

**HALIFAX REGIONAL MUNICIPALITY**

---

**HALIFAX REGIONAL COUNCIL  
COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE  
MINUTES**

**November 10, 2009**

**REVISED**

PRESENT: Mayor Peter Kelly  
Deputy Mayor David Hendsbee  
Councillors: Steve Streach  
Barry Dalrymple  
Lorelei Nicoll  
Gloria McCluskey  
Darren Fisher  
Bill Karsten  
Jackie Barkhouse  
Jim Smith  
Mary Wile  
Jerry Blumenthal  
Dawn Sloane  
Sue Uteck  
Jennifer Watts  
Russell Walker  
Debbie Hum  
Linda Mosher  
Stephen Adams  
Brad Johns  
Robert Harvey  
Tim Outhit  
Peter Lund  
Reg Rankin

REGRETS: None

STAFF: Mr. Dan English, Chief Administrative Officer  
Ms. Mary Ellen Donovan, Municipal Solicitor  
Ms. Cathy Mellett, Acting Municipal Clerk  
Ms. Christen MacDonald, Acting Municipal Clerk  
Ms. Melody Campbell, Legislative Assistant  
Ms. Krista Tidgwell, Legislative Assistant

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

1.	CALL TO ORDER .....	3
2.	APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES - October 20 & 27, 2009 .....	3 & 6
3.	METRO TRANSIT FIVE-YEAR STRATEGIC OPERATIONS PLAN .....	3
4.	REVIEW OF SOCIAL HERITAGE PROGRAMS AND SERVICES .....	7 & 11
5.	FORMER DARTMOUTH CITY HALL - MUSEUM .....	7&11
	(I) Community Council Report	
	(ii) Staff Report	
6.	REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL 09-070 - LEASED OFFICE ACCOMMODATIONS .....	12
7.	COMMITTEES OF COUNCIL REFORM .....	12
8.	ADJOURNMENT .....	12

1. **CALL TO ORDER**

The meeting was called to order at 9:40 a.m.

2. **APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES - October 20 & 27, 2009**

Approval of the Minutes was addressed following Item 3 - Metro Transit Five-Year Strategic Operations Plan. See Page 6.

3. **METRO TRANSIT FIVE-YEAR STRATEGIC OPERATIONS PLAN**

- The Metro Transit Five-Year Strategic Operations Plan dated October 7, 2009 was before Council.
- A Report dated October 9, 2009 was before Council.

The Metro Transit Five-Year Strategic Plan is a continuation from the October 27, 2009 Committee of the Whole.

The following motion was on the floor from the previous Committee of the Whole meeting of October 27, 2009.

**MOVED by Councillor Rankin, seconded by Councillor Streach, that Halifax Regional Council receive the Metro Transit Five - Year Strategic Operations Plan and request staff to bring forward a report relative to the corresponding Operational and Capital Plans and responding to concerns and questions of members of Council regarding the Plan.**

The Council discussion continued relative to this matter.

Councillor Sloane raised a concern regarding the lack of a shuttle service in downtown Halifax noting that many businesses and shops could benefit from such a service. She added that many downtown residents, especially senior citizens, do not want to use their vehicles for short trips and that the shuttle would be of benefit to these individuals. She requested staff provide information to Council on the green initiatives being considered by Metro Transit. She advised that the Woodside Ferry service needs to be enhanced.

Councillor Dalrymple expressed concern regarding a lack of transit services in the rural areas. He questioned whether the money spent on this five year plan will take away from future funding. He raised concern regarding the possibility of losing the opportunity to benefit from the \$450,000 offer from the Halifax International Airport Authority. He advised that this is funding offered by the Authority to purchase buses for the Metro X expansion. He stated that the Five-Year Strategic Operational Plan is an urban plan not a rural plan.

Mr. Labrecque, Director of Transportation & Public Works, advised Council that staff are currently looking at urban base standards with rural base standards to follow.

Councillor Watts advised that there are long term issues regarding transit in the urban core. She added that Peninsula Community Council is considering establishing a regional transportation committee to deal with these issues. She expressed the importance of citizen participation in the decision process. She advised that light rail transportation could be a future consideration, although she acknowledged that light rail may be too expensive for HRM.

Councillor Nicoll stated that the parking strategy should be utilized as an incentive to use public transit.

Councillor Blumenthal advised that transit rates for seniors should be frozen, as many seniors are on a fixed income. He requested staff provide additional information on the issues and financial figures regarding fare technology. He expressed concern that Metro Transit may be losing money on passenger transfers.

Councillor Sloane stated that bus service and connections need to improve for passengers using the ferry service. She expressed the need for bus service to the airport. The Councillor raised concern that the five-year plan is based on the Regional Plan and not HRMbyDesign. She reiterated the need for increased service capacity in the downtown core.

Councillor Uteck expressed concern on voting for a transit plan without the financial plan in place. She added that HRM, in addition to improved downtown transit service, has to work to build the downtown area and initiate the historical plan as was approved in HRMbyDesign. She expressed her concern that if Council approves this plan, other funding programs may not be addressed. The Councillor noted that light rail service would be difficult for HRM to initiate, as the tracks have been removed.

Councillor Hum advised that the five-year strategy is the direction that is required in HRM. She stated that HRM has to move passengers and has to entice citizens out of their cars. The Councillor added that the Metro Link is long overdue. She stated that Peninsula transit issues are key issues, although she does not necessarily agree with a free downtown shuttle.

Councillor Walker reminded Council that transit is not a free service noting that any expansion costs money. The Councillor asked how many routes come in to the Peninsula from other areas of HRM each day and he questioned if these routes could be used as a shuttle.

In response to a question by Councillor Rankin, staff advised that the financial plan is similar to a utility approach. Mr. Robar, Manager of Planning & Project Development, stated that staff will prepare specifics with costs and Council will decide the appropriate services determined by the year to year budget.

In response to a query by Councillor Karsten, staff advised that Mr. McCusker, Manager of Regional Transportation, continues to meet with the Halifax International Airport Authority to discuss transit services. Staff advised that it is anticipated a report will be provided to Council in the near future on this matter.

Councillor Karsten requested an amendment to the Motion:

**MOVED BY Councillor Karsten, seconded by Councillor McCluskey, that the motion be amended to approve the Service Standards for staff to use as a template.**

Council recessed at 10:45 a.m.

Council reconvened at 11:00 a.m.

Ms. Donovan, Municipal Solicitor, advised Council that the amendment to the motion is inconsistent with the original motion, therefore, it should not become part of the motion on the floor. Due to the clarification provided by Ms. Donovan, no vote was taken on the amendment.

Councillor Dalrymple advised that all financial options must be considered and that light rail transportation should remain a consideration.

In response to a question by Councillor Wile, staff advised that they would clarify the boundaries in the report.

In response to a question by Councillor Outhit, Mr. Labrecque advised Council that staff plan to meet with all Councillors to receive their input on the plan.

Councillor Outhit advised that many areas are growing and will require increased service. Mr. Labrecque added that service standards will be addressed in the first year, with capacity and operating funding being discussed. He added the plan will evolve as it moves forward.

Councillor McCluskey stated that transit service must be considered for Burnside as it is an integral growth area. The Councillor suggested the option of charging patrons for parking at the Park & Rides throughout HRM.

Councillor Smith suggested that a Burnside shuttle be considered. He requested an

update on why Route 51 was cut and asked that he be provided with the number of passengers that will be affected by this decision.

Councillor Hum requested that staff provide an update of the light rail transportation initiative and provide a history of why this idea is not considered at this time, for example, information on implementation and costing. She added that HRM has to move people in the most effective means while taking sustainability into account. She questioned the level of service of urban areas compared to the rural areas.

Councillor Watts requested staff provide costing on road construction, operation, and maintenance which enables vehicle traffic. She suggested that transit terminals could be considered as part of the plan, looking at features such as bike connectivity, amenities and safety. She added that good design of planned integrated terminals would make transit travel more appealing.

Councillor Sloane suggested that the downtown shuttle could be half price with patrons using a reusable card for payment.

Councillor Nicoll suggested that staff provide a yearly implementation plan to Council.

Councillor Rankin called for the question on the motion. The motion on the floor is as follows:

**MOVED by Councillor Rankin, seconded by Councillor Streach, that Halifax Regional Council receive the Metro Transit Five - Year Strategic Operations Plan and request staff to bring forward a report relative to the corresponding Operational and Capital Plans and responding to concerns and questions of members of Council regarding the Plan. MOTION PUT AND PASSED.**

**MOVED BY Councillor Karsten, seconded by Councillor McCluskey, that Regional Council approve the Service Standards for staff to use as a template. MOTION PUT AND PASSED.**

Council recessed at 12:02 p.m.

Council reconvened at 1:31 p.m.

**2. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES - October 20 & 27, 2009**

**MOVED BY Councillor Blumenthal, seconded by Councillor Sloane, that the minutes of October 20, 2009, as presented, be approved. MOTION PUT AND PASSED.**

Referring to the October 27, 2009 Minutes:

Councillor Sloane noted that on page 9, her comment regarding the \$1.3 million that had been allocated to support the downtown shuttle had not been included in the minutes.

Councillor Wile also noted that on page 2, her comment regarding the second largest population should have read the second largest number of passengers.

Councillor Nicoll noted that on page 2, her comment regarding smart cars should have read smart cards.

**MOVED BY Councillor Blumenthal, seconded by Councillor Sloane, that the minutes of October 27, 2009, as amended, be approved. MOTION PUT AND PASSED.**

**MOVED BY Councillor McCluskey, seconded by Councillor Lund, that item 5: Former Dartmouth City Hall - Museum be dealt with in Committee of the Whole immediately following approval of the Minutes. MOTION PUT AND PASSED.**

**4. REVIEW OF SOCIAL HERITAGE PROGRAMS AND SERVICES**

This item was addressed following Item 5 - Former Dartmouth City Hall - Museum. See Page 11.

**5. FORMER DARTMOUTH CITY HALL - MUSEUM**

- A Community Council Report dated October 27, 2009 was before Council.
- An Information Report dated October 27, 2009 was before Council.
- A video presentation provided by the Dartmouth Heritage Museum Society was before Council.

Councillor McCluskey provided an update on the Dartmouth Museum. She advised that the Dartmouth Museum needed a permanent home and noted that volunteers from Dartmouth have worked very hard with Evergreen House and Quaker House to maintain some level of display for residence throughout HRM. She noted the artifacts were being stored in a warehouse in Burnside without adequate care and was concerned that some of those artifacts could be permanently damaged and lose their value as a result. Councillor McCluskey expressed concern that when HRM amalgamated, several artifacts and antiques from the former Dartmouth City Hall building were lost.

**MOVED BY Councillor McCluskey, seconded by Councillor Karsten, that Halifax Regional Council approve that Dartmouth Heritage Museum be given exclusive right to the use of the former Dartmouth City Hall building for the purpose of a permanent museum and creation of a Cultural Cluster.**

Councillor McCluskey advised that surrounding the former Dartmouth City Hall building is the Library and Theatre on Alderney Drive and consequently this would be a great location for the cultural cluster.

Councillor Uteck suggested that HRM should hire a consultant to determine if the former Dartmouth City Hall building is the best location for the museum to care for the collection. Council does not know what they will inherit in that building. She expressed concern that HRM has neglected the care of cultural artifacts and historical buildings. She noted that an evaluation had not been done on the building to determine what the cost would be and indicated that the building has no historical significance. Councillor Uteck asked what Council was going to do with the 42,000 piece collection at Joseph Zatzman Drive, noting that this location is not an appropriate storage facility. Councillor Uteck advised that a consultant could tell Council whether a new building is required. She noted that HRM does not have a collection policy. She advised that staff does not have the expertise to move Council forward in this regard.

Councillor Karsten noted that at a public information meeting held at the Dartmouth Sportsplex residents had expressed concern to staff and Council in regard to items that Dartmouth had not yet received since amalgamation. He noted that Harbour East Community Council has discussed this matter with staff on numerous occasions over the last couple of weeks.

Councillor Johns noted the former Dartmouth City Hall building is well located from a tourism perspective.

Councillor Lund expressed the importance of having waterfront buildings for residents and tourists not office space. He noted that the setting around the building has a lot of heritage character and use as a museum would fit in nicely.

Councillor Harvey noted that there are a number of small community museums but that HRM lacked a core museum that could be supported by the community museums. He noted the importance of Council not losing sight of a municipal civic museum that would serve the entire municipality. He noted that there is a great deal of historic material throughout HRM and noted that other groups, such as the police department and fire department, are looking for space to house their artifacts. Councillor Harvey advised that HRM also has its own municipal archive located in Burnside with an amazing collection of artifacts, maps, charts, plans, photographs, minute books, etc. from all the contributing municipalities, which could be the core of the civic museum. The collection could also be incorporated in a new central library which exhibition rooms and research rooms.

Councillor Sloane noted that on page 5 of the Review of the Social Heritage Program Services Report, it indicated the different types of museums. Page 6 of the report



indicates the two different types of collections. She advised that this report should be used as a reference. Councillor Sloane advised that a structural integrity study could be done and this matter still move forward as policy has to come first. She noted that Council needed to determine a theme, such as a civic or archive museum and stressed the overall importance of accessibility for the museum.

Councillor Wile expressed concern that the former Dartmouth City Hall building may not even hold all of Halifax's artifacts and might only have enough space for Dartmouth's collection to be housed.

Councillor Smith advised that the location of the building is close enough for patrons to travel by bus, ferry or car. He noted that there were around forty volunteers ready to make the museum work.

Councillor Mosher exited at 2:06 p.m.

Councillor Rankin noted that the motion has financial implications that have not been identified. He expressed the importance of Council knowing what the costs would be. He noted that a considerable amount of money was spent in the former Dartmouth City Hall to accommodate the School Board and all five Members of the Legislative Assembly (MLA) are in support of the Feasibility Study. He advised that this was an opportunity to get a greater measure of support. Councillor Rankin posed the following questions that he felt staff would address in a feasibility study:

- What is the capital program?
- What is the fundraising already in place?
- What is the operational involvement? Is HRM going to retain the building?
- What is the lost rental that HRM would have to bear?
- Does Council have other priorities to be examined?
- What is the Capital Plan?
- Does Council have other alternative buildings?

**Moved by Councillor Rankin, seconded by Councillor Uteck, that the motion be amended by the addition of the following words "subject to a feasibility study".**

In response to Councillor Rankin's motion and questions, Mr. Paul Dunphy, Director, Community Development, noted that a full feasibility study would look at the condition of the building and its renovation for the purpose of a museum. The study would also involve a business case analysis of the operating costs in regard to running a museum from a particular service standard. He noted that the first staff report had referenced the capital costs of renovating the building not the operating costs for the future operation, therefore, it would be a building condition assessment for converting the former Dartmouth City Hall to a museum. He advised that if Council were to pass the amended motion he would need

clarification as to Council's intent.

Mary Ellen Donovan, Municipal Solicitor, indicated that as part of HRM's multi year financial strategy, one of the requirements is that there be a financial impact analysis report provided by staff for any new expenditure. She indicated that this building is a new expenditure.

Council Mosher entered at 2:19 p.m.

In response to concerns raised by Councillor McCluskey, Dan English, Chief Administrative Officer, advised that if Council were to pass the amended motion, the former Dartmouth City Hall building would be removed from the Corporate Accommodations Report and staff would come back with a new recommendation.

Councillor Karsten expressed concern that the three previous former Dartmouth City Hall reports had not been redistributed to Council for the November 10<sup>th</sup> meeting.

Dan English advised that staff had been before Council in January 2009 in regard to corporate accommodation. He indicated that Council had agreed that when the Request for Proposal (RFP) was done to use as much owned space as possible and at that time staff had included Alderney Gate and the former Dartmouth City Hall.

In response to a question from Councillor Lund, staff indicated that the feasibility study would take approximately two months.

Councillor Dalrymple expressed concern regarding the possibility of losing volunteers if the matter is delayed.

Councillor Walker noted that money will need to be spent whether Council agrees to build a new location or to renovate the former Dartmouth City Hall.

Councillor Karsten requested Councillor Rankin reconsider the words feasibility study in the amended motion and change the wording to a building condition assessment.

Dan English suggested that Council look at a financial modelling exercise. He noted that a financial analysis would be required before Council could give exclusivity to a building.

In response to Dan English's comments, Councillor Rankin agreed to convert the wording in the amended motion to financial analysis.

The amended motion now reads:

**Moved by Councillor Rankin, seconded by Councillor Uteck, that the motion be amended by the addition of the following words “subject to a financial analysis”.**

Cathy O’Toole, Director, Finance, noted that the policy require that Council receive a report on the capital and operating implications of new programs. She noted that should Council proceed with the museum, staff would need to know the operating costs to ensure accurate budgeting.

Council recessed at 2:59 p.m.

Council reconvened at 3:17 p.m.

In response to Councillor Nicoll’s request, Mr. Terry Gallagher, Manager, Facility Development advised that Councillor should be looking at the following:

- Program - What are we going to Build?
- How are we going to build it?
- How are we going to operate it?

Deputy Mayor Hendsbee entered the meeting at 3:23 p.m.

Councillor Lund entered the meeting at 3:27 p.m.

Councillor Nicoll suggested that Council support the amended motion on the condition that the storage of the artifacts are a priority.

In response to Councillor Nicoll’s request, Terry Gallagher advised that he would be reviewing the existing artifacts located in the warehouse to get a better understanding of the condition of the collection.

Councillor Fisher expressed concern in regard to volunteers not being a renewable source.

Mary Ellen Donovan reminded Council that a public hearing would be required.

Councillor Watts entered at 3:38 p.m.

Mayor Kelly called for the vote on the amended motion as follows:

**Moved by Councillor Rankin, seconded by Councillor Uteck, that the motion be amended by the addition of the following words “subject to a feasibility analysis”.  
MOTION PUT AND DEFEATED.**

Mayor Kelly called for the vote on the original motion as follows:

**MOVED BY Councillor McCluskey, seconded by Councillor Karsten, that Halifax Regional Council approve that Dartmouth Heritage Museum be given exclusive right to the use of the former Dartmouth City Hall building for the purpose of a permanent museum and creation of a Cultural Cluster. MOTION PUT AND PASSED.**

**4. REVIEW OF SOCIAL HERITAGE PROGRAMS AND SERVICES**

This item was deferred to the next Committee of the Whole.

**5. FORMER DARTMOUTH CITY HALL - MUSEUM**

This item was dealt with earlier in the meeting.

**6. REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL 09-070 - LEASED OFFICE ACCOMMODATIONS**

This item was deferred to the next Committee of the Whole.

**7. COMMITTEES OF COUNCIL REFORM (Deferred October 6, 2009)**

This item was deferred to the next Committee of the Whole.

**8. ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting adjourned at 3:48 p.m.

Cathy Mellett  
Acting Municipal Clerk