holm, Heritage Planner, presented the report to the Committee.

MOVED by Mark Pothier, seconded by Jim Trites, that the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend approval of the alterations to 78 Shore Road, as presented in the staff report dated September 24, 2004. **MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.**

7.2 Demolition Controls

This item was addressed earlier in the meeting.

8. DATE OF NEXT MEETING

The date of the next meeting will be October 27, 2004.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 5:50 p.m.

Patti Halliday
Legislative Assistant