10.1.1



Halifax Regional Council November 19, 2002

TO: Mayor Kelly and Members of Halifax Regional Council

SUBMITTED BY: George McLellan, Chief Administrative Officer

Dan English, Deputy Chief Administrative Officer

DATE: November 12, 2002

SUBJECT: Award of RFP 02-160 - Building Environmental Assessments and Pre-

Demolition Services

ORIGIN

This report originates with the issuance of the above public Request for Proposals.

RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended that:

- 1. Council award RFP 02-160 to Dillon Consulting Ltd. for the total sum of \$246,220 to carry out the work described in the Discussions Section contained in this report for the municipal properties identified.
- 2. Council approve funding to a maximum amount of \$144,340.00 for environmental and pre-demolition consulting services from Property Clearing Account HSOLREST to be recovered from the future sale proceeds resulting from the pending rationalization of each property.

BACKGROUND

Over the past year staff has advanced a number of surplus property recommendations to Council that resulted in a number of positive disposal and development arrangements. As part of staff's continuing effort to optimize and rationalize its real property holdings, the following properties were identified as strategic opportunities:

- ► Former Halifax Transfer Station, Bayne Street, Halifax
- ▶ Former HCRRC, Bissett Road, Cole Harbour
- Former Halifax West High School, Dutch Village Road, Halifax
- ► Former Texpark Garage, Hollis and Granville Streets, Halifax

The combined size of the facilities at these locations is approximately 253,000 square feet, with a land area of approximately 65.4 acres.

In the summer and fall of 2002 Council formally endorsed an action plan to allow staff to advance the necessary planning initiatives and site development investigations and works to allow for the future redevelopment of these above properties.

DISCUSSION

As per Council's direction staff issued a request for proposals in August, 2002, seeking a consultant to carry out environmental and/or pre-demolition services for the above noted properties.

The scope of services requested in the RFP included the following for the above four sites:

- ▶ Phase I and Phase II Environmental Assessments
- ▶ Geotechnical Survey (Former Halifax Transfer Station only)
- ▶ Hazardeous Materials Survey
- ▶ Heritage Resource Identification
- Design and Tender Documents for Demolition
- ► Tender and Demolition Supervision
- Demolition Project Cost Estimate
- ▶ Implementation Plan

In addition to this, staff felt it may also be advantageous to include environmental assessments only for 3825 MacKintosh Street and 3790 MacKintosh Street as part of an expanded scope for the Bayne Street property given the proximity of the these sites to the subject. Council should be advised that there are no medium term plans to abandon the existing PW&T operation at 3825 MacKintosh Street.

A total of eight consulting firms responded to the proposal call. Not all firms however expressed an interest in providing services for all property locations, with some firms only interested in providing services for selected locations. Each proposal was then evaluated and scored according to the following predefined criteria:

Technical component:

Proponent's Team, relevant experience and capabilities	40%
Approach to work, schedules, work plan	25%
Submission quality	5%

Financial:

Fee proposal and acceptance of terms and conditions 30%

The detailed evaluation of the submissions is provided as Attachment 1. The results of evaluation analysis yielded Dillon Consulting Ltd. as the best combined technical submission and cost structure to HRM for all locations. Dillon placed first in the combined score for each location.

Following the completion of the above work plan, staff will advance the building demolitions based on a priority basis. The award of the demolition contracts will be subject to Council approval at a later date.

BUDGET IMPLICATIONS

The site development costs identified in this report will be funded from Property Clearing Account HSOLREST to be recovered from the future sale proceeds for each property.

Funding Summary								
Property Name	Total Project Costs	Available Funding to date	Funding to be Approved through this report.					
Former Halifax West High School	\$46,251	\$35,000	\$11,251					
Former HCRRC	\$58,691	\$50,000	\$8,691					
Former Tex Park Parkade	\$44,171	\$0	\$44,171					
Former Halifax transfer Station	\$44,695	\$30,000	\$14,695					
3825 MacKintosh St.	\$24,594	\$0	\$24,594					
3790 MacKintosh St.	\$12,945	\$0	\$12,945					
Sub-total	\$231,347	\$115,000	\$116,347					
Net HST	\$14,873		\$14,873					
Total	\$246,220	\$115,000	\$131,220					

Due to the fact that this type of work is exploratory in nature meant to bring more solidity to the demolition costs, there is the possibility further soil test holes could become necessary. Therefore, it is strongly recommended Council approve a contingency of 10 percent to be accessed only if actual site conditions require additional investigation beyond the scope already included. This would bring the total maximum amount possible to a **total of \$144,340**.

The timely management and redevelopment of these parcels, in full or in part, will generate significant revenue and other strategic private and public benefits. Through the Business Planning process, these benefits will create additional capacity to allow the Municipality to reinvest in its core services and infrastructure.

FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT POLICIES/BUSINESS PLAN

This report complies with the Municipality's Multi-Year Financial Strategy, the approved Operating, Capital and Reserve budgets, policies and procedures regarding withdrawals from the utilization of Capital and Operating reserves, as well as any relevant legislation.

ALTERNATIVES

One alternative staff investigated would be to award based on individual sites to the proponent submitting the lowest fee proposal. This was evaluated but is not the recommended action for several reasons. Firstly, it would be counter to the pre-defined selection criteria included in the RFP proposal call. Environmental studies are quite technical in nature and can become complicated depending on site conditions, and thus, a significant portion of scoring examined the technical abilities of each proponent, their previous experience, their proposed team and their work plan. If not done thoroughly, there is a risk it can impact the future costs. This alternative would award three sites, including two of the largest, to the proponent who submitted the lowest scoring technical proposal. Finally, the recommended proposal offers an administrative advantage to HRM to manage all six sites with one proponent. Selecting the alternative would unbundle the sites.

ATTACHMENTS

Attachment 1 - RFP Evaluation Scoring Summary

Attachment 2 - Fee Evaluation

Additional copies of this report, and information on its status, can be obtained by contacting the office of the Municipal Clerk at 490-4210, or Fax 490-4208.

Report Prepared by:

Doug Rafuse, Manager, Service Delivery, Real Property Services (490-6205)

Report Approved by:

Mike Labrecque, Director, Real Property Services (490-4851)

Attachment 1 - Evaluation Scoring Summary

HALIFAX REGIONAL MUNICIPALITY PROFESSIONAL CONSULTING SERVICES FOR ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND PRE DEMOLITION MANAGEMENT FOR BUILDINGS PROPOSAL EVALUATION RFP # 02-160

PROPOSAL: Professional Cons. Services for Environmental Assessment and Pre Demolition Management for Buildings				EVALUATED BY: REAL PROPERTY SERVICES AND PROCUREMENT						
CRITERIA	MAX	PROPERTY	SUBMISSION							
	SCORE		AMEC	CBCL	Dillon	Jacques Whitford	Maritime Testing	Neill & Gunter	SNC- Lavalin	Vaughan Eng
* Proponent's team * Relevant experience or firm and team members * work plan * work breakdown schedules *approach	70		53.3	54.7	59.7	65.1	50.0	60.2	51.0	55.2
FEE PROPOSAL::	30	Halifax West	N/A	19.0	24.5	2.3	30	3.0	N/A	0
TROI GOAL		HCRRC	N/A	N/A	26.0	0	30	14.7	N/A	13.5
		Tex Park Parkade	15.60	N/A	30	0	N/A	4.7	N/A	14.2
		Halifax Transfer Station	9.7	N/A	30	6.7	N/A	0	N/A	4.6
		3825 MacKintosh	11.7	N/A	26.4	N/A	30	0	8.8	26.8
		3790 MacKintosh	0	N/A	30	N/A	N/A	14.9	17.5	22.9
10 (10 m) 10 (10 m)										
TOTAL SCORE	100	Halifax West	N/A	73.7	84.2	67.4	80.0	63.2	N/A	55.2
		HCRRC	N/A	N/A	85.7	65.1	80.0	74.9	N/A	68.7
		Tex Park Parkade	68.9	N/A	89.7	65.1	N/A	64.9	N/A	69.4
		Halifax Transfer Station	63.0	N/A	89.7	71.8	N/A	60.2	N/A	59.8
		3825 MacKintosh	65.0	N/A	86.1	N/A	80.0	60.2	59.8	82.0
		3790 MacKintosh	53.3	N/A	89.7	N/A	N/A	75.1	68.5	78.1

Note: Fee Proposal scoring was arrived at using a pre-defined formula that awarded 30 points to the firm with the lowest fees, 0 points to the firm with the highest fees, and a sliding scale to award weighted points to all those in between, for each facility location. N/A denotes proponents who did not submit bid for that particular property.

Attachment 2 - Fee Evaluation

Table 2A - Recommended Option

Facility	AMEC	CBCL	Dillon	JWEL	Maritime Testing	Neill & Gunter	SNC Lavalin	Vaughn
Halifax West	N/A	\$60,054.00	\$46,251.00	\$102,119.00	\$32,466.00	\$100,350.00	N/A	\$107,955.00
HCRRC	N/A	N/A	\$58,691.00	\$172,937.00	\$41,000.00	\$108,450.00	N/A	\$113,600.00
Tex Park Parkade	\$73,585.00	N/A	\$44,171.00	\$105,578.00	N/A	\$96,500.00	N/A	\$76,467.00
Halifax Transfer Station	\$74,560.00	N/A	\$44,695.00	\$79,036.00	N/A	\$89,000.00	N/A	\$82,246.00
3825 MacKintosh	\$37,330.00	N/A	\$24,594.00	N/A	\$21,416.00	\$47,550.00	\$39,905.00	\$24,201.00
3790 MacKintosh	\$37,330.00	N/A	\$12,945.00	N/A	N/A	\$25,200.00	\$23,105.00	\$18,692.00

Total of all shaded boxes = \$231,347, not including taxes.

Table 2B - Alternative

Facility	AMEC	CBCL	Dillon	JWEL	Maritime Testing	Neill & Gunter	SNC Lavalin	Vaughn
Halifax West	N/A	\$60,054.00	\$48,429.00	\$102,119.00	\$32,466.00	\$100,350.00	N/A	\$107,955.00
HCRRC	N/A	N/A	\$62,945.00	\$172,937.00	\$41,000.00	\$108,450.00	N/A	\$113,600.00
Tex Park Parkade	\$73,585.00	N/A	\$47,911.00	\$105,578.00	N/A	\$96,500.00	N/A	\$76,467.00
Halifax Transfer Station	\$74,560.00	N/A	\$43,149.00	\$79,036.00	N/A	\$89,000.00	N/A	\$82,246.00
3825 MacKintosh	\$37,330.00	N/A	\$26,472.00	N/A	\$21,416.00	\$47,550.00	\$39,905.00	\$24,201.00
3790 MacKintosh	\$37,330.00	N/A	\$14,301.00	N/A	N/A	\$25,200.00	\$23,105.00	\$18,692.00

Total of all shaded boxes = \$200,243, not including taxes