

**HERITAGE ADVISORY COMMITTEE
October 24, 2007
MINUTES**

PRESENT:

Mr. Tom Creighton, Chair
Councillor Dawn Sloane
Councillor Bob Harvey
Mr. Paul Shakotko
Mr. Stephen Terauds
Mr. Clarence Butler
Mr. Elias Metlej
Mr. Mark Pothier

REGRETS:

Ms. Dianne Marshall
Ms. Lisa Miller
Mr. Michael Cross

STAFF:

Ms. Maggie Holm, Heritage Planner
Mr. Bill Plaskett, Heritage Planner
Ms. Jennifer Weagle, Legislative Assistant

Table of Contents

| | | |
|-----|--|---|
| 1. | CALL TO ORDER | 3 |
| 2. | APPROVAL OF MINUTES - September 26, 2007 | 3 |
| 3. | APPROVAL OF THE ORDER OF BUSINESS, ADDITIONS AND DELETIONS | 3 |
| 4. | BUSINESS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES | 3 |
| 5. | DEFERRED BUSINESS | 3 |
| 6. | CORRESPONDENCE, PETITIONS & DELEGATIONS | 3 |
| 6.1 | Correspondence | 3 |
| 6.2 | Petitions | 3 |
| 6.3 | Presentations | 4 |
| 6.4 | Updates from HAC members | 4 |
| 7. | REPORTS | 4 |
| 7.1 | H00208: Subdivision of 1572 Barrington Street / 1575 Argyle Street, Halifax .. | 4 |
| 7.2 | H00210: Application to consider 22404 Highway #7 (MacPhee House), Sheet Harbour, as a Municipal Heritage Property | 4 |
| 8. | ADDED ITEMS | 6 |
| 9. | DATE OF NEXT MEETING - Wednesday, November 28, 2007 | 6 |
| 10. | ADJOURNMENT | 7 |

1. **CALL TO ORDER**

The Chair called the meeting to order at 3:01 p.m. in the Media Room, 1st Floor, 1841 Argyle Street, Halifax.

2. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES** - September 26, 2007

MOVED by Mark Pothier, seconded by Clarence Butler, that the minutes of September 26, 2007 be approved, as distributed. MOTION PUT AND PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

3. **APPROVAL OF THE ORDER OF BUSINESS, ADDITIONS AND DELETIONS**

The agenda was agreed upon as distributed.

Mr. Elias Metledge noted concern with the time it takes to receive funding through the HRM Heritage Incentive Program.

The Committee discussed the application, approval, and execution process, noting concern with residents having to hold projects pending funding, or waiting an unreasonable amount of time to be reimbursed for projects already completed. Committee members indicated the importance to have set expectations for heritage property owners applying for funding through this program.

Councillor Sloane arrived at 3:11 p.m.

MOVED by Clarence Butler, seconded by Mark Pothier, that the Heritage Advisory Committee request that a letter be written to HRM legal staff requesting a review of the process, and suggesting that 30 days for execution of the funding process would be a reasonable time frame.

Mr. Bill Plaskett, Heritage Planner, indicated that the process is also dependant on the property owner, with regard to a timely submission of the agreement, receipts, etc.

MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

4. **BUSINESS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES** - None

5. **DEFERRED ITEMS** - None

6. **CORRESPONDENCE, PETITIONS & DELEGATIONS**

6.1 **Correspondence** - None

6.2 **Petitions** - None

6.3 **Presentations** - None

6.4 **Updates from HAC members - HRM Committees and HAC Sub-Committees** - None

7. **REPORTS**

7.1 **Case H00208: Subdivision of 1572 Barrington Street / 1575 Argyle Street, Halifax**

C A staff report dated October 2, 2007 on the above noted was before the Committee.

Mr. Bill Plaskett, Heritage Planner, advised that this is an application by the property owner to subdivide 1572 Barrington Street / 1575 Argyle Street (former NFB Building and Argyle Bar & Grill), to enable the Barrington Street portion of the project to be financed and developed separately from the Argyle Street portion. He advised that the question before the Committee, from a heritage perspective is whether the proposed subdivision will affect the heritage value of the registered property. Mr. Plaskett reviewed the October 2, 2007 staff report with the Committee, noting the following:

- C The Barrington property was first built as St. Mary's Young Men's Total Abstinence and Benevolent Society Hall in 1891 and was Halifax's first movie theater, the Nickle Theater in 1907;
- C The building was destroyed by fire in 1991; however, the facade remains under heritage agreement;
- C Federal funding is no longer available for the owner's 2006 application and the project is currently on hold;
- C The owner wishes to subdivide to be able to finance projects separately.
- C Both proposed lots would retain heritage registration.

MOVED by Councillor Sloane, seconded by Mark Pothier, that the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend that Regional Council:

1. **Approve of the subdivision of 1572 Barrington Street / 1575 Argyle Street creating Lots CPR-E1 and CPR-E2, as shown on subdivision application file #13933; and**
2. **Approve an amendment to the 1997 Heritage Agreement respecting the stabilization and retention of the facade of 1572 Barrington Street whereby the Schedule "A" property description is amended to apply only to Lot CPR-E1.**

Councillor Harvey indicated a desire to have the Barrington facade developed soon.

MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

7.2 Case H00210: Application to consider 22404 Highway #7 (MacPhee House), Sheet Harbour, as a Municipal Heritage Property

C A staff report dated September 19, 2007 on the above noted was before the Committee.

Ms. Maggie Holm, Heritage Planner, advised that this is a staff initiated request to consider 22404 Highway #7 (MacPhee House), Sheet Harbour, which is an HRM owned property, as a Municipal Heritage Property. She reviewed the staff report with the Committee, including the history of the property, age of the building, ownership, relationship to personage, and architectural merit.

Ms. Holm responded to questions from Committee members, noting the following:

- C The original structure was built in 1875 and was enlarged in 1911;
- C The building was formerly located at civic # 22534, and was purchased and relocated by the Province in 1985 to avoid demolition;
- C The building is significant to the community;
- C Staff suggest the Newfoundland historic colour palette for heritage property colours;
- C The building houses an HRM tourist information centre on the bottom floor and a community museum on the top floor.

The Committee scored the property as follows, as per the Evaluation Criteria for Registration of Heritage Buildings:

| Criterion | Highest Possible Score | Score Awarded |
|--|------------------------|---------------|
| 1. Age | 25 | 13 |
| 2. a) Relationship to Important Occasions, Institutions, Personages or Groups OR 2. b) Important/Unique Architectural Style or Highly Representative of an Era | 20 | 15 |
| 3. Significance of Architect/Builder | 10 | 1 |
| 4. a) Architectural Merit: Construction type/building technology | 10 | 4 |
| 4. b) Architectural Merit: Style | 10 | 4 |
| 5. Architectural Integrity | 15 | 5 |

| | | |
|-------------------------------------|------------|-----------|
| 6. Relationship to Surrounding Area | 10 | 8 |
| Total | 100 | 50 |

SCORE NECESSARY FOR DESIGNATION 50

The Committee discussed the categories of the scoring mechanism and revisited the relationship to area and architectural integrity categories.

Ms. Holm clarified the following at the request of Committee members:

- C If the Committee chose to make amendments to the scoring mechanism, this property would have to be deferred, the amended criteria would have to be approved by Council, and then the property would be rescored;
- C There are fewer older buildings intact in the area of the subject property and it is one of the oldest properties on map 1 of the staff report;
- C The builder is unknown.

Committee members discussed the property, noting the following:

- C The ell was an addition but it was partially removed during relocation;
- C The removal of the shutters is the only significant change to the original structure.

MOVED by Councillor Sloane, seconded by Clarence Butler, that the Heritage Advisory Committee recommend that Regional Council:

- 1. Set a date for a heritage hearing to consider the application; and**
- 2. Approve the registration of 22404 Highway #7 (MacPhee House), Sheet Harbour, (as shown on Map 1 of the September 19, 2007 staff report) under the HRM Heritage Property Program.**

The Chair suggested that shutters be reconstructed on the original structure.

MOTION PUT AND PASSED.

Mr. Shakotko left the meeting at 4:00 p.m.

- 8. ADDED ITEMS - None**
- 9. DATE OF NEXT MEETING - Wednesday, November 28, 2007**

The next meeting of the Heritage Advisory Committee is scheduled for Wednesday, November 28, 2007 at 3:00 p.m. in Halifax Hall, second floor, City Hall.

Mr. Stephen Terauds indicated that he will advise Committee members of the next HRM By Design public forum dates.

10. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 4:10 p.m.

Jennifer Weagle
Legislative Assistant